

InterDisciplines

Journal of History and Sociology

Volume 9 - Issue 1

The Body and its Multiple Dimensions

InterDisciplines

Journal of History and Sociology

Editorial Board

Jörg Bergmann (Bielefeld University)

Peter Jelavich (Johns Hopkins University Baltimore)

Ursula Mense-Petermann (Bielefeld University)

Kathleen Thelen (Massachusetts Institute of Technology)

Thomas Welskopp (Bielefeld University)

InterDisciplines

Journal of History and Sociology

Volume 9 - Issue 1

The Body and its Multiple Dimensions

Issue editors

Cleovi C. Mosuela (Bielefeld University)

Britta Dostert (Bielefeld University)

© 2018 by Bielefeld Graduate School in History and Sociology (BGHS)

All rights reserved

Managing editor: Melanie Eulitz (BGHS)

Copy editor: Sandra Lustig

Layout: Anne C. Ware

Cover picture by Katarzyna Herd

Coverdesign: deterringdesign GmbH Bielefeld/Thomas Abel

www.inter-disciplines.org

www.uni-bielefeld.de/bghs

ISSN 2191-6721

This publication was made possible by financial support from the German Research Foundation—Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG).

Contents

<i>Cleovi C. Mosuela</i> Editorial. The body and its multiple dimensions	1
<i>Michelle G. Ong</i> Embodying good citizenship and success in migration. Aging Filipina migrants talk about health.....	7
<i>Oleksandra Tarkhanova</i> Essentializing motherhood. The Ukrainian woman in policy debates	37
<i>Susan Lindholm</i> Belonging and popular culture. The work of Chilean artist Ana Tijoux.....	73
<i>Katarzyna Herd</i> From a body to a story. Transformative narratives in Swedish football.....	95
<i>Cleovi C. Mosuela</i> »Warm heart and warm hands.« The case of Filipino migrant nurses in Germany.....	123

On the issue's cover photo:

The image on the cover shows a football team from the Swedish football club Malmö FF. The player Guillermo Molins is celebrating after scoring. The picture is taken on the 14th May 2016 as part of the fieldresearch by one of the authors of the issue—Katarzyna Herd. So it is directly related with her article, analyzing the body in Swedish football.

Editorial

The body and its multiple dimensions

Cleovi C. Mosuela

This *InterDisciplines* special issue on »The Body and its Multiple Dimensions« evolved from a series of public lectures delivered by members of the Bielefeld Graduate School in History and Sociology (BGHS) and organized in collaboration with the Volkshochschule Bielefeld in early 2016. The lectures on the topic of the body encouraged us to conceive of and understand the body from different perspectives: from physical bodies, to metaphysical, to social, to political and economic bodies. Briefly, the topics centered on bodies in relation to space, such as moving or migrating bodies; culture, for instance, familial norms and societal values; the concept of performance, for example, femininity and yoga; humanity and technology; and labor, community, and economic crises. In planning this issue, we not only drew on the public lecture series, but also on a cooperation arrangement with Lund University and included two additional papers by the International PhD Conference Lund/York/Bielefeld.

The contributors to this issue employ a diverse mix of approaches to thinking about the body (as did the lectures)—migration, gender, cultural, and linguistic studies, and folklore. Each field applies its own theories and methods. However, common across the individual articles is an understanding of the body as a sociological and historical category of investigation, placing the individual body at the center of our analysis of power relations, changing societies, and contested meanings.

I make two observations from compiling the five contributions in this issue. First, racialized, gendered, and sexualized bodies become critical sites of a biopolitical project (see Foucault 1990). To quote Foucault's lecture on *The Birth of Biopolitics*, biopolitics can be understood as »the

attempt, starting from the eighteenth century, to rationalize the problems posed to governmental practice by phenomena characteristic of a set of living beings forming a population: health, hygiene, birthrate, life expectancy, race [...]« (2008, 317). Biopolitics uses the attributes of the body—such as gender, race, ethnicity, and age—for political purposes (Varga 2005). The application of biopolitical instruments, such as discourses, usually serves to manage the political anatomy of the body through well-being, reproductive behavior, cultural norms and values, human movement, and so forth. As the papers by Ong, Tarkhanova, and Mosuela in this issue demonstrate, these matters become controlling instruments by the state and yield potent ideological impulses. One prominent example is the case of the Philippine state, which disciplines certain kinds of bodies—that are mobile, docile, and flexible workers for the global economy, that embody the Filipino work ethic when overseas, and that extend care to their families and communities left behind in the Philippines (Ong; Mosuela). As the Philippine state has institutionalized the labor export policy as a development project, Filipino workers have become constituted as significant agents of economic development. Their capabilities are optimized and made useful for global capital.

The body as an object of state discourse, particularly in disciplining the body in accordance with biological determinism, also figures in the analysis of policy-making in Ukraine (Tarkhanova). This observation runs parallel to recent sociological and feminist scholarship as it epistemologically and ontologically turns toward corporeal thinking to theory and research. »Contemporary feminist theory has added new ways to think about the body, and feminists now speak of writing the body, reading the body, sexing the body, racing the body, enabling the body, policing the body, disciplining the body, erasing the body and politicizing the body« (Fonow and Cook 2005, 2216). Regulation of the body is not necessarily achieved by coercion, but by establishing ideals and norms of »normalcy« or health (Varga 2005). These disciplinary practices have made the body a site for power struggles, and, in theory, for resistance, as individual choices about the body become laden with political and cultural meanings (Weitz 2016).

Although the body is subject to social control, it is also the heart of one's individuality and identity formation. This leads to the second observation, which is how commodified bodies, for instance nurses, football players, and hip-hop artists, construct their agencies by the »setting and achieving of personal challenges [...] being in control; identification with body and pride in its/their achievements« (Wright and Dewar 1997, 91). Power, in this sense, is personal and embodied, instead of being subjugated by forces in relation to increasing global commodification of care and pop culture. These bodies, as exemplified by the last three articles, occupy more than one subject position and draw on various discourses, such as independence and their overall identity.

In this issue, **Michelle G. Ong** investigates aging Filipina migrant bodies in New Zealand. The article inquires into how taking care of one's health becomes one of the criteria for embodying responsible citizenship, particularly relevant for those whose bodies are marked as racially different. Through a discursive analysis of migrants' understanding of health and aging, Ong critically engages with pervasive neoliberal articulations of healthy aging and the concomitant processes of obfuscating the production and reproduction of social inequalities. The healthy, aged migrant body is therefore produced through disciplining a person's own body constituted by coupling the prevailing health and migration state discourses.

State discourses on healthy bodies also take center stage in **Oleksandra Tarkhanova's** contribution. Tarkhanova takes a critical stance on contemporary Ukrainian welfare and labor policy discourses, a hybrid between socialism and nationalism, in relation to women and their lack of reproductive options. In such essentialist rhetoric, female bodies are expected to bear children primarily to fulfil their »natural« purpose. In effect, on the one hand, reproductive bodies are given priority in terms of social protection in the name of shaping the nation and future economic development. On the other hand, a childless woman becomes a category presumed by the body's exposure to poverty.

Susan Lindholm takes on the gendered body within the space of hip-hop culture, which has been dominated by hypermasculinity and misogyny. By examining the music of Ana Tijoux, the article contributes to the

discussion of the body being enabled to negotiate multiple, different, and sometimes conflicting frames of belonging: national, transnational, and popular culture. Tijoux identifies with the experiences of marginalized individuals or groups, being a migrant herself (born in France to parents from Chile). Thus, the body becomes an agency through which identity and belonging are achieved.

Along this line of thought, **Katarzyna Herd** argues that the body is a means for constructing narratives. The example of football players (European context) signifies how they enlarge their corporealities upon their own agency to impel history writing and the reputation of their teams. Herd analyzes three different cases of football players actively playing for clubs in Sweden. Herd argues that whether they are able to perform or not, they have made several meaningful connections with their fans to create certain narratives embedded in cultural and historical contexts.

The final contribution similarly explores agency. **Cleovi C. Mosuela** inquires into the corporeal element of nursing care performed between the giver (Philippine-trained nurses) and receiver in hospital settings in Germany. Mosuela underscores the significance of »body work,« such as washing and cleaning the body of the patient and offering support to basic daily needs in defining care work. The proximity of the nurses to the corporeal dimension of the patient's body plays a part not only in their integration at the workplace but also in humanizing the patient.

The editor would like to express her gratitude to the contributors and the anonymous reviewers of the articles. Special thanks go to Melanie Eulitz and Andreas Hermwille, who have contributed their time and effort to make the series come together.

References

- Fonow, Mary Margaret, and Judith A. Cook. 2005. »Feminist Methodology: New Applications in the Academy and Public Policy.« *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 30 (4): 2211–36.
- Foucault, Michel. 1990. *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction*. Translated by Robert Hurley. New York: Vintage.
- . 2008. *The Birth of Biopolitics*. Edited by Michel Senellart. Translated by Graham Burchell. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Varga, Ivan. 2005. »The Body—The New Sacred? The Body in Hypermodernity.« *Current Sociology* 53 (2): 209–35.
- Weitz, Rose. 2016. »Women and Their Hair: Seeking Power through Resistance and Accommodation.« In *Sociology of the Body: A Reader*, edited by Jacqueline Low and Claudia Malacrida, 320–27. Ontario: Oxford University.
- Wright, Jan, and Alison Dewar. 1997. »On Pleasure and Pain: Women Speak Out About Physical Activity.« In *Researching Women and Sport*, edited by Gill Clarke and Barbara Humberstone, 80–95. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Dr. des. Cleovi C. Mosuela, Bielefeld Graduate School in History and Sociology and Faculty of Sociology, Bielefeld University: cleovi.mosuela@uni-bielefeld.de.

Embodying good citizenship and success in migration

Aging Filipina migrants talk about health

Michelle G. Ong

Introduction

The population's health, a major area of concern in biopolitics (Foucault 2008), figures prominently in studies of the movement of individuals from one population to another and in studies of aging populations. Many studies on aging, whether mainstream or more critical, feature health as a major issue. Health is associated with the well-being of elderly persons (Bolzman et al. 2004; Pool et al. 2009; Hodes and Suzman 2007), seen as the source of a potential economic and political crisis for states (Cruickshank 2003; Davey and Glasgow 2005; King 2006), as growing more medicalized and yet also more individualized (Pond, Stephens, and Alpass 2010; Slevin 2010; Joyce and Mamo 2006; Higgs 1997; Faircloth 2003), and as producing new subjectivities in contemporary society (Crawford 1980; Novas and Rose 2000; Rose 2003). Migrant studies also often feature health as a concern as it is a basis for acceptance as a migrant (Immigration NZ 2012), thought to impact on migrants' well-being and supposed ability to contribute to the host country (Malmusi, Borrell, and Benach 2010; Salant and Lauderdale 2003), and is taken as an indicator of adjustment to migrant life (Dean and Wilson 2009; Chen, Smith, and Mustard 2010; Tsai 2013). Within these two areas exists the intersection where the health of *aging* migrants is brought into focus, where the particular challenges and opportunities that aging migrants face in the area of health are investigated (e.g., Bolzman et al. 2004; Cichello and Thomas 2003; Dial 2007; DiPasquale-Davis and Hopkins 1997; Lomiwes 2006; Mui and Kang 2006).

This paper is about aging migrants' understandings of health, as it is crafted within more widely available discourses related to it. I regard health as having meanings that are »deeply personal and therefore infinitely varied« (Crawford 2006, 404), and yet as socially shared and produced (Estes and Binney 1989). In particular, I focus on older Filipina migrants' ideas about how a healthy body is achieved, and what it means to them as migrants to New Zealand. I will establish links between these and the literature on the medicalization of health and responsabilization in aging and argue that participants' association of healthy practices with consumption can be used to build a narrative of success in migration.

The preponderance of migrant studies in psychology which focus on the individual as the site of problems (e.g., in acculturation, stress, physical and psychological health) and of solutions (e.g., training, better/more accurate information, individual coping mechanisms) contributes to the systemic oppression of large groups of migrants (e.g., those of non-white ethnicity, those who are aging, those who are not highly educated or skilled) in their propensity for ignoring structural sources of migrants' marginalization. In focusing attention on the how these structural forces can operate at the level of the individual, my study is aligned with feminist, embodied, critical approaches to the study of aging and migration in psychology. An embodied approach has great political and theoretical potential as it makes visible the invisible and allows connections to be made between macro and micro, global and local, social structures and individual bodies.

First, a brief backgrounder on Filipino migration; second, a discussion of relevant discourses around aging and health; third, an explication of the material-discursive approach to embodiment that I take; next, methodology of the study; and lastly, evidence from the field showing links between individual subjectivity and these public discourses.

Filipino migration

The Philippines is now into its fifth decade of using labor outmigration as a national economic strategy. Presidential Decree 442, issued in 1974, marked the Philippine government's first clear involvement with Filipino

labor export (Battistella 1999; Guevarra 2009). P.D. 442 aimed to promote overseas employment and ensure »the best possible terms and conditions of employment« (*P.D. 442 Labor Code of the Philippines* 1974, art. 17.2) through the establishment of government agencies which served as official channels for the recruitment and hiring of all land-based and sea-based overseas workers. In 1978, government policy shifted from favoring government-to-government management of overseas labor to privatization of recruitment, with the government acting in a more supervisory and regulatory role (Battistella 1999). This trend toward privatization culminated in the Migrant Workers and Overseas Filipinos Act of 1995 (RA 8402), which reflects the economic liberalist thinking of the time. From this point onward, the state has claimed that it no longer promotes overseas employment but instead »*manages* labor migration by supporting the desires, choices, and freedom of Filipinos to work overseas« (Guevarra 2009, 23; emphasis in original). As of December 2012, an estimated 10.49 million Filipinos were living and working in over 200 countries across the globe (Commission on Filipinos Overseas 2012). Many of these individuals are aging in the countries where they now work and reside; and while scholarship on Filipino migration is significant within the larger arena of migration studies, little attention has been given to aging Filipino migrants.

The Philippine government's labor migration program has been critiqued by scholars as producing Filipinos as naturally inclined to work overseas. In emphasizing individual responsibility, freedom, and choice, the state and employment agencies together are able to discipline Filipinos to »fulfil the goal of producing »responsible« (that is, economically competitive, entrepreneurial, and self-accountable) and therefore, ideal workers and global commodities« (Guevarra 2009, 8). Migrants are represented as being autonomous, knowledgeable, and empowered agents who act rationally in their own best interest (Tyner 2004). These analyses echo concerns that globally, economic and overall well-being is coming to be seen as something to be secured at the individual level rather than achieved through collective action or state intervention to mitigate the effects of globalization (Inouye 2012). Such a view of well-being is situated within

a larger discourse of empowerment that constructs a neoliberal subject who is not only self-reliant, but free and autonomous from systems of oppression (Inouye 2012).

A new aging

Since the 1960s, there has been a clear shift in the discursive construction of retirement in policy, academic, and media texts in the West; representations of social isolation, structured dependency, lack of roles, and passivity came to be replaced by portrayals of later life as a time of opportunity, continued productivity, self-fulfillment, and self-reliance (Rudman 2006). It was during this period of transition that the book *Feminine Forever* was published in 1966 by American gynecologist Robert Wilson, who described menopause as a curable and preventable disease. In 1998, *Successful Aging* (Rowe and Kahn) presented what was then an alternative narrative (to the one of disease and decline) of aging. Both of these books were written for and popularly received by a lay audience, garnering wide attention in the media and among professionals, and shaping both public and academic debates and even research and publication agendas (Houck 2003; Holstein and Minkler 2003). In the US, this period also coincided with the rise of youth culture and consumerism that brought attention to the body as a site for expressing and/or enhancing self-identity (Gilleard and Higgs 2013; Giddens 1991). Fashion and cosmetics advertising eventually marketed the idea of extending the image of youth in later life, challenging established stereotypes on aging and opening up the possibility of »not having to become old on other people's terms« (Gilleard and Higgs 2013, 28). Both empirical studies on the media (Roanova 2008; Rudman 2006) and public opinion polls on older people (Andrews 2009) suggest that these discourses have grown within the public's consciousness and so have come to define a new »norm« in aging.

Rowe and Kahn's (1998) *Successful Aging* identified three components of successful aging: avoiding disease, maintaining cognitive and physical function, and sustaining engagement with life. The body, therefore, is an important locus for demonstrating this »new aging,« an active site where the battle against aging is fought. And indeed, it is a fight that involves

increasing amounts of work over time. Within this new aging, there is a strong emphasis on good health and activity, which means that staying fit (or at least appearing fit) is highly valued social capital.

The emergence of a public health discourse that emphasizes public surveillance and identification of risks, and the significance placed on food as an expression of identity and »agency« (e.g., as a »health-conscious« person) are some of the contexts in which this new aging is conceptualized and practiced (Gilleard 2002). Individuals are more vigilant for outward signs of ill health, with the signs of aging now being taken as signs of ill health (Gilleard 2002). However, the »will to health« has come to mean more than just avoiding sickness or premature death, now also »encod[ing] an optimization of one's corporeality to embrace a kind of overall »well-being«—beauty, success, happiness, sexuality and *much more*« (Rose 2001, 17; emphasis MO). This preoccupation with health and its moralization is referred to by Crawford (1980, 2006) as healthism. He argues that health has become a »super-value,« expanding the concern for health beyond the medical and into more holistic notions of wellness and success, defining good citizenship and positive personal identities (Crawford 2006). In the context of increasing political and economic instability, self-control in and self-responsibility for health can have important symbolic value among the middle class even though assiduous efforts to prevent illness and promote fitness cannot guarantee perfect health (Crawford 2006).

Although highlighting the body's malleability supports alternative ways of being in an aging body, the probability of a responsible individual occupying such alternative spaces through consumption is limited by the accumulated impact of a lifetime of oppressions (e.g., discrimination due to race, gender, immigrant status, health status). Underlying this new aging, then, is a »new ageism« (Holstein and Minkler 2003) which insists that aging depends mostly on individuals' own efforts (Cruickshank 2003) and therefore marginalizes and stigmatizes those individuals who are unable to achieve »successful aging.«

A material-discursive approach to the aging migrant's body

In the last two decades, scholars have begun to take interest in studying aging as a socially constructed experience (e.g., Hepworth 2003; Cruickshank 2003; Gilleard and Higgs 2000; Bernard, Chambers, and Granville 2000). Although such views of aging and the aging body have been fruitful for investigating how social structures produce the marginal position and difficult realities many aging individuals face today, they fail to account for the difference that material bodies make for each individual. Some bodies are more ill than others, some bodies look older than others of the same age, and bodies respond to health supplements, medical intervention, and exercise differently; these physical differences are just as significant for producing different experiences of aging as the various configurations of discourses around aging and migration. What this implies is that the aging body cannot be seen as an entirely »docile« body. While its docility may be the objective of discipline (Foucault 1977), it is apparent, given the changes it undergoes, that the aging body is a decidedly *unruly* body, constantly changing and increasingly difficult to *fix*, in the many senses of the word. For, certainly, the task given to aging individuals in contemporary society is to not age—to »fix« (read: secure or keep in position, but also repair, correct, manipulate) their bodies and keep them from changing.

This paper follows the recent trend of focusing on embodiment in aging studies (e.g., Clarke and Griffin 2007; Twigg 2004; Joyce and Mamo 2006; Marshall and Katz 2006) and migration studies (Dunn 2010). I adopt a material-discursive approach (similar to that in Ussher 1997) which recognizes the aging migrant's body as both material and socially constructed. As Shilling (1993, 12) notes, there are »certain limits« to how the body can be transformed by its entry and participation in society. That these limits exist, and that they are *physical* limits, is never more apparent than in aging. Bodily changes over time, both external and internal, all become the signs by which an aging body is known (Laws 1995). What they imply, how individuals feel, and what they do in response (which may have a material impact on the body) are meaning-making

activities that are carried out in the context of varying and multiple discourses around aging and being a migrant.

Adopting such an approach, which recognizes both the body's physicality as well as its constructedness, brings attention to the physical realities of aging as experienced by individual women, without ignoring how the economic, social, and political conditions surrounding them (e.g., as transnational citizens who have varied economic, social, and discursive resources to draw from) impact on these realities. It takes into consideration cultural representations of migrants and of older persons that form the matrix of discourses within which meaning is crafted and negotiated. By doing so, I provide an analysis that links power and discourse to material bodies and individual realities, in keeping with Foucault's (1980, 57) assertion that »nothing is more material, physical, corporeal than the exercise of power.«

Methodology

This study utilized two forms of critical psychology for its methodological framework—*Sikolohiyang Pilipino* (indigenous Filipino psychology) and feminist psychology. As critical psychologies, *Sikolohiyang Pilipino* and feminist psychology share the following principles: that research is political; that language is a bearer and producer of culture and ideologies; that context and culture are crucial to understanding individuals; and that the power gap between researchers and participants must be addressed (Fox, Prilleltensky, and Austin 2009; Denzin and Lincoln 2008; Paredes-Canilao and Babaran-Diaz 2011). Critical psychologies are interested in power—how it operates and how it is used by, for, and against individuals (Prilleltensky and Nelson 2002). Both *Sikolohiyang Pilipino* and feminist psychology have extensive critiques of how psychology has been used to oppress specific groups of people (e.g., women, the Filipino underclass).

Data gathering

The indigenous Filipino method *pakikipagkwentuban* (Orteza 1997), similar to a semi-structured interview, was employed for this study. This method is akin to other narrative methods often used in qualitative studies interested

in subjective accounts and meaning rather than verifiable »facts« (Hugh-Jones 2010). It involves conversation between individuals (ranging in number from two to seven, or even more¹) who are free to participate in telling stories when, where, and in whatever manner they feel is appropriate. This method, first named and used as a method of inquiry in the mid-1970s (de Vera 1995) during the beginnings of the move toward indigenization in psychology in the Philippines, was developed as one of several techniques that were more participatory and more sensitive to Filipino culture (Orteza 1997; Javier 2005). Since then, it has undergone critique and revision over several decades and remains one of the more widely used of several culturally-based data-gathering methods. While *pakikipagkwentuhan* is not necessarily unique² as a method, its utility lies in its familiarity and embeddedness in Filipino culture and practice. In comparison to an interview, which may have formal, evaluatory connotations, *pakikipagkwentuhan*, as it is developed from existing patterns of behavior in Filipino culture (Santiago and Enriquez 1976; Pe-Pua and Protacio-Marcelino 2000), enables a more informal, relaxed encounter.

Participants were recruited through personal and formal networks, distribution of flyers at a church attended by Filipinos, and invitation through a Filipino radio show. Criteria for inclusion were: age (50 and above), number of years living in New Zealand (at least five years), and location (all based within Auckland, the most populated city in New

1 According to naturalistic observations of *pakikipagkwentuhan* as it occurs in community settings, 15 and sometimes even more (Javier 2005).

2 In fact, Orteza (1997, 2) claims that *pakikipagkwentuhan* is a natural everyday practice »not only among Filipinos but also among different races, ages, sexes and cultures« (transl. MO). I will be presumptuous and suggest that the *korero mai* approach, an interview procedure discussed by Graham Smith in New Zealand, which allows participants in a family court study »to tell their stories in their own way« (Swadener and Mutua 2008, 41), is of a similar nature. Another example, from Chinese culture, is the *fangtan* interview method which features flexibility, more equitable power relations between interviewer and participant, »insider« status of the interviewer (meaning the development of trust and openness), and the use of the Chinese language (Li 2011).

Zealand and where the majority of Filipino migrants may be found). The effort to include as diverse a group as possible within these limits led to the inclusion of two participants who were 49 years of age at the time of the first interview. In the end, *pakikipagkwentuhan* was conducted with 20 Auckland-based Filipina migrants from 49 to 69 years of age, eliciting stories about coming to New Zealand, bodily changes over time, and thoughts about their future. These sessions were audio-recorded and transcribed. Consistent with the flexibility of *pakikipagkwentuhan*, both the content and the process accommodated the participants' additions (e.g., topics outside of those initially listed, introduction of photos and other materials into the conversation), questions (e.g., about the researcher's migration status, work, family), and constraints.

Data analysis

I used thematic analysis (Braun and Clarke 2006) together with a poststructuralist approach to language in order to investigate links between social institutions, language, and individual subjectivity. A poststructuralist approach to language means that language is not taken to provide access to an individual's internal state or disposition, nor to be a reflection of an external, objective reality; instead, language is regarded as constitutive of one's subjectivity and reality (Wetherell 1997; Weedon 1997; Gavey 1997). What this implies is that individuals (say, aging Filipina migrants) do not exist »objectively« outside of history and culture, but instead are constituted in discourse (e.g., in media, in political debates, and in popular, everyday discourse) at a specific moment and place. An interest in language means an interest not in accessing *the* truth that talk is presumed to provide, but in *a* truth crafted within a particular context for a particular purpose.

Within this view of language and power, subjectivity or our sense of self is constructed in and through language (Weedon 1997; Foucault 1972). Individuals, rather than having a fixed identity or »essential« self, occupy different subject positions made available to them by the cultural repertoire of discourses so as to manage their moral location within social interaction (Arribas-Ayllon and Walkerdine 2010). Participants' responses, therefore,

are seen as products of: 1) cultural resources or discourses that shape subjectivity (rather than an expression of ideas, memories, or dispositions »extracted« from individuals) and 2) their capacity for making sense of their experiences and for negotiating their own agency and constraints. Participants' responses were not evaluated for their accuracy or truthfulness. Their utility was in their representing *a* reality—that they were meaningful to the participants and shaped their conduct in some way. In the analysis, I was interested in participants' efforts at presenting a coherent story and subjectivity, considered cultural resources that resonate with the discourses they oriented to in their construction of their accounts, and paid attention to variations across participants' material and discursive »realities.« In what follows, participants' accounts of their health as older persons in New Zealand will be discussed as being shaped by the broader discourses on aging, health, and migrant Filipinos.

About the participants

All except three had immediate family residing in New Zealand at the time of the *pakikipagkwentuhan*. All except three live alone (two of whom had no family residing in New Zealand). Nearly all (18/20) were working, although three of these were only working part-time at the time of the interviews. All participants described themselves to be in relatively good health, although some had chronic illnesses (e.g., hypertension, diabetes) that required medication and monitoring, and a few (3/20) were cancer survivors. The sample had a higher proportion of those with higher education and higher labor force participation rate compared to Filipinos in general (according to the most recent census³), and did not include

3 Although Filipinos are among the most highly educated group of overseas-born individuals in New Zealand (Statistics New Zealand 2014, 1999), the proportion of participants with a university degree (70%) is far higher than the 42.5% of Filipinos (male and female) who reported they had a bachelor's degree or higher in the 2013 census (Statistics New Zealand 2014). Ninety percent of the participants were in the labor force—a larger proportion than the 75.6% of all Filipinas above 15 years of age who were in the labor force during the 2013 census (Statistics New Zealand 2014).

those who were very ill, those who needed assistance with daily living, those in care homes, and those who were occupied caring for an ill spouse or other family member. The sample then, was unable to capture the experiences and meanings arising from these more difficult circumstances especially relevant for discussions of health. That said, I propose that these participants' claims and arguments around health are familiar to (if not common among) Filipino migrants in Auckland as they do share some important similarities with this community—they spent a significant number of years in the Philippines, are part of the Filipino community in Auckland, and maintain ties to their families and home communities in the Philippines.

Producing the healthy, elderly New Zealand citizen

Although I did not ask participants to talk specifically about health, the topic came up repeatedly when they discussed bodily changes and plans for or worries about the future. All participants pointed to health as an important concern or preoccupation, and spoke of various health-promoting products, services, or activities they had or engaged in regularly. Common in participants' stories about health and aging is the idea that New Zealand offers opportunities for enjoying a healthy life. I will argue that aging migrant Filipinas idealize the elderly New Zealander as an exemplar for independent, healthy aging, and that they use their own health to signify success in migration by constructing healthy aging as a norm in New Zealand and pointing to state support as enabling healthy aging. I will situate this discussion within larger conversations about regulating the aging body, the links between health surveillance and good citizenship, and the neoliberal, consumerist ethic that frames them.

The elderly New Zealander as an ideal

Among the participants' stories, strong positive regard for the image of the busy, independent elderly New Zealander was a common theme. For example:⁴

4 The names of all participants have been changed to protect their identities.

Liz: I actually have two [older people] in my department, one is 72, still working, one is 67, still working. They're the ones who keep going on holiday because their life is already established. [...] But you know what, the white [people] here, even when they're in a rest home they have lots of activities still, they have bus, group, um, they go all to kinds of places.

Gab: Their culture is different [...] They're so independent. I have one colleague there who's divorced from her husband. [...] So, she lived for many years by herself. And she raised her children. And her child is over 30 years old now. [...] She has grandchildren. But, they're alone. I said, this one's so brave. (Chuckles). Alone in her home. And also, I've seen those retired, living in their own homes alone. For how many years now.

Elderly New Zealanders were portrayed in these accounts as enjoying an active, independent lifestyle in older age and were described in positive terms: »established,« »brave,« »independent.« This image of the elderly New Zealander is consistent with the ideals of »positive« or »successful« aging (Andrews 2009; Öberg 2003) embodied by »modern retirees« whose choices determine the quality of their aging (Rudman 2006) and which is reflected in New Zealand's policy on positive aging⁵ (Ministry of Social Development 2007; Davey and Glasgow 2005). The image is supported to some degree by statistical data: according to some studies, an increasing number of New Zealanders are working beyond the age of 65 (Hurnard 2005; Ministry of Social Development Office for Senior Citizens n.d.) and over 90% of New Zealanders aged 65 and older are living in private dwellings (Ministry of Social Development 2007). Independent life expectancy has improved significantly in the last decade, which the New Zealand state attributes to increased access to health care and to »people *choosing* healthier lifestyles« (Ministry of Social Development Office for Senior Citizens n.d., 34; emphasis added).

5 The New Zealand positive ageing strategy. Positive ageing indicators 2007.

However, there is also great disparity among aging individuals' well-being, based on ethnicity, gender, marital status, and socio-economic status. More likely to be disadvantaged in old age are women, the poor, ethnic minorities, the unmarried, and the widowed (Ministry of Social Development 2007; Waldegrave and Cameron 2009; see Fergusson et al. 2001). While many New Zealanders appear to be enjoying an active, healthy, relatively independent lifestyle, such a lifestyle should be understood to be a product not (only) of individual choice but of systematic inequalities that privilege some groups at the expense of others. According to other studies (Davey and Glasgow 2005; Rudman 2006), the emphasis on individual responsibility marginalizes individuals who are unable to fulfil the directive to stay healthy, active, and independent. Indeed, the reality of the diversity in the actual living conditions of older New Zealanders—the one in two who suffer from some form of disability, those who live outside the 12 big cities in New Zealand and have little or no access to public transport, and those who are not of European ancestry (particularly Māori) and who are more likely to have a disability (Ministry of Social Development 2007)—was left almost entirely unarticulated among participants' accounts.

In participants' accounts, the active, elderly New Zealander was held as an exemplar of how aging is »done« in New Zealand; participants' decisions and desires related to their own health and aging were made and evaluated in relation to it. Liz, for instance, expressed the above idea in the context of explaining that she wanted to continue working and living independently for as long as she could, linking work, activity, and healthy aging together by saying, »You'll grow weaker and die earlier if you're not active.« Despite having identified racial discrimination⁶ as an issue in the workplace in her narrative and having experienced job insecurity which she understood as bringing about her physical and mental health issues, Liz framed healthy, active (and employed) aging as a matter of choice. On the other hand, Gab spoke of elderly people she

6 Participants' experiences of and constructions of discrimination in migration are discussed in a separate paper (Ong 2016).

knew when she talked about not wanting to impose herself on her children in the future. Gab expressed some distress over this, as she also desired to live with (or close to) her children in her old age and yet worried about becoming a burden to them; she worried about not being as »brave« as elderly New Zealanders who lived alone in their homes. These suggest that the idealization of the (inaccurate) image of the active, healthy, elderly New Zealander has real consequences for migrant Filipinas; it compels them to achieve such an ideal even when their own material circumstances as individuals, as women, and as non-white migrants are different, and can lead to distress or a sense of failure when they do not.

What makes healthy, active, and independent aging possible? Participants view New Zealand as *enabling* positive outcomes for its older citizens through a supportive culture and state.

A New Zealand culture of health

A number of participants commented that the lifestyle and culture in New Zealand were conducive to pursuing health in aging. Even while participants identified many different sources of stress in their own lives (work, care work, relationship issues, loneliness, etc.) several generalized that the New Zealand lifestyle is less stressful than that in the Philippines, and that it had a positive impact on their health.

In the Philippines, Gab lived and worked in a small urban center in one of the regions outside the capital. Her husband was also employed and they had three young children cared for by domestic workers. In New Zealand, she found employment in the same profession and lived together with her husband and two unmarried, adult children at the time of the *pakikipagkwentuhan*. In the excerpt below, Gab asserts that the New Zealand lifestyle is more relaxed and is part of the reason for the *possibility* of better health, a common claim made by other participants:

Gab: That's [the hypertension's] because of the stress at work when I was in the Philippines. But, at the same time, it's probably also because of the lifestyle. I'm always sitting, working and working, and the stress of the job when I had deadlines.

Interviewer: Does it mean that, even here, your situation is similar—the level of stress, the sedentary lifestyle and such?

Gab: It's more relaxed here [in New Zealand] than there [in the Philippines]. And also, there, it's possibly also the surroundings. I can't breathe properly there. It's like [...] the change of temperature—you're always in an air-conditioned room, then when you go out, it's so hot. Maybe that's one of the things that affected me. Here, there's also a change of winter, summer (laughs) that we don't have there. But, it seems more relaxed, the lifestyle here. And if say, I choose to really, say, take advantage of what [New Zealand] has to offer, I should be healthier.

Participants described life in New Zealand as »happy,« »relaxed«—echoing findings from a study on sexual health where participants characterized New Zealanders as being a »laid back people« (Braun 2008, 1821). The relationship between stress and health, while contentious (Mulhall 1996; Pollock 1988), currently dominates both lay and scientific discourse (Donnelly and Long 2003). And while studies on stress and migrant or elderly health suggest that life as a migrant and an elderly person can be full of stresses (related to finding employment, adjustment, dealing with discrimination, loneliness, loss of status etc.), the participants' accounts are notable for their assertion that life in New Zealand is less stressful and therefore produces better health outcomes.

To suggest that the lifestyle and culture in New Zealand are conducive to good health in aging is to suggest that this is a more easily achievable norm in New Zealand, but also to homogenize it and erase the existing variation and the discrimination that produces those variations. The construction of lifestyle and culture as enabling health shapes participants' expectations for their future, their practices, and their understanding of themselves should they fail to achieve health. As a result of such a construction, Gab blamed mainly herself for failing to »choose« to »take advantage« of the health-promoting lifestyle that is characteristic of New Zealand:

So, when I feel something in my body, I know it's because I don't exercise. [...] all the resources are there. If I want to walk I can go to the park, or even by the road, I can walk. [...] you have many reasons why you don't do that, but you know they're just excuses.

This construction of health as being a normal and expected outcome of life in New Zealand promotes the idea of health as, paradoxically, an effect of individual efforts at adopting New Zealanders' lifestyles and/or minimizing stresses from other sources. Critical literature on the discourse of stress suggests that it promotes naturalism, individualism, rationalism and objectivity, and downplay the role of social context in health (Donnelly and Long 2003). Stress is naturalized in that it is seen to be part of nature, rather than society, and somatized in how it is localized in individual's *bodies* rather than in their *social relationships* (Young 1980). Individuals are tasked to »cope« with stress to produce good health outcomes; this coping is constructed to be achievable through rational, objective decision-making about one's lifestyle and the knowledge or advice health professionals provide individuals (Donnelly and Long 2003). The accounts given above appear to contradict these analyses. Whereas they do locate stress within a larger socio-cultural context, in asserting that social conditions and cultural norms in New Zealand *already* encourage healthy aging, individuals (such as Gab) who are somehow unable to produce or display a healthy body in aging risk bearing the blame for being unable or unwilling to make the most of a health-enabling environment.

Enjoying the fruits of migration: State-supported healthy aging in New Zealand

Other than an enabling culture and environment, most participants identified the New Zealand government as supporting services that allow its citizens to enjoy healthy aging:

Vangie: The government looks after everyone here, yes. If you can't go to the market, someone will go to the market for you here. For example, if you're really, really old and you can't do it anymore. If you're sick the district nurses here will visit you. Yes.

Like say, if I want to go to the doctor, it's right over there, really close. And I don't need to pay the bus fare or anything. And if I want to go to the [a particular] clinic someone will pick you up, someone will take you there. [...] So what else could you want in your life? In the Philippines no one will do that for you, right? Even if you say you have maids there, but it's still not like here where they look after you.

Ela: Well, here, everything is free. So, why not [do the pap smear annually]? You're just going to lie down, just open your legs. (laughs) There's nothing to pay for. Unlike in the Philippines. I mean, you know, are you going to wait until something's wrong with you?

Remarks such as these contrasted an inadequate publicly funded health service in the Philippines with what is sometimes portrayed (as in Vangie's account) as a *more than adequate* health care service in New Zealand. In making these exaggerated claims (in claiming »everything« is provided, is free, and in asking rhetorically, »What else could you want in your life?«), these women effectively positioned all possible barriers to good health as removed and that, therefore, only the irresponsible willfully flout medical advice and refuse these services. In these accounts, alongside claims that the New Zealand state »looks after everyone,« is a strong responsabilization for health; individuals are admonished *not to waste time* (Ela: »[...] are you going to wait until something's wrong with you?«) and to understand that they have no excuses not to prioritize health and prevention.

Good health is not enjoyed by *all* New Zealanders, nor by *all* the participants. Vangie suffered from diabetes and its complications, while Ela had had cancer which required surgery and treatment and was in remission at the time of the *pakikipagkwentuhan*. Several other participants had similar conditions. And yet, despite the varied health issues they suffered from as they grew older in New Zealand, all participants claimed that health in aging was more likely to be achieved in New Zealand than in the Philippines because of the perceived greater accessibility and affordability of health care in New Zealand. An oft-repeated concern among the

participants was, *if* they chose to go back home to the Philippines, and they fell ill, »when your money runs out, what will happen to you?« (Liz).

I do not suggest that the reality of the health service disparities between New Zealand and the Philippines do not exist, nor that the claimed better health outcomes for those who are able to access these services in New Zealand are *only discursive*. The treatment Vangie and Ela received from New Zealand's health care services are certainly valuable and make real and perceived differences in their bodies and everyday lives. My contention is that there is, among these accounts, a strong version of what has been called a »no legitimate dependency« discourse: an aspect of neoliberal discourse that refers to how individuals deem everything that happens in their lives to be their responsibility and where asking for help, or even acknowledging the need for it, is seen as a sign of weakness and therefore unacceptable (Peacock, Bissell, and Owen 2014). In these participants' accounts, individuals have no excuses for (continuing to suffer from) poor health and are entirely responsible for not »taking advantage« of the New Zealand state's health services. Ros, who worked in the health care sector, admonished that, »it is your responsibility to go and check [your] medical health. You have to. It is your responsibility to go see your general practitioner [...] at least yearly. Because everything here's provided.« It was typical for participants to label themselves (and others) lazy and undisciplined for failing to follow their prescriptions, comply with doctor's orders, and commit to healthy habits.

Even when participants point out the inadequacy of the state's health services, the emphasis is on being provided limited choices and being *able to choose better* through insurance:

Interviewer: The health insurance, if I understand it correctly, it's like there's, the health services here [in New Zealand] are free. So what is the purpose of getting that?

Fey: Basically, health insurance is so that you don't need to wait. See, the public health system is free, okay, whatever your illness is it's good. But if it's not life-threatening you will go into a list. [provides specific examples] You don't need to use your health

insurance unless for example you go to the hospital. You were hospitalized because, say, you have an ulcer that you need to get operated. And you want a higher quality, you don't want [public hospital], you want [private hospital]. Then you say to your doctor, ah, »Could you move me to [private hospital], please?« That's when your health insurance comes in. You have choices when you have health insurance.

In Fey's account, the individual (»you«) is positioned as suffering from illness and from less-than-ideal public health services, as wanting or needing particular services, as actively seeking these through doctors, and as having choices with private insurance. This supports the earlier argument that prevailing understandings of health care provision draw more on a discourse of individual responsibility and consumption rather than on a rights and welfare discourse as might seem at first glance, e.g., previous accounts where Vangie described the New Zealand government as »looking after« its older citizens. Participants' understandings of health surveillance as a (New Zealand) state-provided benefit they should take advantage of, and the meanings around privately purchased insurance as expanding the conscientious health consumer's options, are made in the context of neoliberally guided health policies and practices that maintain reduced state support for social services and construct the aging body as a site of vulnerability, risk, and self-vigilance.

Critics have commented that new forms of medicine that emphasize surveillance (under the guise of prevention) reconfigure new relationships between the state and its citizens (Higgs 1997; Armstrong 1995). In particular, the ability of states to scrutinize individuals and compare them against an idealized norm allows the state to assign individuals to particular (»target,« »vulnerable,« or »at-risk«) groups, without necessarily taking responsibility for their care (Higgs 1997). What this accomplishes, according to Higgs, is the separation of those individuals who are responsible, self-supporting, and self-reliant from those who are not. A »consumer citizenship« (Higgs 1997) is encouraged—one where individuals are asked to make rational, informed choices about their health. In New Zealand, this is evident in participants' acknowledgement of the state's support

for annual health checks and public health services alongside the long waits and expensive appointments with specialists. It has led a good number of participants⁷ to »exercise their right to choose« and obtain health insurance.

Conclusion: Health in aging as an embodiment of migrant success

Taken together, the claims participants made about the achievability of healthy aging in New Zealand accomplish two things for aging Filipina migrants. First, they propose that healthy aging is a norm in New Zealand, easily achievable by its (responsible) citizens. Second, they construct migration as a successful strategy for improving one's life and aging. For aging Filipino migrants, the meanings of health extend beyond having a functional body for everyday life, beyond an obligation to the public, and into evidence of success at migration, or what Foucault calls the »enterprise of oneself« (2008, 320).

The extension of such meanings is made possible by the strong resonance between discourses of individual responsibility and self-sufficiency in health and aging and discourses surrounding Filipino migration. Migration scholars point out how such discourses obscure the impact of global inequalities, gender inequalities, and the reduction of social support and protection mechanisms provided by the state, leaving individuals to become entrepreneurial, self-sufficient, and responsible (McLaren and Dyck 2004; Guevarra 2009; Rodriguez 2002; Inouye 2012). Just as white, middle-class Americans see individual responsibility for health as having strongly positive meanings (Crawford 2006), Filipino migrants who are sold a particular version of empowerment (Guevarra 2009) may find the rhetoric of personal responsibility in health both appealing and logical for echoing the politically constructed imperative to do what one can for oneself, family, and country.

As some critics of neoliberally guided discourses around health argue, the construction of health as an individual responsibility and of biomedicine as producing a »cornucopia of choices« (Briggs and Hallin 2007, 53) for

7 Seven participants volunteered that they purchased health insurance.

the »patient-consumer« excludes »(t)hose who are not middle class, [...] or who do not experience neoliberal society as a »rich range of choice« (Briggs and Hallin 2007, 54). Such a construction renders invisible more than ten percent of older persons 65 to 84 years of age in New Zealand who cannot say they are in good or excellent health (Pool et al. 2009),⁸ and the 6.3% (or over 1 in 20) of older persons who needed to see a general practitioner but did not, mainly because they could not afford it (Ministry of Social Development 2007).⁹ The construction of health as an individual responsibility renders invisible the challenges that aging migrant Filipina face—greater stresses in the workplace, the double burden of care work and employment, and smaller or no savings for retirement (because of the shorter length of employment in the host country or because of the need to send remittances). Participants' constructions of health and aging, while encouraging individual empowerment, choice, and autonomy, simultaneously deny the many other factors beyond individual control that contribute to health, and regard information about health inequalities¹⁰ as evidence of particular groups of people (e.g., Māori, poor people) not taking enough responsibility for their health (Peacock, Bissell, and Owen 2014) rather than of social conditions producing the inequalities that become *embodied*.

8 Data based on the Enhancing Wellbeing in an Ageing Society (EWAS) survey in 2007. Note that this survey excluded those 85 and above, and those who were institutionalized, which could mean that the actual proportion of those who perceive themselves to be in poor health may be higher.

9 Data based on the New Zealand Health Survey 2003.

10 For example, the death rates for Māori, which are (at least) twice as high compared to non-Māori at the ages between 65 and 74 and the negative correlation between economic deprivation and life expectancy (Ministry of Social Development 2007).

References

- Andrews, Molly. 2009. »The Narrative Complexity of Successful Ageing.« *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy* 29 (1/2): 73–83. <https://doi.org/10.1108/01443330910934736>.
- Armstrong, David. 1995. »The Rise of Surveillance Medicine.« *Sociology of Health & Illness* 17 (3): 393–404.
- Arribas-Ayllon, Michael, and Valerie Walkerdine. 2010. »Foucauldian Discourse Analysis.« In *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research in Psychology*, edited by Carla Willig and Wendy Stainton-Rogers, 91–109. London: SAGE.
- Battistella, Graziano. 1999. »Philippine Migration Policy: Dilemmas of a Crisis.« *Sojourn* 14 (1): 229–48. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12295147>.
- Bernard, Miriam, Pat Chambers, and Gillian Granville. 2000. »Women Ageing: Changing Identities, Challenging Myths.« In *Women Ageing: Changing Identities, Challenging Myths*, edited by Miriam Bernard, Judith Phillips, Linda Machin, and Val Harding Davies, 1–22. New York: Routledge.
- Bolzman, Claudio, Raffaella Poncioni-Derigo, Marie Vial, and Rosita Fibbi. 2004. »Older Labour Migrants' Well-Being in Europe: The Case of Switzerland.« *Ageing and Society* 24 (3): 411–29. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X03001557>.
- Braun, Virginia. 2008. »She'll Be Right?« National Identity Explanations for Poor Sexual Health Statistics in Aotearoa/New Zealand.« *Social Science & Medicine* 67 (11): 1817–25. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2008.09.022>.
- Braun, Virginia, and Victoria Clarke. 2006. »Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology.« *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 3 (2): 77–101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>.
- Briggs, Charles L., and Daniel C. Hallin. 2007. »Biocommunicability: The Neoliberal Subject and Its Contradictions in News Coverage of Health Issues.« *Social Text* 25 (4): 43–66. <https://doi.org/10.1215/01642472-2007-011>.
- Chen, Cynthia, Peter Smith, and Cameron Mustard. 2010. »The Prevalence of Over-qualification and Its Association with Health Status among Occupationally Active New Immigrants to Canada.« *Ethnicity & Health* 15 (6): 601–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13557858.2010.502591>.

- Cichello, Mila A., and Trang Thomas. 2003. »Aged Filipinos in Australia: A Case of Double Jeopardy.« *Australian Journal of Psychology* 55 (S1): 171–72.
- Clarke, Laura, and Meridith Griffin. 2007. »Becoming and Being Gendered through the Body: Older Women, Their Mothers and Body Image.« *Ageing and Society* 27 (5): 701–18. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X0700623X>.
- Commission on Filipinos Overseas. 2012. »Stock Estimate of Overseas Filipinos as of December 2012.« CFO. http://www.cfo.gov.ph/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=1340%3Astock-estimate-of-overseas-filipinos&catid=134&Itemid=68.
- Crawford, Robert. 1980. »Healthism and the Medicalization of Everyday Life.« *International Journal of Health Services* 10 (3): 365–88.
- . 2006. »Health as a Meaningful Social Practice.« *Health: An Interdisciplinary Journal for the Social Study of Health, Illness and Medicine* 10 (4): 401–20. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1363459306067310>.
- Cruickshank, Margaret. 2003. *Learning to Be Old: Gender, Culture and Aging*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Davey, Judith A., and Kathy Glasgow. 2005. »Positive Ageing—A Critical Analysis.« *Policy Quarterly* 2 (4): 21–28.
- Dean, Jennifer Asanin, and Kathi Wilson. 2009. »Education? It Is Irrelevant to My Job Now. It Makes Me Very Depressed...« Exploring the Health Impacts of Under/unemployment among Highly Skilled Recent Immigrants in Canada.« *Ethnicity & Health* 14 (2): 185–204. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13557850802227049>.
- Denzin, Norman K., and Yvonna S. Lincoln. 2008. »Introduction: Critical Methodologies and Indigenous Inquiry.« In *Handbook of Critical and Indigenous Methodologies*, edited by Norman K. Denzin, Yvonna S. Lincoln, and Linda Tuhiwai Smith, 1–20. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Dial, Myrna Novilunio. 2007. »Factors Affecting the Health of Aging Filipino Americans.« PhD diss., Loma Linda University, CA.
- DiPasquale-Davis, Joan, and Shiela J. Hopkins. 1997. »Health Behaviors of an Elderly Filipino Group.« *Public Health Nursing* 14 (2): 118–22. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/9109322>.

- Donnelly, Tam T., and Bonita C. Long. 2003. »Stress Discourse and Western Biomedical Ideology: Rewriting Stress.« *Issues in Mental Health Nursing* 24:397–408. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01612840390212614>.
- Dunn, Kevin. 2010. »Embodied Transnationalism.« *Population, Space and Place* 16 (1): 1–9.
- Estes, Carroll L., and Elizabeth A Binney. 1989. »The Biomedicalization of Aging: Dangers and Dilemmas.« *The Gerontologist* 29 (5): 587–96.
- Faircloth, Christopher A. 2003. »Different Bodies and the Paradox of Aging: Locating Aging Bodies in Images and Everyday Experience.« In *Aging Bodies: Images and Everyday Experience*, edited by Christopher A. Faircloth, 1–28. Walnut Creek: AltaMira.
- Fergusson, David, Bev Hong, John Horwood, John Jensen, and Peter Travers. 2001. »The Social, Health, Economic and Material Circumstances of Older People.« In *Living Standards of Older New Zealanders: A Technical Account*, 39–64. Ministry of Social Policy. <http://www.ms.govt.nz/documents/about-msd-and-our-work/publications-resources/monitoring/livingch4.pdf>.
- Foucault, Michel. 1972. *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. Edited by Alan Sheridan. New York: Pantheon.
- 1977. *Discipline and Punish*. New York: Vintage.
- 1980. »Body/Power.« In *Power/knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972–1977*, edited by C. Gordon, 55–62. Brighton: Harvester.
- 2008. *The Birth of Biopolitics*. Edited by Michel Senellart. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Fox, Dennis, Isaac Prilleltensky, and Stephanie Austin, eds. 2009. *Critical Psychology: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. London: SAGE.
- Gavey, Nicola. 1997. »Feminist Poststructuralism and Discourse Analysis.« In *Toward a New Psychology of Gender: A Reader*, edited by Mary M. Gergen and Sara N. Davis, 49–64. New York: Routledge.
- Giddens, Anthony. 1991. *Modernity and Self-Identity*. Oxford, UK: Polity.
- Gilleard, Chris. 2002. »Women Ageing and Body Talk.« In *Cultural Gerontology*, edited by Lars Andersson, 139–60. Westport: Auburn.

- Gilleard, Chris, and Paul Higgs. 2000. *Cultures of Ageing: Self, Citizen and the Body*. London: Prentice-Hall.
- . 2013. *Key Issues in Modern Sociology: Ageing, Corporeality and Embodiment*. London: Anthem.
- Guevarra, Anna Romina. 2009. *Marketing Dreams, Manufacturing Heroes*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University.
- Hepworth, Mike. 2003. »Ageing Bodies: Aged by Culture.« In *Discourse, the Body, and Identity*, edited by Justine Coupland and Richard Gwyn, 89–106. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Higgs, Paul. 1997. »Citizenship Theory and Old Age: From Social Rights to Surveillance.« In *Critical Approaches to Ageing and Later Life*, edited by Anne Jamieson, Sarah Harper, and Christina Victor, 118–31. Buckingham: Open University.
- Hodes, Richard J., and Richard Suzman. 2007. *Growing Older in America: The Health and Retirement Study*. National Institute on Aging. http://www.nia.nih.gov/sites/default/files/health_and_retirement_study_0.pdf.
- Holstein, Martha B., and Meredith Minkler. 2003. »Self, Society and the »New Gerontology.« *The Gerontologist* 43 (6): 787–96.
- Houck, Judith A. 2003. »What Do These Women want?« Feminist Responses to Feminine Forever, 1963–1980.« *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 77 (1): 103–32. <https://doi.org/10.1353/bhm.2003.0023>.
- Hugh-Jones, Siobhan. 2010. »The Interview in Qualitative Research.« In *Doing Qualitative Research in Psychology: A Practical Guide*, edited by Michael Forrester, 77–97. London: SAGE.
- Hurnard, Roger. 2005. »The Effect of New Zealand Superannuation Eligibility Age on the Labour Force Participation of Older People.« New Zealand Treasury Working Paper 5/9, 2005.
- Immigration NZ. 2012. »Health Requirements for Entry to New Zealand.« Wellington: Immigration New Zealand.
- Inouye, Kimiko. 2012. »Conditional Love: Representations of Migrant Work in Canadian Newsprint Media.« *Social Identities: Journal for the Study of Race, Nation and Culture* 18 (5): 573–92. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13504630.2012.692895>.

- Javier, Roberto E. 2005. »Pangpamamaraang Kaangkinan Ng Pakikipagkwentuhan.« *Binhi* 2 (2). Quezon City: Pambansang Samahan sa Sikolohiyang Pilipino.
- Joyce, Kelly, and Laura Mamo. 2006. »Graying the Cyborg.« In *Age Matters: Realigning Feminist Thinking*, edited by Toni Calasanti and Kathleen F. Slevin, 99–121. New York: Routledge.
- King, Neal. 2006. »The Lengthening List of Oppressions: Age Relations and the Feminist Study of Inequality.« In *Age Matters: Realigning Feminist Thinking*, edited by Toni Calasanti and Kathleen F. Slevin, 47–74. New York: Routledge.
- Laws, Glenda. 1995. »Understanding Ageism: Lessons from Feminism and Postmodernism.« *The Gerontologist* 35 (1): 112–18. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/7890196>.
- Li, Wendy Wen. 2011. »Shifting Selves: Home beyond the House—A Study of Ageing, Housing and Wellbeing of Older Chinese Migrants to New Zealand.« PhD diss., University of Waikato.
- Lomiwes, Heidi. 2006. »Mental Health of the Filipino Older People.« PhD diss., University of Auckland.
- Malmusi, Davide, Carme Borrell, and Joan Benach. 2010. »Migration-Related Health Inequalities: Showing the Complex Interactions between Gender, Social Class and Place of Origin.« *Social Science & Medicine* 71 (9): 1610–19. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2010.07.043>.
- Marshall, Barbara L., and Stephen Katz. 2006. »From Androgyny to Androgens: Resexing the Aging Body.« In *Age Matters: Realigning Feminist Thinking*, edited by Toni Calasanti and Kathleen F. Slevin, 75–97. New York: Routledge.
- McLaren, Arlene, and Isabel Dyck. 2004. »Mothering, Human Capital, and the Ideal Immigrant.« *Women's Studies International Forum* 27 (1): 41–53. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2003.12.009>.
- Ministry of Social Development. 2007. »Positive Ageing Indicators, 2007.« Wellington: Ministry of Social Development.
- Ministry of Social Development Office for Senior Citizens. n.d. »Longer and Healthier Lives.« www.msd.govt.nz/what-we-can-do/seniorcitizens/positive-ageing/trends/longer-healthier-lives.html.

- Mui, Ada C., and Suk-Young Kang. 2006. »Acculturation Stress and Depression among Asian Immigrant Elders.« *Social Work* 51 (3): 243–55. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/17076122>.
- Mulhall, Anne. 1996. »Cultural Discourse and the Myth of Stress in Nursing and Medicine.« *International Journal of Nursing Studies* 33 (5): 455–68. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/8886896>.
- Novas, Carlos, and Nikolas Rose. 2000. »Genetic Risk and the Birth of the Somatic Individual.« *Economy and Society* 29 (4): 485–513. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03085140050174750>.
- Öberg, Peter. 2003. »Images versus Experience of the Aging Body.« In *Aging Bodies: Images and Everyday Experience*, edited by Christopher A. Faircloth, 103–39. Walnut Creek: AltaMira.
- Ong, Michelle G. 2016. »Ang Kapakinabangan Ng Poststrukturalismo Sa Sikolohiyang Pilipino: Hamon at Halimbawa Mula Sa Pag-Aaral Ng Mga Migranteng Pilipina Sa Aotearoa [The utility of poststructuralism in Sikolohiyang Pilipino: A challenge and example from a study on migrant Filipinos in Aotearoa].« *Diva* 4:1–19.
- Orteza, Grace O. 1997. *Pakikipagkuwentuhan: Isang Pamamaraan Ng Sama-Samang Pananaliksik, Pagpapatotoo at Pagtulong Sa Sikolohiyang Pilipino* [Pakikipagkuwentuhan: A method for participatory research, establishing validity, and contributing to Filipino psychology]. Quezon City: Philippine Psychology Research and Training House.
- P. D. 442 Labor Code of the Philippines*. 1974. Manila.
- Paredes-Canilao, Narcisa, and Maria Ana Babaran-Diaz. 2011. »Sikolohiyang Pilipino: 50 Years of Critical-Emancipatory Social Science in the Philippines.« *Annual Review of Critical Psychology* 10:765–83.
- Pe-Pua, Rogelia, and Elizabeth Protacio-Marcelino. 2000. »Sikolohiyang Pilipino (Filipino Psychology): A Legacy of Virgilio G. Enriquez.« *Asian Journal of Social Psychology* 3 (1): 49–71. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-839X.00054>.
- Peacock, Marian, Paul Bissell, and Jenny Owen. 2014. »Dependency Denied: Health Inequalities in the Neo-Liberal Era.« *Social Science & Medicine* 118 (August): 173–80. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2014.08.006>.

- Pollock, Kristian. 1988. »On the Nature of Social Stress: Production of a Modern Mythology.« *Social Science & Medicine* 26 (3): 381–92.
- Pond, Rachael, Christine Stephens, and Fiona Alpass. 2010. »Virtuously Watching One’s Health: Older Adults’ Regulation of Self in the Pursuit of Health.« *Journal of Health Psychology* 15 (5): 734–43. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1359105310368068>.
- Pool, Ian, Ben Amey, Michael P. Cameron, and Suzan van der Pas. 2009. »Health and Wellbeing among Older New Zealanders.« In *Enhancing Wellbeing in an Ageing Society: 65-84 Year Old New Zealanders in 2007*, edited by Peggy Koopman-Boyden and Charles Waldegrave, 37–50. Hamilton: University of Waikato Population Studies Centre and the Family Centre Social Policy Research Unit.
- Prilleltensky, Isaac, and Geoffrey Nelson. 2002. *Doing Psychology Critically: Making a Difference in Diverse Settings*. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Rodriguez, Robyn Magalit. 2002. »Migrant Heroes: Nationalism, Citizenship and the Politics of Filipino Migrant Labor.« *Citizenship Studies* 6 (3): 341–57. <https://doi.org/10.1080/136210202200001165>.
- Rose, Nikolas. 2001. »The Politics of Life Itself.« *Theory, Culture & Society* 18 (6): 1–30. <https://doi.org/10.1177/02632760122052020>.
- . 2003. »Neurochemical Selves.« *Society* 41 (1): 46–59. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02688204>.
- Rowe, J. W., and R. L. Kahn. 1998. *Successful Aging*. New York: Pantheon.
- Rozanova, Julia. 2008. »Deconstructing Media Discourse of Successful Aging from the Perspective of Critical Gerontology.« Paper presented at the American Sociological Association Annual Meeting, Boston. http://citation.allacademic.com/meta/p239507_index.html.
- Rudman, Debbie L. 2006. »Shaping the Active, Autonomous and Responsible Modern Retiree: An Analysis of Discursive Technologies and Their Links with Neo-liberal Political Rationality.« *Ageing and Society* 26 (2): 181–201. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X05004253>.
- Salant, Talya, and Diane S. Lauderdale. 2003. »Measuring Culture: A Critical Review of Acculturation and Health in Asian Immigrant Populations.«

- Social Science & Medicine* 57 (1): 71–90. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12753817>.
- Santiago, Carmen E., and Virgilio G. Enriquez. 1976. »Tungo Sa Makapilipinong Pananaliksik.« *Sikolohiyang Pilipino: Mga Ulat at Balita* 4:4–10.
- Shilling, Chris. 1993. *The Body and Social Theory*. London: SAGE.
- Slevin, Kathleen F. 2010. »If I Had Lots of Money... I'd Have a Body Makeover: Managing the Aging Body.« *Social Forces* 88 (3): 1003–20.
- Statistics New Zealand. 1999. *New Zealand Now: People Born Overseas*. Wellington.
- . 2014. »2013 Census Ethnic Group Profiles: Filipino Education.« http://www.stats.govt.nz/Census/2013-census/profile-and-summary-reports/ethnic-profiles.aspx?request_value=24729&tabname=Education.
- Swadener, Beth Blue, and Kagendo Mutua. 2008. »Decolonizing Performances: Deconstructing the Global Postcolonial.« In *Handbook of Critical and Indigenous Methodologies*, edited by Norman K. Denzin, Yvonna S. Lincoln, and Linda Tuhiwai Smith, 31–45. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Tsai, Jenny Hsin-Chun. 2013. »Impact of Social Discrimination, Job Concerns, and Social Support on Filipino Immigrant Worker Mental Health and Substance Use.« *American Journal of Internal Medicine* 56 (9): 1082–94. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ajim.22223>.
- Twigg, Julia. 2004. »The Body, Gender, and Age: Feminist Insights in Social Gerontology.« *Journal of Aging Studies* 18 (1): 59–73. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaging.2003.09.001>.
- Tyner, James A. 2004. *Made in the Philippines: Gendered Discourses and the Making of Migrants*. London: RoutledgeCurzon.
- Ussher, Jane M. 1997. *Body Talk: The Material and Discursive Regulation of Sexuality, Madness and Reproduction*. London: Routledge.
- de Vera, Ma. Gracia A. 1995. »Pakikipagkwentuhan: Paano Kaya Pag-Aaralan Ang Pakikiapid?« In *Sikolohiyang Pilipino: Teorya, Metodo at Gamit*, edited by Rogelia Pe-Pua, 3rd ed., 187–93. Quezon City, Philippines: University of the Philippines.
- Waldegrave, Charles, and Michael P. Cameron. 2009. »Income, Assests, Living Standards and Housing.« In *Enhancing Wellbeing in an Ageing Society: 65–84*

Year Old New Zealanders in 2007, edited by Peggy Koopman-Boyden and Charles Waldegrave, 83–108. Hamilton: University of Waikato Population Studies Centre and the Family Centre Social Policy Research Unit.

Weedon, Chris. 1997. *Feminist Practice and Poststructuralist Theory*. 2nd ed. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

Wetherell, Margaret. 1997. »Linguistic Repertoires and Literary Criticism: New Directions for a Social Psychology of Gender.« In *Toward a New Psychology of Gender: A Reader*, edited by Mary Gergen and Sara N. Davis, 149–67. New York: Routledge.

Young, Allan. 1980. »The Discourse on Stress and the Production of Conventional Knowledge.« *Social Science & Medicine. Part B Medical Anthropology* 14 (3): 133–46.

Michelle G. Ong, Departement of Psychology, College of Social Sciences and Philosophy, University of the Philippines Diliman: mgong@up.edu.ph.

Essentializing motherhood

The Ukrainian woman in policy debates

Oleksandra Tarkhanova

Gender norms and the Ukrainian state

Any discussion of gender relations and gender discourses in a post-Soviet country starts by relating it to the lasting traces of the state socialist gender regime, subsequent advances of nationalist neo-traditionalism, and, perhaps, growing neoliberal influences and their ambiguous gender impact (Buckley 1997; Ashwin 2000; Gal and Kligman 2000a; Zhurzhenko 2001; Zherebkina 2002). More recent discussions of the gender and gendered transformations in the region, including larger Eastern and Central Europe, address anti-gender movements and politics (Grzebalska and Petó 2018; Korolczuk and Graff 2018; Verloo 2018), consequences of state nationalism for families and women (Zhurzhenko 2008, 2012; Gapova 2016), and women's political mobilizations (Rubchak 2015; Khromeychuk 2016; Mayerchyk 2015; Król and Pustułka 2018). The questions that this article engages with are how relations between the state and citizens are (re)negotiated through (re)construction of gender expectations and categories in the context of post-Soviet Ukraine in the process of »nation-building,« the free market, and neoliberal transformations.

In this paper I analyze the Ukrainian labor and welfare policies and policy discourses in an attempt to disentangle the changing and persistent ways in which concepts of gender and welfare are constituted. In the context of post-socialist transformations, gendered discourses, particularly discourses on reproduction, are commonly used to reconstitute the political authority of the newly formed (welfare) states and newly accentuated nations (Gal and Kligman 2000b). Using the Ukrainian case as an example,

I seek to examine sticky essentialist images of women articulated and perpetuated by state actions in the changing conditions of »transition.«

The Ukrainian state gender regime is characterized by a combination of emancipatory and traditionalist messages (Rubchak 2015; Zhurzhenko 2012). For example, a number of laws on the promotion of gender equality and women's rights and on the prevention of discrimination and domestic violence have been adopted.¹ Besides that, the women of Ukraine comprise a large share of the country's labor force (47.9%), while they also have a higher education rate (State Statistics Service of Ukraine 2016, 75, 232). There is an underrepresentation of women in the parliament and central government, but at the level of local municipalities women are overrepresented (Martsenyuk 2015, 18–22). At the same time, the state discourse is dominated by concerns with a »demographic crisis« (Zhurzhenko 2012), and women are mostly portrayed as mothers. The discursive regime of »compulsory motherhood,«² that I argue for in this paper results in a prioritization of women's reproductive and caring roles; meanwhile, other social contributions, such as paid work and political engagement, are undervalued or even actively discouraged. According to attitude studies, family orientation and care work are prioritized by women as well, who themselves reflect on their failure to live up to the social expectations of hegemonic devoted motherhood in the conditions when their economic participation is essential for the survival of their families (Strelnyk 2017a, 156–61).

Ideological and institutional legacies of the extensive Soviet welfare state conflict with neoliberal pressures from within and from outside the country. In addition, traditionalist gender and family norms inherent to the nationalist rhetoric might conflict with images of economically and politically active women. In this paper I illustrate how motherhood is constructed as a central necessary aspect of women's position as a subject

1 Law No. 2866-IV, Sep. 8, 2005; Cabinet of Ministers, Directive No. 1834, Dec. 27, 2006; Law No. 2789-III, Nov. 15, 2001.

2 This term was coined by Shchurko (2012) in relation to gender politics in Belarus.

in Ukraine and how it is negotiated and fitted into these political circumstances. Concerning the intersection of labor and welfare policies, women's working commitments are subjected to a necessary assessment against their primary responsibility of mothering. Motherhood is conceptualized as a social contribution that can be materially remunerated and encouraged in a variety of ways as well as normatively valued or policed (Brush 2002; Lewis 1997). In the conditions of the dominant nationalist ideology and the so-called »demographic crisis,« motherhood becomes (or rather continues to be) an obligation to the state and the nation (Yuval-Davis 1997; Chernova 2013). Therefore, the questions that I strive to explore are how the state's expectations of motherhood are constructed in multiple policy areas, and how this construction is preserved and modified through policy reforms in the conditions of individualization, neoliberalism, and conservatism. The contestation is that the essentialization of mothering, as a biological function of woman's body, enables its truly »compulsory« nature in texts and discourses of pronatalist policies.

The paper is structured in the following way. After I briefly outline the methodological approach and the data, I position the Ukrainian state gender regime in relation to Soviet gender politics and to political processes taking place in the post-socialist region in order to highlight the specificity of Ukrainian gender transformations. I continue by outlining changes in legal regulations of mothering from 1990 to 2015, which foreground the construction of the regime of »compulsory motherhood,« which I analyze by looking at policy discourses. The analysis suggests that childlessness is understood as a defect of a woman's body, which is vulnerable to certain social circumstances, as emphasized in policy discussions.

Theoretical conceptualization and methodological approach

The state, as a set of loosely coupled institutions, practices, and discourses, is the key actor institutionalizing gender relations, norms, and ideals (Connell 1990; Haney 2000). Under the conditions of state socialism, the boundary between private and public was somewhat blurry and intentionally drawn to include most of family life in the sphere of interest and

of direct control by state institutions. In the post-Soviet period, this boundary, as an expression of the understanding of the relations between the state and women (families), has been at the core of the political discussions I analyze in this paper. On the one hand, ideas about gender relations are articulated and institutionalized in these texts and these discussions. On the other hand, approached from the post-structuralist perspective, these laws, policies, and norms voiced by state actors are constructed in relation to the societal gender order. As Gal and Kligman (2000b, 4) argue, »[...] ideas about the differences between men and women shape the ways in which states are imagined, constituted and legitimated.«

Post-socialist transformation in the region has been characterized by diverse, but consistently gendered, processes and discourses. In the conditions of unprecedented upheaval, gendered images and norms often grounded in the imagined past and the newly reconstituted ideas of the »common good« based on it become central to the projects of the state- and nation-building. In such conditions women can be legitimately constructed »as certain kinds of citizens whose roles and responsibilities may be defined through politically useful categories (such as biology/nature, social norms, or liberal ideologies of the rational subject)« (Rivkin-Fish 2006, 153). For a country like Ukraine, in the midst of the »national project,« political consolidation, external aggression, and an internal military crisis, issues of reproduction gain existential importance—not only reproduction of humans, but also reproduction of social and cultural structures (Erel 2018). The conceptualization of motherhood changes in connection to its place in the state welfare system while it remains equally central to womanhood.

To grasp a model of motherhood and an ideal of »mother« promoted by the state, I turn to state welfare and labor policies and policy discussions in the parliament. Combining labor regulation and welfare provision to families with children and/or mothers in my analysis allows me to understand the (child)care regime and the gender regime taking shape in Ukraine. The welfare state is »the social face of the state,« which is »a particular state form, whereby the public authorities garner resources and

assume responsibility for organizing their redistribution« (Daly and Rake 2003, 14). The welfare system operates through interpretative structures, redistributive structures, or some combination of the two (Fraser 1989), which, when applied to the concept of care, provide a variety of expectations and demands of a woman subject. Labor regulations illustrate the relations of these norms to the sphere of paid employment, to expectations of work, and/or to the ideal of the working citizen.

Methodologically, the study uses post-structuralist policy analysis with a focus on gendered norms and subject positions (Allan 2008; Bacchi 2000, 2009). This approach tackles policy as a cultural product and as a process of culture formation (Shore and Wright 1997). Researchers working within this framework ask different questions: »What's the problem represented to be?« (Bacchi 2009), »How does a policy mean?« (Yanow 1996), and what discursive formations constrain and enable policy unfolding (Fimyar 2014). Relying on insights from these endeavors, I am interested in the gendered norms institutionalized in policy texts and gender idea(l)s articulated in policy discussions, ultimately constituting gendered subject positions embedded in the welfare regime (Brush 2002, 163; Adams and Padamsee 2001). The benefit of this approach to my study is that it allows me to argue that the policy in focus is not only shaped by the »instrumental logic« of economic rationale in conditions of post-socialist transition, but is based to a great extent on a gender ideology (Chernova 2013, 89). Policy discussions supplement my analysis with norms and idea(l)s that do not always translate into policy actions; instead, they outline boundaries of the sayable—the subject that is »unintelligible.«

Discourse (Foucault 1972) is a constellation of related statements that form a system of meaning (Ball 1993, 2015), but at the same time, discourse is not present in the object (text, interaction); instead it enables it to appear: »discourse is the conditions under which certain statements are considered to be the truth« (Ball 2013, 19). It »rules in« certain ways of talking about a topic [...], it »rules out« limits and restricts other ways of talking« (Hall 1997, 72). Policy discourses are conversations on the reconceptualization of gender norms, a »symbolic product« built into the cultural semantics of the political moment« (Gapova 2016, 88) which

frame and guide policy-making. An understanding of policy as a discourse »provides that policy regulates social relations primarily through positive or productive means by discursively producing subjectivities, hierarchies, and taxonomies for understanding the social world« (Allan 2008, 10). The duality between policy text and policy discourse (Ball 1993, 2015) allows me to define the discursive regime of »compulsory motherhood« in the specific context of my research interest as a set of (re)produced statements that define the relationships between woman, motherhood, and good mothering; as conditions under which statements about women's reproductive choices, social roles, and life goals are made sense of using certain strategies, for example, essentialization of motherhood.

Any discourse and particularly any policy/legal discourse in the area of welfare redistribution is a process of (re)producing subject positions, of assigning social positionality by becoming »properly« male and female (Smart 1992; Adams and Padamsee 2001; Brush 2002; Butler 1990). Subject positions are »constituted through a range of multiple and competing discourses and systems of meaning [...], which are further supported by social institutions and discursive practices« (Allan 2008, 8). Whereas the law and policies aim at »fixing« subjects, political discussions fill them with examples and controversies and show how they are constructed and used as tools for political struggles. Historically, reproduction is constructed in the political discourse as a »defining role for a »woman,« the ontological basis of this role is motherhood (as a biological function)« (Gapova 2016, 117). The bodily capacity of reproduction is significant for all positions women occupy in society. In this paper I conceive of the essentialization of motherhood as a discursive strategy used to construct multiple subject positions of women, even »counter-hegemonic« (Heller 1996) ones that are barely spoken of—e.g., as non-mothers.

In order to select my material I started with a few fundamental texts, such as the law »On State Assistance to Families with Children«³ and the Labor Code,⁴ followed these laws through all of the amendments, including the

3 Law No. 2811-XII, Nov. 21, 1992.

4 Code of Laws No. 322-VIII, Dec. 10, 1971.

ones that failed, and expanded my search by including the »connected documents« listed for each law in the official database of the Ukrainian parliament.⁵ I analyzed laws, legislative proposals, policy texts such as official ministerial directives, supporting documents such as explanatory notes to legislative proposals, and transcripts of policy discussions in the parliament and of hearings on the topic. I also traced policy changes from 1990 to 2015, analyzed changing structures of welfare provision to families in need, families with (many) children, the system of social insurance and protection, and changing expectations both of the state to provide and of women to mother. These policy changes and policy discourses are positioned within a larger process of political transformation, guided and shaped by the projects of nation-building and neoliberalization.

For decades feminist scholars in sociology and history focused their research on mothering practices and maternal agency (Rich 1995; O'Reilly 2008; Neyer and Bernardi 2011). I do not aim at refuting or ignoring their advances by excluding mothers' perspectives, but instead focus on the top-down enforcement of the institution of motherhood. My choice of the research field—Ukrainian state policy-making and the parliament—explains the absence of multiple voices competing to define how to mother because representatives of civil society are rarely invited to speak in the parliamentary space or as part of public policy deliberations, and when they are, they are hand-picked by the political actors in power.⁶ The flexible yet persistent regime of »compulsory motherhood« functions so that hegemonic policy discourses on motherhood and reproduction are institutionalized and disruptive maternal practices remain invisible and illegitimate, at least at the level of formal politics. Policy discussions in the parliament function less like debates and more like legitimations of a certain state action and as an arena for political conflicts unfolding between interest groups. The topics of the discussions I analyzed beget consensus, which leads to unsupported promises and lack of conflict. The

5 Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine, official web portal, <http://portal.rada.gov.ua/>.

6 For more on Ukrainian parliamentary politics and civil society, see Hrycak 2005, 2006; Rubchak 2012.

relationship between the state and its citizens is always that of contestation with various levels of enforcement, negotiation, and disobedience. By focusing on the norms articulated by political actors and institutionalized by state actions, I do not negate the gap between these norms and internalized ideas or practiced behaviors; instead, I give the level of state rhetoric the attention it deserves and connect it to state actions. In this paper I deconstruct political discourses by carrying out a systematic analysis of the contextually specific gender norms and ideas as presented in policy discussions, texts, and actions. I entertain an idea of »non-mothering« as a disruptive practice, creating a potential subject position within the discourse, but I do agree with Butler that agency is »a reiterative or rearticulatory practice, immanent to power, and not a relation of external opposition to power« (2014, 15). What is missing from the norm of womanhood is not acceptance of the illusive subject »choosing« to opt out in opposition to »compulsory motherhood,« but the multiplicity of legitimate ways women can do both femininity and mothering.

The Ukrainian gender regime: Between state socialism and nationalism

Since the 1960s the Soviet gender regime encouraged and enabled women to combine paid employment and childcare through welfare services and benefits (Harden 2009). The central subject of Soviet politics was a working mother, and her contribution to social reproduction was emphasized (Chernova 2013, 131). This arrangement, despite its extensive and nearly universal welfare provision based on women's rights as mothers and workers, did not challenge gender roles at home. For the contract of working mother to »work,« the state relied on women fulfilling traditionalist expectations when it came to care and family work while also complying with expectations of the Soviet worker-citizen (Zdravomyslova and Temkina 2012). Ultimately, the literature suggests that the Soviet regime deprived anybody and everybody of independent subjectivity while creating special relations of »dependency« with women-citizens (Gapova 2016, 123; Chernova 2013, 105). The Soviet state was notorious in its regulation of living bodies through centralized interventions, localized institutions such as hospitals and schools, and through internalized disciplining (Prozorov

2016; Stella 2015; Kaganovsky 2008). The boundary between public and private was constructed in such a way that motherhood and mothers' bodies were an object of state intervention through regulation of reproductive rights, medicalization, and access to contraceptives (Chernova 2013, 93–97), which resulted in »almost complete de-individualization and de-personification of the woman« (Strelnyk 2017a, 22).

The post-socialist Ukrainian gender regime is under the effect of two main forces—neoliberalism and nationalism (Zhurzhenko 2008). However, neither of these ideologies brings a strict repertoire of welfare interventions to the table. Instead, nationalism and neoliberalism serve as »ideological frameworks for renegotiation of the welfare reforms« (Zhurzhenko 2008), at times merging and reforming each other, all while being engaged in the reconstruction of gender norms.

Part of the transitional policy in Ukraine was to privatize family life, de-institutionalize childcare, and create conditions within which »women can be simply women,« the so-called »domestication of women« (Gapova 2016; Strelnyk 2017a). These changes were promoted under the umbrella of nationalist ideology as an attempt to revitalize the »natural« gender order of the traditional Ukrainian family in contrast to the »artificial« Soviet one and traditional gender norms in contrast to women's emancipation and equality between the sexes. Besides that, the myth of »Ukrainian matriarchy,« central to the nationalist ideology, affirming that women-mothers originally occupied a respected and central position in the family and in public life, provided an alternative to the Soviet equality of the sexes (Pavlychko 2002; Zhurzhenko 2001a). However, Gapova suggests this »invention of tradition« legitimized women's exclusion from »capitalist competition,« substituted for the »symbolic power« of »idealized motherhood« (2016, 12–13).

Throughout these changes in the gender regime, the »demographic crisis« discourse has been the dominant framework for problematizing reproduction in state discourses (Zhurzhenko 2012). Population decline became a symptom of larger problems—a crisis of society in the midst of dramatic transformation and a crisis of family and morality. In conditions of social disruption and uncertainty motherhood remained an issue of a national

concern, »linked to issues of women’s sexual, reproductive, and professional practices on the one hand, and national survival on the other« (Rivkin-Fish 2006, 152).

Despite free market transformation and advances of neoliberal ideology legitimizing the process of post-socialist transition (Zhurzhenko 2001), its impact on welfare and gender policy discourses has had limited success. Sporadic implementation of means-testing for social benefits and attempts at »optimization« of the benefit system as a whole have been undermined, as I illustrate in this paper, by the ideology of state paternalism, which has supported the state pronatalist and family policies. Unlike »shock therapy« in Poland, the Ukrainian state has kept its responsibility »to support families« and encourage motherhood through financial provisions, which were especially generous in the 2000s. Due to this different temporality of somewhat common socio-political changes in the region, the neoconservative development in Ukraine that I point to in this paper, specifically since 2011, is of a different kind than the neoconservative, illiberal anti-gender political movement in Central and Eastern Europe, which has a distinctly anti-neoliberal and anti-colonial character (Grzebalska and Pető 2018; Korolczuk and Graff 2018). In Central and Eastern Europe, »anti-genderism« equates neoliberalism with individualism and globalization with the colonial expansion of neoliberal elites, basing its oppositional stance on these discursive strategies (Korolczuk and Graff 2018). Ukrainian gender conservatism also proposes »moral« solutions to social problems of family care, however, it implies reduced state intervention and »privatization« of reproduction in order to »finally« produce the »independent economic subject.« In Ukraine the neoliberal ideology came to the forefront in state politics shortly before Euromaidan and was accompanied by neoliberal welfare cuts in 2014. Since 2011 the dominant political discourse in welfare and labor policy discussions »constitute(s) every human being as a self-entrepreneur« (Muehlenhoff 2017, 156), »tasked with improving and leveraging its competitive positioning,« (Brown 2015, 10) collectively understood as human capital with a range of potentials for the state to invest in—demographic, working, upbringing potentials.

The Euromaidan events had distinct gender characteristics as a social protest (Onuch and Martsenyuk 2014) and gender consequences as political processes (Phillips 2014; Mayerchuk 2015). My research shows that since Maidan, the Ukrainian welfare state has been cut back, discussions in the parliament have gained an ultra-nationalist and ultra-conservative character, and gender terminology has been rejected. The framing of post-Maidan politics as revolutionary allowed the formation of a distinctly gendered discourse. As this paper illustrates, the neoliberal discourse is tied to neoconservatism in Ukraine with the family as its main subject, which means that women's reproductive role is prioritized over their contribution as workers and that their concerns as citizens are confined by the needs and concerns of the family. The case of Ukraine presents an example of conservative gender transformation which neither opposes nor fully embraces neoliberalism. Instead, it is a national maternalist regime with the family considered to be the subject of the neoliberal project.

In the light of these recent events and despite considerable literature on the post-Soviet gender transformation, there are very few studies on gender norms, ideals, and subject construction which consistently use a post-structuralist approach to analyze Ukrainian policy and political discourses (Zhurzhenko 2008; Zherebkina 2002). Instead, the topic features sporadically in analyses of other cultural outlets such as propaganda art (Bazylevych 2010), public opinion and attitudes (Strelnyk 2017a), or analysis of policy actions (Perelli-Harris 2008). The literature on the current neoconservative turn in gender politics in European countries is growing, with Ukraine still being a rare case study (Strelnyk 2017b). This paper focuses on Ukrainian social policies and the construction of motherhood, as a specific case of the Europe-wide neoconservative turn with distinct temporal relations between nationalism and neoliberalism in the conditions of crisis politics.

»Compulsory motherhood«: Essentialization of motherhood in social policies

Motherhood in welfare and labor policies

In this part of the paper, I discuss legal norms in labor regulations and welfare provisions based on reproduction, care, and needs of families with children underpinning the discourses on motherhood.

The regulation of women's work is problematized in Ukrainian politics and has been addressed in a chapter on »the work of women« in the Labor Code⁷ adopted in the Soviet Union in 1971. This regime of special treatment prohibits women from working in certain professions which involve excessive physical work (over 500 kinds of working activities⁸) and are believed to lead to harmful effects on reproductive functions. Mothers of children under 14 and single mothers have the right to additional vacation days, and single mothers are protected against dismissal. Mothers of young children (up to three years old) and pregnant women cannot be asked to work at night, do overtime, or go on business trips. As the law was changed over the years, most of these »special protection« measures were extended to include other members of the family who »actually take care of the child« if the mother is absent or sick. This arrangement safeguards the female employee's role of primary caretaker, and the father and anyone else remain secondary providers of care. However, if they do become primary caretakers, which needs to be confirmed by the mother or by her absence, it will be acknowledged at the workplace. Women's bodies are marked by their reproductive potential and function, regardless of women's actual status and their expression of interests or demands as working mothers. The flat-rate paid childcare leave for three years that all women, employed or not, are eligible for, is included in the working time relevant for the pension calculation. However, the social contributions employed women pay into the pension fund

7 Code of Laws No. 322-VIII, Dec. 10, 1971.

8 Ministry of Health, Decree No. 256, Dec. 29, 1993.

during this period are usually significantly smaller; this negatively affects the pensions women can expect.

In order to update labor legislation, the state has adopted a range of laws such as »On Work Payment,«⁹ »On Vacation,«¹⁰ and »On Mandatory State Social Insurance.«¹¹ However, any attempt to develop a new cohesive code of labor laws was stalled until the latest one in 2014,¹² which despite wide social debate and protests remains on the agenda, and its second hearing was scheduled for this year. In terms of regulating women's work, this text has one significant amendment—the introduction of the category of a »worker with family responsibilities« preserving all of the entitlements formerly reserved for women workers. At the same time, the application of these norms has been somewhat liberalized, with some restrictions being mitigated by the written consent of the employee. Still, fathers or other working members of the family can make use of these prerogatives only if the mother is absent or unable to use them herself. Somebody else's right to protections at the workplace might be enabled, but only as long as the default subject—the working mother—is not making use of the right.

In welfare law, women also constitute a special category of citizens closely connected to children and therefore in need of special assistance and protection. This leads to a range of welfare provisions which are explicitly or implicitly reserved for women with children.

After the end of the Soviet Union, state welfare provision in Ukraine, particularly provision to families with children regulated by the law on state assistance adopted in 1993,¹³ has been reduced: service provision has been underfunded and financial provision has been minimal. However, the state formally preserved its obligation to provide most benefits and

9 Law No. 108/95-BP, Mar. 24, 1995.

10 Law No. 504/96-BP, Nov. 15, 1996.

11 Law No. 1105-XIV, Sep. 23, 1999.

12 Draft Law No. 1658, Dec. 27, 2014.

13 Law No. 2811-XII, Nov. 21, 1992.

services, which signaled that despite its current inability to fulfill the role of »social welfare state,«¹⁴ the promise would be kept when circumstances allow.

According to the initial version of the law »On State Assistance to Families with Children,« women (employed, self-employed, unemployed, students, and military personnel) were entitled to 70 days of paid maternity leave before childbirth and 56 days thereafter. The payments, equivalent to the amount of the mother's official income from her employer, came from the state insurance fund or from the welfare office in case of unemployment. In addition, all mothers were eligible for one-time assistance upon childbirth and to three-year childcare leave during which time non-working¹⁵ women received 50% of the minimum salary and others 100%. In the case of employed mothers or students, this could be taken over by another member of the family, if proof from place of employment or studies was provided. Single mothers, mothers of many children, and low-income families had access to additional benefits. All of these benefits were small in amount and often underpaid in the 1990s.

In 1998 Ukraine adopted the law »On Mandatory State Social Insurance.«¹⁶ By 2001 assistance to employed parents was covered by this insurance in cases of »temporal loss of employability,« including pregnancy and childcare. Unemployed and non-working parents, as well as single mothers and families with many children, were covered by the law »On State Assistance to Families with Children,« which settled these benefits as social assistance and made it easier for politicians to condition them on income. These efforts were framed as welfare reforms, aimed at achieving high levels of efficiency and increasing targeted assistance to those labeled as »the truly

14 The Constitution of Ukraine (1996, art. 1) proclaimed Ukraine »a social welfare state,« which means it »guarantees economic and social human and citizen rights and freedoms and corresponding state responsibilities« (Vorotin 2009, 3).

15 A non-working person is someone who is not officially employed, not a student, and is not registered at the unemployment office.

16 Law No. 1105-XIV, Sep. 23, 1999.

needy.« Besides that, introduction of mandatory state insurance meant that only officially employed persons whose employers paid contributions in their name and on the fully declared salary to the state insurance fund were eligible to sizeable benefits.

In 2005 Viktor Yushchenko, the new president elected after the »Orange Revolution,« introduced an increase of the one-time assistance to families with children,¹⁷ which became a flagship of family policy and made Ukrainian welfare support to mothers among the most generous in the world (Perelli-Harris 2008). The size of this benefit was increased by a factor of 11 and amounted to 8,500 UAH, approximately 1,700 USD at the time. The payment was made in two parts: 40% in one installment after birth and the rest divided into monthly payments for a year.¹⁸ Besides, the benefit was relocated to the realm of social protection and the same amount was granted to all, regardless of employment history or any other criteria. This universal provision of a considerable amount of money to mothers virtually without conditions was framed as part of the state's effort to raise birth rates and to compensate families for their »nationally important« reproductive work. In the 2008 budget bill¹⁹ the amount of assistance was adjusted for inflation and multiplied by two for the second child and by four for the third and every following child in the family. The second part of the amount paid was distributed during 24 or 36 months after the birth of the second or third child, respectively. This benefit, as a symbol of the president's and the new government's focus on the national project of Ukrainian democracy and on Ukrainian children and families in conditions of a widely discussed »demographic crisis« became one of the main policy projects of the post-revolutionary government. In 2010 the mechanism of benefit calculation was institutionalized in the law and connected to the minimum subsistence level. In 2004 the benefit amounted to three minimum subsistence levels and it grew to 30 minimum subsistence levels by 2011.

17 Program of the Government n0001120-05, Feb. 4, 2005.

18 Law No. 2505-IV, Mar. 25, 2005.

19 Law No. 107-VI, Dec. 28, 2007.

The Maidan protests and the following political, economic, and military crises presented Ukrainian politicians and Ukrainian society with another disruptive moment in history. On the one hand, it meant that the political legitimacy, economic viability, and ideological cohesiveness of the Ukrainian state were in question. On the other hand, it meant that the state had an opportunity, if not the necessity, to reinvent itself—again. In my opinion this reinvention was of a nationalist and neoliberal nature in terms of welfare and gender politics.

In spring of 2014 a law to «counteract economic catastrophe» was adopted,²⁰ which proposed major changes to Ukrainian tax law and several welfare provisions. This law fixed the one-time benefit upon childbirth in absolute numbers, making it susceptible to inflation, which reached 40% in 2015; equalized the payment per child, irrespective of the number of children the family already had; and abolished the childcare payment available for up to three years. These cuts did not provoke any public protests or debate. The «social» aspect of this law was «insignificant» compared to corporate tax and other changes in accordance with IMF requirements. I would like to argue here that the policy discourse had already been transformed by then, making this cut possible and legitimizing it to politicians and the public. The state paternalism of previous decades was already delegitimized as the last legacy of the Soviet regime, encouraging the population to be passive. The post-Maidan regime change was the main contributing factor which allowed for the newly elected members of the parliament and the government to distance themselves from the old regime, including the policies of paternalism and pronatalism.

«Compulsory motherhood» in policy discourses

In this part of the paper I focus on several policy discussions in order to illustrate the construction of the hegemonic regime of «compulsory motherhood,» which essentially means that all women are already (future) mothers and that voluntary non-motherhood is unthinkable. In order to make this point I illustrate how mothering is a function of the (healthy)

20 Law No. 1166-VII, Mar. 27, 2014.

body in the context of the gradually expanding meaning and expectations of motherhood under the influence of nationalist and neoliberal ideologies.

In the 1990s the government issued several policy documents addressing the state's intention to protect working women from the inevitable hardships that the transition to the free market would bring, due to their caring and reproductive responsibilities. The economic transition and the free market specifically were believed to be »objectively« discriminatory for them.²¹ In 1990 the Ukrainian Supreme Council of the USSR adopted a decree²² »On urgent measures in order to improve the position of women, to protect motherhood and childhood, to strengthen the family.« This decree was designed to provide short-term relief in the current situation and to anticipate the deteriorating conditions, especially for women, as an »unprotected group of the population.« In 1991 the Ukrainian Republican Council proposed another regional program²³ by the same name which problematized women's high rates of employment, their engagement in »heavy manual work,« and their lack of qualifications to compete on the free market. Besides that, the program highlighted that women were dissatisfied with the quality of state childcare and 62% of them believed that small children should be taken care of at home. This narrative of women-mothers who work too much in poor conditions, whose situation will inevitably worsen during the transition to capitalist free market, and who would prefer to stay at home with their small children, continued throughout the 1990s. In this narrative the state legitimized preserving and even expanding protective labor regulations for women and introducing longer, three-year childcare leave.

In 1999 a new »concept« on the improvement of the position of women²⁴ was proposed and in 2001 a national strategy.²⁵ The same narrative still

21 »The Concept on Improving Women's Position,« Draft Parliament Decree No. 5630, Feb. 22, 1999.

22 USSR Supreme Council Decree No. 1420-I, Apr. 10, 1990.

23 Ukrainian Republican Council Decree No. 716-XII, Feb. 13, 1991.

24 Draft Parliament Decree No. 5630, Feb. 22, 1999

25 Draft Law No. 3076-1, Feb. 22, 2001.

prevailed in these two texts. Women were believed to be »objectively« worse off than men participating in economic relations under the free market rules due to »fulfilling their reproductive function.« The national strategy addressed how important women's paid labor is to the national economy, but also warned of growing numbers of women working in conditions that do not correspond with safety standards and, therefore, harm their health:

There is a need for a program to gradually reduce women's employment in the industries. The first step for this program would be to reduce working time for women from 40 to 36 hours per week, later—to create an effective system of social protection for women who raise children, to increase financial remuneration for men who provide for families with women who do not work. Clearly, such a program [is oriented toward the future; OT], but it is possible already today to reduce working time for women, increase paid vacation time, and begin scientific development of the mechanism to relieve women from performing hard labor.²⁶ (»National strategy on the improvement of the position of women,« V. V. Kostytskii, Draft Law, No. 3076-1, Feb. 22, 2001)

The goal of state actions was to reduce women's engagement in paid employment through legal regulation of their working hours and by making alternative options more attractive—such as staying at home on childcare leave. The possibility of introducing such an action program was conditioned on the future economic development of the state, while centralized reduction of women's working hours was believed not to cause any financial consequences to the national economy. The impact of the free market on socially disadvantaged groups could only be cushioned with special protective measures described above, but not prevented, according to these policy documents. At the same time, with privatization and the growing shadow economy, fewer and fewer tools were available for the state to enforce these measures.

26 All translations from Ukrainian and Russian were done by the author, keeping as close to the original as possible.

In the beginning of the 2000s, the »demographic crisis« discourse came to dominate social policy discussions in the parliament. The problem was defined as rapid population decline determined by very low birth and high mortality rates. Besides that, Ukraine was a country of emigration, which intensified after the borders opened and economic situation in the country deteriorated.

In the previous section I already suggested that according to labor regulations all women were (potential) mothers. Then a good question to ask would be how politicians made sense of demographic problems with »compulsory motherhood« the dominant framework, which I continue to argue for throughout this paper. Here is an example of the representative of the Communist Party asking the same question in the framework of the regime change. This and following quotes are from the deliberation of the amendment to the law »On State Assistance to Families with Children,«²⁷ which I discussed in the previous section.

We all witnessed that during the socialist regime there was no need to discuss such legislative proposals and worry so much about our future generation and our mothers, who do not give birth today, unfortunately. [...] Please, explain to me [addressing Udovenko, former member of the government, Minister of Foreign Affairs; OT], I do not understand why this is happening in such a big and rich country [as ours] with our generation. (L. Y. Pasechna, Communist Party of Ukraine, May 31, 2000)

Although alarmist demographic concerns were part of public discourse as early as the 1970s (Rivkin-Fish 2006), the speaker hinted that the emergence of the acute demographic problems was tied to the deterioration of socio-economic conditions during the post-socialist transformation. Here demographic problems are »our« problems, state problems, as a nation. It was not the fault of individual decisions; instead, it was a social problem in need of a public solution. By referring to women »who do not give birth« as mothers, she firstly indicated the »normal« order of

27 Discussion of Legislative Proposal No. 5039, Feb. 1, 2000, <http://portal.rada.gov.ua/meeting/stenogr/show/2508.html>.

things, when all women (can) become mothers; and secondly, she said when they do not, then there was ground for alarm for the future of the whole society. Women possess a specific »conciseness« as mothers, irrespective of them being a mother or not in the present (Kaminer 2014). All women were future mothers, she claimed, and in the past the socialist state succeeded in creating favorable conditions for women to realize themselves as mothers. The Ukrainian state was failing, despite being so »big and rich,« i.e., having all the reasons to succeed.

Women's bodies and women's health are directly connected to children's health, which makes it a necessary object of state policy and a priority for state assistance, according to the author of the law from the National-Democratic Party in this quote from the same discussion:

According to the current law, this assistance [maternity benefit; OT] is provided in the amount of the average monthly income [of the mother]. This leads to a question: what about students, whose (state) stipend is 10 UAH, or unemployed mothers? Because in the last months of pregnancy one needs to eat enough, the health of the future child depends on this. What is cheaper for the state: to provide assistance or to then spend funds on medical treatment? I think this is not a point for discussion. (G. Y. Udovenko, People's Movement of Ukraine, May 31, 2000)

The subject of student-mother was evoked here to illustrate how small this assistance would be, due to the small state stipend students receive. In statements like this the state is portrayed as providing the most indispensable resources for the most vulnerable—pregnant women and mothers of small children. The »demographic crisis« discourse expresses quite literal concerns with nutrition and living conditions, which have existential effects on mothers' and children's lives. During the discussion of the legislative proposal on state assistance to poor families in 2002²⁸ M. V. Melnychuk from the Socialist Party of Ukraine stated that having one child cost 700 UAH (132 USD) and asked what the state gave back

28 Discussion of Legislative Proposal No. 1368, July 12, 2002, <http://iportal.rada.gov.ua/meeting/stenogr/show/1536.html>.

to the young mother who had a child. Therefore, from another side of the political spectrum, state assistance to families (with children) was considered to be a reward for the mother for having a child, irrespective of the social conditions she lived in or her income, for one thing, because having a child in Ukraine always puts a family at risk of poverty; for another, because it is a contribution to nation-building, which should be rewarded. Voices from these two political positions agreed on the necessity to extend welfare provision to mothers and to use financial incentives to stimulate birth rates. On the one hand, a call for comprehensive welfare provision for women-mothers in need from the right and a call for financial reward to women for childbirth from the left signify that biopolitical paternalism and pronatalism in Ukraine are products of the nationalist ideology behind the parent-state. On the other hand, the paternalistic welfare state ideology is based on the premise that financial assistance is there to remedy vulnerability of the body to poverty in an effort to ensure a higher level of production of (healthy) children.

While »non-mothering« was implicitly at the core of the state discussions on reproduction, it was understood in terms of childlessness caused by certain circumstances that impacted women's ability to have children. Women were imagined to be too sick and poor to have as many children as they would like, therefore, the state's role was to provide minimal resources to sustain women-mothers and their children. Reproductive behavior was reduced to an immediate reaction to the economic dimension of social circumstances. There is a conceptual difference in making sense of reproduction in terms of »choices« and »planning,« even embedded in social circumstances, or in terms of conditions that determine behavior. Living and economic conditions, family situation, or value orientation could influence reproductive choices. Instead Ukrainian politicians proposed to regard low fertility as directly impacted by these conditions. While pregnant bodies were imagined as the most vulnerable and the most in need, mothers »who do not give birth« under the effect of poverty and sickness experience childlessness as a special type of bodily vulnerability in social circumstances.

During the parliamentary hearings on »Protection of Children's Rights« in 2005²⁹ a member of the parliament positioned the recently introduced one-time assistance to families with children in connection to the health and »quality« of the future population, to women's health, and family values:

How should the state formulate the policy which meets the interests of the people, enables the formation of the normal »gene pool« and the creation of a powerful intellectual social class that could be later passed on to our state? Money does not facilitate birth rates. [...] In reality the birth rate depends on the state of society, on the material provision of the family, and on the family's skills to bring up children. [...]

Our task today is to create the state policy that would enable a woman to give birth to a healthy child. It means that a woman has a right to free medical examination and free genetic analysis to make sure that the child is healthy, so that the child has spirituality and intellectual development. [...] We will try to ensure in the budget that investment in people's health and in the intellect and development of children is prioritized. (L. P. Suprun, National Democratic Party, June 7, 2005)

This statement underlines the national and societal importance of births and »child quality« for the state itself. Women's reproductive health before and during pregnancy is a fundamental aspect contributing to the »gene pool.« Given the rather liberal abortion law in Ukraine,³⁰ the concern with the »quality« of children in this statement suggests an approach which would approve of aborting an unhealthy child in order to guarantee »a normal gene pool« by making use of the »free genetic analysis.« This concept includes not only genetic diversity and health, but is also connected to intellectual capacity and some form of moral constitution. Reproduction

29 Parliamentary hearings, »Protection of Children's Rights: Protection of Motherhood and Childhood,« June 7, 2005, http://static.rada.gov.ua/zakon/skl4/par_sl/sl070605.htm.

30 Law No. 2801-12, Nov. 19, 1992.

in the name of the nation-state is reproduction of healthy individuals, where health is connected to intellectual and moral development. »Upbringing potential,« understood as the capacity to birth physically healthy children and invest time and money into raising them »properly,« belongs to middle-class families in this discourse, and from this point on it is subjected to direct state involvement.

Despite this emphasis on economic well-being for the »good family,« women's economic activity is not a solution to families lagging behind, but faced with growing expectations. Instead, working remains a contributing factor negatively affecting women's vulnerable bodies, undermining the basic expectation of health for desired reproduction.

The policies issued in the 1990s and discussed above were concerned with women's health because of its connection to the children's or future children's health. Protective labor regulations were framed as protecting women's health, while being part of the Labor Code. By using mother's health as a proxy for children's health (not only children already born, but also future children), engagement in paid employment could be framed as dangerous and excessive for all women, while the nation-state had full authority to regulate it on behalf of children.

Discussions or policy proposals that explicitly address creating opportunities for women to combine working and caring for their children are very rare. Instead, improvement of mothers' working conditions by increasing the number of yearly vacation days for women is common. The two kinds of activities most women need to engage in—working and caring—are barely ever brought together in one policy or discussed side by side in the parliament. One of the exceptions is an amendment to a law proposed in 2004³¹ and initially framed as a work-care reconciliation policy. It proposed to pay a full childcare benefit for three years in case the mother returns to work so that she can spend the money to hire »a private childcare

31 Draft Laws No. 6464, No. 6464-1, No. 6464-2, Dec. 23, 2004.

specialist (nanny).« The policy debate around this proposal³² illustrates prioritization of caring over working, the importance of the »contact« between a mother and a child, and the importance of motherhood for the construction of womanhood.

The humanistic character of this legal initiative is due to the author's intentions to legally ensure the European norm of creating favorable conditions for a woman to realize her right to choose, because until now no one has asked the Ukrainian woman whether she wants to realize her original, God-given right or dedicate herself to her career; or use her intellectual potential in another way, combining things with motherhood.

Unfortunately, the Ukrainian woman from the beginning of time, being self-reliant and highly moral, for 70 years, if not more, had only one right except the obligation of having children—to work hard. [...]

In case this law is adopted, will it not become a step backward after several hard steps forward made by the state toward mothers, which women could only dream about for decades and even hundreds of years before? Would our society not lose something from such innovations? Because even the most professional nanny will not replace contact between the mother and a baby in that most tender period of life. (I. M. Rishnjak, People's Party, Oct. 21, 2005)

In the statement above, a member of the center-left party framed the legislative proposal as a state endeavor to provide women with a choice. The choice was between being a full-time mother on the one hand and combining motherhood with employment before the child turns three years old on the other. The »contact« between the mother and a young child is always talked about as something transcendent and at the same time immediate. It is not care, it is contact which demands young children

32 Discussion of Legislative Proposals No. 6464, No. 6464-1, No. 6464-2, Oct. 21, 2005, <http://portal.rada.gov.ua/meeting/stenogr/show/1978.html>.

to be inseparable from their mothers. Motherhood is implied as the main responsibility of women, of all women, regardless of time, whether it is back in Soviet times, even prior to that («from the beginning of time») or in the «European» future. Although motherhood can be combined with other ways of using «intellectual potential,» this option does not seem to be optimal to the speaker. He said that «unfortunately» for at least 70 years (implying the Soviet period) or even longer, women had to combine motherhood with work, and maybe even had to prioritize work. On the one hand, the speaker praised the legislative proposal for its «humanistic» and «European» character, on the other, he questioned if it might become a step backward for Ukrainian society after steps forward, such as increasing one-time assistance to families with children earlier that year. By the end of the statement, the issue of women choice had lost its centrality, and the loss or gain of society had become the main issue at stake. The proposal was never framed as an attempt to encourage women to make use of private childcare options instead of public ones while returning to work earlier. On the contrary, the state wanted to expand its financial assistance, initially framed as compensation of lost income to women for the period of childcare, to include working mothers as well.

This amendment was later vetoed by the president and a new version was adopted three years later. It was framed as financial assistance to mothers in difficult circumstances who go back to work before their childcare leave ends. Similarly to the conclusion that Chernova (2012, 301) drew for Russian family policy, the Ukrainian state was not interested in providing opportunities to reconcile work and care. Bound by the idea that women's work has a negative influence on the quality and amount of care provided to children, which consequently influences their health, such proposals to acknowledge and expand options for working mothers were undercut. Work is always something women have to do, due to poverty, and the state's role is to create conditions in which women do not have to work, at least when their children are young.

By 2015 the proposal from the 1999 to improve women's position at work by reducing their working hours to 36 per week found its second life in

an amendment to the labor law,³³ which is still awaiting discussion in the parliament, and it is framed in the following way:

Today there is a problem in Ukraine of unsatisfactory children's health, which directly depends on the health of the mother, as every second pregnant woman is ill (diseases of the heart, kidneys, blood vessels). Besides that, the number of babies born sick depends extensively on unsatisfactory material and working conditions [of the mother; OT] (daily physical and psychological exhaustion of women, emotional pressure). (Explanatory note to legislative proposal No. 2523a, Sep. 22, 2015)

Essentializing motherhood, making it an »original right« for women, then conditioning it on fulfillment of expanding expectations, including genetic health and socio-economic well-being, prioritizes it in the context of employment. Using a health discourse on top of bodily »contact« between a mother and a child allows the state to expand the scope of its legitimate intervention on behalf of women themselves and on behalf of children to the sphere of employment.

Starting in 2011 the policy discourse on reproduction and family has been changing under the influence both of neoliberal ideology, which has undermined state paternalism and state welfare benefits to all families with children, and of conservative nationalism, which has promoted the idea of the traditional family and family values. This tendency has further intensified since the Maidan events of 2013–2014 and the war in Eastern Ukraine. The independent traditional Ukrainian family, »physically and spiritually healthy,« has become a »moral« solution to demographic problems (J. P. Syzenko, Deputy Minister of Family Affairs, Youth, and Sports, Sep. 21, 2011).³⁴ While previously, the low birth rate was a social problem mostly understood as embedded in the disadvantageous socio-economic conditions of Ukrainian society, responsibility has now been

33 Draft Law No. 2523a, Aug. 25, 2015.

34 Parliamentary hearings, »The Institution of Family in Ukraine: Position, Problems, and Solutions,« Sep. 21, 2011. http://static.rada.gov.ua/zakon/skl6/11session/par_sl/sl2109111.htm.

individualized, with emphasis on »supporting the self-functioning family« in order to stimulate reproductive and »labor potential« (ibid.). The values and morality of individuals have been targeted as problematic. For the subject of the woman-mother, this means that the state's concerns with her reproductive health and her physical and »moral« capacity to birth and raise »good« children are from now on embedded in concerns with »family values« and lack thereof.

Moral and physical health are perpetually connected. Now poor moral health is the reason for reproductive shortcomings, which sometimes result in physical health issues such as sexually transmitted diseases, instead of poor physical reproductive health being an obstacle for childbirth because it has been affected by the disastrous socio-economic situation. The moral and physical health of children is influenced by the class position of their parents, connected to the »upbringing potential« of families. Politicians propose using the church, the media, and school to propagate »the right kind of morality« to safeguard the family. This suggestion sounded especially effective in the 2015 hearing on family policy.³⁵ This hearing took place after the 2014 economic crisis and welfare cuts. Politicians had no legitimate position from which to argue for sustaining or expanding state welfare provisions. During a three-hour long hearing, only three statements were made which encouraged expansion of state welfare provision, and none that explicitly condemned the welfare cuts of the previous year. These hearings were characterized by active participation of representatives of the church and nationalist politicians who promoted the conservative rhetoric of traditional family values and insisted on cooperation between governmental and non-governmental institutions in this task. The moralizing conservative rhetoric on »the spirituality, morality, and health of Ukraine« completely dominated the discussion, with multiple statements referring to God and the Bible (P. J. Unguryan, National Front, June 17, 2015).

35 Parliamentary hearings, »Family Policy of Ukraine—Goals and Tasks,« June 17, 2015, http://static.rada.gov.ua/zakon/new/par_sl/sl1706115.htm.

In the last five years, motherhood has been reconstructed as an individual and moral responsibility that cannot and should not be encouraged by financial means. Instead, it should be supported through proper education and discursive creation of the domestic private space of the family. This »moral« obligation is still equally grounded in the woman's nature, in her body, due to the immanent connection between physical and moral health when it comes to reproduction, creating yet another kind of vulnerability potentially interfering with mothering. Throughout the material analyzed, the »healthy spirit of the Ukrainian family« serves as a proxy for the right kind of reproductive choices by heterosexual officially married couples of middle class nationals. Within such a framework, motherhood is imposed through traditional gender roles based on the essentialization of women's reproduction and through ideologically charging it with patriotic and national importance.

The nation at war needs new warriors, which makes reproduction a good Ukrainian woman's moral duty. Since the 1990s reproductive function has ceased to be solely a function of a body—anybody—anymore. It is a function of a morally healthy individual who is conscious of all the effort it will take to »properly« raise a child and is doing it anyway.

Conclusion

The goal of this paper was to start a conversation on how motherhood is constructed in Ukrainian politics and how it is supported by labor regulations and state welfare assistance. Motherhood, which is always assumed and prioritized as a special responsibility of female citizens, is understood as a function of women's bodies, which eventually expanded to include social and family circumstances that influence the »health« of this mothering body. The regime of compulsory motherhood has evolved in the context of the Ukrainian state's becoming—national becoming, economic becoming, and geopolitical becoming. Motherhood has evolved from a function of a healthy body to a function of a morally healthy independent family. Nevertheless, maternal expectations are still extrapolated to all women based on biology—on physical capacity and, therefore, the social obligation to give birth. This is a generally typical strategy to

treat motherhood in politics, especially in the context of nation-building (Yuval-Davis 1997). Biological reductionism of motherhood is the primary aspect of traditional gender norms which validate women's immediate connection to a child and their primary caretaker role (Grosz 2011). Women's bodies are signified as vulnerable in changing social circumstances which negatively influence their capacity to fulfill the demands of essentialized reproduction. Bodily vulnerability legitimizes certain state interventions attempting to solve demographic problems.

From a feminist perspective, the underlying problem with such a gender regime is that essentialized motherhood is used to »maintain women's inferior social and economic status as ›objects‹ and to deny them the right to determine their position« (Neyer and Bernardi 2011, 6). Notwithstanding the rise in conservative ideology throughout the period of Ukrainian policy-making and possibly before that in the Soviet Union, the subject position of the woman-mother has been constructed in such a way that it lacks the basic capacity to designate agency to women, yet they still recognize themselves in this subject position.

Framing family values and morals inherent to the ideal of the Ukrainian traditional family in terms of (moral) health passed on to children could be regarded as a strategy to legitimize state intervention. The discourse of health colonizes the policies I analyzed and expands aspects of social life that can and should be regulated by state actions for the benefit of women and children. When women-mothers in the discourse of the »demographic crisis« were deemed too unhealthy to have children at the desired level in the 1990s, then their and their children's consumption, income level, housing, and medical care were to be examined. When later on children's health also meant the conditions in which they were raised, including education, then mothers' health and their capacity to provide the desired national upbringing would be addressed. Finally, in recent years, health, which has been used to naturalize and fix the possession of values and morals that the state is after has been made sense of in terms of focusing on reforming school curricula, censoring media, and involving religious organizations to influence the population, instead of targeting groups that might be already lost for the ambiguous project of »the new Ukrainian.«

References

- Adams, Julia, and Tasleem Padamsee. 2001. »Signs and Regimes: Rereading Feminist Work on Welfare States.« *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society* 8 (1): 1–23.
- Allan, Elizabeth J. 2008. *Policy Discourses, Gender, and Education: Constructing Women's Status*. New York: Routledge.
- Ashwin, Sarah, ed. 2000. *Gender, State, and Society in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia*. New York: Routledge.
- Bacchi, Carol Lee. 2000. »Policy as Discourse: What Does It Mean? Where Does It Get Us?« *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education* 21 (1): 45–57.
- . 2009. *Analyzing Policy: What's the Problem Represented to Be?* Frenchs Forest, N.S.W.: Pearson.
- Ball, Stephen J. 1993. »What is Policy? Texts, Trajectories and Toolboxes.« *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education* 13 (2): 10–17.
- . 2013. *Foucault, Power, and Education*. New York: Routledge.
- Bazylevych, Maryna. 2010. »Public Images, Political Art, and Gendered Spaces: Construction of Gendered Space in Socialist and Post-Socialist Ukraine.« *Journal of Contemporary Anthropology* 1 (1): 2–19.
- Brown, Wendy. 2015. *Undoing the Demos: Neoliberalism's Stealth Revolution*. New York: Zone Books.
- Brush, Lisa D. 2002. »Changing the Subject: Gender and Welfare Regime Studies.« *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society* 9 (2): 161–186.
- Buckley, Mary, ed. 1997. *Post-Soviet women: from the Baltic to Central Asia*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University.
- Butler, Judith. 1990. *Gender Trouble, Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge.
- . 2014. *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of »Sex.«* New York: Routledge.

- Chernova, Zhanna. 2012. »Balans semji i raboty: Politika i individualnye strategii materej.« *Jurnal issledovanij socialnoj politiki/The Journal of Social Policy Studies* 10 (3): 295–308.
- 2013. *Semja kak političeskij vopros: Gosudarstvennyj proekt i praktiki privatnosti*. Gendernaja serija vypusk 4. St. Petersburg: Izdatel'stvo Evropejskogo universiteta.
- Connell, R. W. 1990. »The State, Gender, and Sexual Politics: Theory and Appraisal.« *Theory and Society* 19 (5): 507–44.
- Daly, Mary, and Katherine Rake. 2003. *Gender and the Welfare State*. Cambridge, UK: Polity [in association with Blackwell].
- Erel, Umut. 2018. »Saving and Reproducing the Nation: Struggles Around Right-Wing Politics of Social Reproduction, Gender and Race in Austerity Europe.« *Women's Studies International Forum* 68:173–82.
- Fimyar, Olena. 2014. »What Is Policy? In Search of Frameworks and Definitions for Non-Western Contexts.« *Educate* 14 (3): 6–21.
- Foucault, Michel. 1972. *The Archeology of Knowledge*. New York: Pantheon.
- Fraser, Nancy. 1989. *Unruly Practices: Power, Discourse, and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota.
- Gal, Susan, and Gail Kligman, eds. 2000a. *Reproducing Gender: Politics, Publics, and Everyday Life After Socialism*. Princeton: Princeton University.
- 2000b. *The Politics of Gender After Socialism: A Comparative-Historical Essay*. Princeton: Princeton University.
- Gapova, Elena. 2016. *Klassy natsii: Feministskaja kritika natsioostroitel'stva*. Moscow: Novoe literaturnoe obozrenie.
- Grosz, Elizabeth A. 2011. *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana University.
- Grzebalska, Weronika, and Andrea Pető. 2018. »The Gendered Modus Operandi of the Illiberal Transformation in Hungary and Poland.« *Women's Studies International Forum* 68:164–72.
- Hall, Stuart. 1997. »The Work of Representation.« In *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*, edited by Stuart Hall, 13–74. London: SAGE [in association with the Open University].

- Haney, Lynne A. 2000. »Feminist State Theory: Applications to Jurisprudence, Criminology, and the Welfare State.« *Annual Review of Sociology* 26:641–66.
- Harden, Jeni. 2009. »Beyond the Dual Burden: Theorizing Gender Inequality in Soviet Russia.« *Critique* 30 (1): 43–68.
- Heller, Kevin J. 1996. »Power, Subjectification and Resistance in Foucault.« *SubStance* 25 (79): 78–110.
- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2005. »Coping with Chaos. Gender and Politics in a Fragmented State.« *Problems of Post-Communism* 52 (5): 69–81.
- . 2006. »Foundation Feminism and the Articulation of Hybrid Feminisms in Post-Socialist Ukraine.« *East European Politics and Societies* 20 (1): 69–100.
- Kaganovsky, Lilya. 2008. *How the Soviet Man Was Unmade: Cultural Fantasy and Male Subjectivity Under Stalin*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh.
- Kaminer, Jenny. 2014. *Women with a Thirst for Destruction: The Bad Mother in Russian Culture*. Evanston: Northwestern University.
- Khromeychuk, Olesya. 2016. »Negotiating Protest Spaces on the Maidan: A Gender Perspective.« *Journal of Soviet and Post-Soviet Politics and Society* 2 (1): 9–48.
- Korolczuk, Elżbieta, and Agnieszka Graff. 2018. »Gender as »Ebola from Brussels: The Anticolonial Frame and the Rise of Illiberal Populism.« *Signs* 43 (4): 797–821.
- Król, Agnieszka, and Paula Pustulka. 2018. »Women on Strike: Mobilizing Against Reproductive Injustice in Poland.« *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 25 (4): 1–19.
- Lewis, Jane. 1997. »Gender and Welfare Regimes: Further Thoughts.« *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society* 4 (2): 160–77.
- Martsenyuk, Tamara. 2015. »Zhinky v Ukrainskiy politytsi.« Kyiv: International Centre for Policy Studies. http://icps.com.ua/assets/uploads/files/gender_block_editfinal.pdf
- Mayerchyk, Mariya. 2015. »Ukrainian Feminism at the Crossroad of National, Postcolonial, and (Post)Soviet: Theorizing the Maidan Events 2013–2014.« *Krytyka*, November 24. <https://krytyka.com/en/community>

/blogs/ukrainian-feminism-crossroad-national-postcolonial-and-postsoviet-theorizing-maidan.

- Muehlenhoff, Hanna L. 2017. »Victims, Soldiers, Peacemakers and Caretakers: The Neoliberal Constitution of Women in the EU's Security Policy.« *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 19 (2): 153–67.
- Neyer, Gerda, and Laura Bernardi. 2011. »Feminist Perspectives on Motherhood and Reproduction.« *Historical Social Research* 36 (2): 162–76.
- Onuch, Olga, and Tamara Martsenyuk. 2014. »Mothers and Daughters of the Maidan: Gender, Repertoires of Violence, and the Division of Labor in Ukrainian Protests.« *Social, Health, and Communication Studies Journal* 1 (1): 105–6.
- O'Reilly, Andrea. 2008. *Feminist Mothering*. Albany: State University of New York.
- Pavlychko, S. D. 2002. *Feminizm*. Kyiv: Osnovy.
- Perelli-Harris, Brienna. 2008. »Ukraine: On the Border Between Old and New in Uncertain Times.« *Demographic Research* 19:1145–78.
- Phillips, Sarah D. 2014. »The Women's Squad in Ukraine's Protests: Feminism, Nationalism, and Militarism on the Maidan.« *American Ethnologist* 41 (3): 414–26.
- Prozorov, Sergei. 2016. *The Biopolitics of Stalinism: Ideology and Life in Soviet Socialism*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University.
- Rich, Adrienne C. 1995. *Of Woman Born: Motherhood as Experience and Institution*. New York: Norton.
- Rivkin-Fish, Michele. 2006. »From »Demographic Crisis« to »Dying Nation«: The Politics of Language and Reproduction in Russia.« In *Gender and National Identity in Twentieth-Century Russian Culture*, edited by Helena Goscilo and Andrea Lanoux, 151–73. DeKalb: Northern Illinois University.
- Rubchak, Marian J. 2012. »Seeing Pink: Searching for Gender Justice through Opposition in Ukraine.« *European Journal of Women's Studies* 19 (1): 55–72.
- . 2015. *New Imaginaries: Youthful Reinvention of Ukraine's Cultural Paradigm*. New York: Berghahn.
- Shchurko, Tatiana. 2012. »Compulsory Motherhood: The Female Reproductive Body as Regulated by the State.« *Laboratorium* 2:69–90.

- Shore, Cris, and Susan Wright. 1997. »Policy: A New Field of Anthropology.« In *Anthropology of Policy: Critical Perspectives on Governance and Power*, edited by Cris Shore and Susan Wright, 3–30. New York: Routledge.
- Smart, Carol. 1992. »The Woman of Legal Discourse.« *Social & Legal Studies* 1 (1): 29–44.
- State Statistics Service of Ukraine. 2016. *Children, Women and Family in Ukraine*. State Statistical Report. Kyiv: State Statistics Service of Ukraine.
- Stella, Francesca. 2015. *Lesbian Lives in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia: Post-Socialism and Gendered Sexualities*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Strelnyk, Olena. 2017a. *Turbota yak Robota: Materynstvo u Fokusi Sociologii*. Kyiv: Krytyka.
- 2017b. »For the Sake of Our Children’s Future«: A Conservative Parents’ Mobilization in Ukraine.« In *Rebellious Parents*, edited by Katalin Fabian and Elzbieta Korolczuk, 61–90. Bloomington: Indiana University.
- Verloo, Mieke, ed. 2018. *Varieties of Opposition to Gender Equality in Europe*. New York: Routledge.
- Vorotin, Valerij, ed. 2009. *Ukraine as a Social State*. Kyiv: National Institute for Strategic Research.
- Yanow, Dvora. 1996. *How Does a Policy Mean? Interpreting Policy and Organizational Actions*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University.
- Yuval-Davis, Nira. 1997. *Gender and Nation*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE.
- Zdravomyslova, Elena, and Anna Temkina. 2012. »The Crisis of Masculinity in Late Soviet Discourse.« *Russian Studies in History* 51 (2): 13–34.
- Zherebkina, Irina A. 2002. *Zhenskoe Politicheskoe Bessoznatelnoe*. St. Petersburg: Aletejja.
- Zhurzhenko, Tatiana. 2001a. »Free Market Ideology and New Women’s Identities in Post-Socialist Ukraine.« *The European Journal of Women’s Studies* 8 (1): 29–49.
- 2001b. »Ukrainian Feminism(s): Between Nationalist Myth and Anti-Nationalist Critique.« IWM Working Paper 2, Vienna.
- 2008. *Gendernye rynki Ukrainy*. Vilnius: YGU.

Tarkhanova, Essentializing motherhood

InterDisciplines 1 (2018)

——— 2012. »Gender, Nation, and Reproduction: Demographic Discourses and Politics in Ukraine After the Orange Revolution.« In *Gender, Politics, and Society in Ukraine*, edited by Olena Hankivsky and Anastasiya Salnykova, 131–51. Toronto: University of Toronto.

Oleksandra Tarkhanova, Bielefeld Graduate School in History and Sociology,
Bielefeld University: oleksandra.tarkhanova@uni-bielefeld.de

Belonging and popular culture

The work of Chilean artist Ana Tijoux

Susan Lindholm

Introduction

Current public debates on migration in the Global North often focus on issues of integration and multiculturalism, that is, questions surrounding the reassertion of national identity and definitions of the nation-state. In these debates, the figure of the embodied and imagined migrant can be seen as one that serves to condense »concerns with race, space and time and the politics of belonging« (Westwood and Phizacklea 2000, 3). However, these public debates tend to pay less attention to the experience of individual migrants and groups who move across national borders and the structural preconditions based on social issues such as race, culture, and gender they encounter and negotiate. In order to be able to discuss and theoretically frame such experiences, researchers have suggested moving beyond methodological nationalism by, for instance, identifying and analyzing different spaces in which individuals identified as the cultural or racial »Other« express experiences of marginalization and exclusion (Westwood and Phizacklea 2000; Anthias 2008; Amelina et al. 2012; Nowicka and Cieslik 2014; Vasilev 2018).

While hip-hop culture is often described as a platform through which marginalized youths are able to make such experiences of social exclusion visible, it is also a highly gendered space that, in its mainstream version, is filled with expressions of hypermasculinity and misogyny (Kumpf 2013, 207; Sernhede and Söderman 2010, 51). Such dominance of masculine-coded expressions, in turn, contributes to the marginalization of female and queer artists in mainstream hip-hop culture (Rose 2008; Pough 2007). Therefore, this article studies global hip-hop culture both as a platform

used to negotiate questions of (national and transnational) belonging and as a gendered space that activates questions of belonging. The term transnational is used here to stress the particular national frameworks within which such questions are activated. It specifically focuses on such issues in the artist identity and work of Ana Tijoux, a Chilean artist who addresses international, national, and gender issues through her music.

Hip-hop culture and belonging

In the introduction to the anthology *Global Noise: Rap and Hip Hop Outside the USA*, its editor Tony Mitchell points out that as hip-hop became increasingly commercialized and popularized in the United States during the 1990s, it simultaneously developed into »a vehicle for global youth affiliations and a tool for reworking local identity all over the world« (Mitchell 2001, 2). This global spread of hip-hop culture nevertheless relies on the efforts of individuals to »reinscribe their own social world« through an »intensely mediated labor of making a culture one's own« (Maxwell 2001, 260). Ian Maxwell, who has studied white hip-hop artists in Australia, analyzes this process by tracing the way in which individuals set out to overcome the »disjunction« between their own experience and the narrative to which they want to belong, that is, in this case, hip-hop culture (Maxwell 2001, 262). More recent international studies have focused on issues of identity and authenticity in, for instance, Australian hip-hop, Arabic Rap, and the hip-hop scene in London (see Minestrelli 2016; Johannsen 2017; Speers 2017).

Much like other forms of popular culture, the mainstream version of hip-hop culture is largely male-dominated (Chang 2007; Beale Spencer et al. 2004, 234). In her book *Hip-hop Wars*, Tricia Rose provides a comprehensive overview over the public debate surrounding, among others, misogynistic tendencies in mainstream hip-hop (Rose 2008). Since the 1990s, a growing body of research in the United States has focused on the critique of the (hetero)sexism, capitalism, and racism that characterizes mainstream hip-hop culture (Pough 2007; McFarland 2008; Durham et al. 2013; Cooper et al. 2017). Although some research does focus on gender issues in international hip-hop, such as Sujatha Fernandes's study of women

rappers in Cuba who recognize that oppression on the basis of race, class, and sex are intertwined, research on hip-hop culture conducted outside of the US and available in English has given little attention to gender issues (Pough et al. 2007, 10; Beale Spencer et al. 2004, 234; Salvatierra Díez 2016; hooks 2004; Berggren 2014, 234).

Hip-hop culture outside of the United States has instead been discussed mainly within a national framework, where, among other things, it has been defined as a space in which marginalized youths set out to negotiate and make visible their experiences of being identified as the national »Other« (Kumpf 2013, 207; Sernhede and Söderman 2010, 37). In other words, the main focus of such research has been to analyze hip-hop as a culture that provides a platform to negotiate national belonging. While transnational connections created and negotiated by individual hip-hop artists have received less attention, some studies do discuss hip-hop culture in connection to different diasporas, most prominently the African diaspora (see for instance: Kaya 1997; Osumare 2007; Ohadike 2007; Perry 2008; Spady 2013).

Instead of discussing hip-hop culture in a national or diasporic framework, this article focuses on the way in which issues of belonging are negotiated in the work of Ana Tijoux, a Chilean artist who addresses transnational, national, and gender issues in her artist identity as well as her music. After first mapping the different spaces in which Tijoux's artist identity and her work pose questions of belonging, it then discusses the answers she gives to these questions as a hip-hop artist.

The work of Chilean artist Ana Tijoux

Ana María Merino Tijoux, commonly known by her artist's name Ana Tijoux, was born in 1977 in Lille, France to Chilean parents who fled the country following the military coup in 1973. Tijoux grew up in Paris and her family returned to Chile in the 1990s, where she became part of a number of successful hip-hop groups such as Makiza. She returned to France in 2001, to then move back to Chile in 2003, and rose to international fame

with the hit single »1977« as a solo artist.¹ Although she was not born in Chile, she repeatedly refers to it as »my country« in interviews, uses traditional Chilean musical instruments, and refers to Chilean singers and songwriters Violetta Parra and Victor Jara in her work. As a musician, she also refers to her experience of migration and exile, and sets out to make visible issues that are central for marginalized individuals and groups in Chile as well as the Global South. Her autobiography and work are thus interesting in this context, since they touch upon and address issues of exile and return as well as national belonging from the positionality of a female hip-hop artist.

In order to discuss questions of belonging in Tijoux's work, I watched and read a large number of interviews with her, read various articles, listened to Tijoux's song lyrics, and watched her videos that are available online. In that extensive material, I was able to identify a number of different answers to questions of belonging. For this article, I have selected the following interviews, articles, lyrics, and videos to represent these answers. Interviews: an interview conducted in connection with the Pachanga Latino Music Festival in Austin, Texas;² a short *New York Times* article on her work published in 2014 (Pareles 2014); an interview conducted by the Italian web TV station TelevisionetMusic;³ an interview conducted in the context of the making of the song »Somos Sur« in 2014;⁴ an interview with the US organization Democracy Now;⁵ an article

1 Nacional Records, »Ana Tijoux—1977,« YouTube video, 3:33, Feb. 19, 2010, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yiQ7S38nKog>.

2 Blastro2, »Ana Tijoux—English Interview—Entrevista En Inglés—La Bala,« YouTube video, 5:48, Aug. 9, 2012, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zh3F3GQcUFY>.

3 TelevisionetMusic, »Ana Tijoux: Una Rapper Cilena col Passaporto Francese,« YouTube video, 6:51, May 5, 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vsGwaLGxTOU>.

4 Enlamakinita, »En La Makinita »Versos Migrantes« Ana Tijoux y Shadia Mansour, Capítulo #9,« YouTube video, 25:25, Sep. 11, 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hDGsbGHddYU>.

based on an interview with Ana conducted for the *Harvard Gazette*,⁶ and, finally, an interview with the Latin American internet site Tele Sur.⁷ Songs and videos: Ana's cover version of Chilean singer and songwriter Violeta Parra's song »Santiago Penando Estas«; the song »Shock« that was featured on her 2011 album *La Bala*; as well as her songs »Antipatriarca« and »Somos Sur« featured on her 2014 album *Vengo*.⁸ I transcribed the lyrics with the help of the website genius.com. All translations from Spanish are my own.

The following analysis is structured according to three spaces I identified in the material in which Tijoux negotiates belonging: first, exile and return (a transnational space); second, a Chilean past and present (a national space); and third, being a female hip-hop artist (mainstream hip-hop culture).

Exile and return

In order to be able to discuss the significance of exile and return for Ana Tijoux's choice to become a hip-hop artist, I will start by providing a

-
- 5 Democracy Now!, »Chilean Musician Ana Tijoux on Politics, Feminism, Motherhood & Hip-Hop As »A Land for the Landless,« YouTube video, 34:14, July 11, 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EJ3Gr58dpWM>.
- 6 Liz Mineo, »For Ana Tijoux, Hip-hop Is Home: France-Born Chilean Found Her Place in Her Music,« *Harvard Gazette*, Apr. 21, 2016, <http://news.harvard.edu/gazette/story/2016/04/for-ana-tijoux-hip-hop-is-home/>.
- 7 Tele Sur Videos, »Ana Tijoux Remembers Victor Jara,« interview, Sep. 16, 2016, <https://videosenglish.telesur.tv.net/video/591441/ana-tijoux-remembers-victor-jara/>.
- 8 U Man, »Ana Tijoux-Santiago penando estás,« YouTube video, 4:18, Oct. 20, 2009, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_9BKsK9J388;
 Nacional Records, »Ana Tijoux—Shock,« YouTube video, 3:48, Oct. 4, 2011, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=177-s44MSVQ>;
 Nacional Records, »Ana Tijoux—Antipatriarca,« YouTube video, 3:15, May 29, 2015, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RoKoj8bFg2E>;
 Nacional Records, »Ana Tijoux—Somos Sur (Feat. Shadia Mansour),« YouTube video, 4:10, June 12, 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EKGUJXzxNqc>.

brief outline of the consequences of the military coup in Chile in 1973 as well as the emergence of hip-hop culture in Chile. In the immediate aftermath of the coup that led to the overthrow of the Chilean government under Salvador Allende on September 11, 1973, the military regime led by general Augusto Pinochet shut down the parliament and banned all unions and political organizations that were not in line with its political views. Between 1973 and 1990 the regime tortured, exiled, and killed thousands of civilians (Constable and Valenzuelo 1993, 21). Outside of Chile, the coup was broadly documented on radio, television, and by the written press. It was followed by an international wave of solidarity, and the human rights violations committed during the regime fundamentally influenced the development of an international language of human rights in the 1970s (Christiaens et al. 2014, 10). Those who were exiled and fled to countries such as the United States, Canada, Sweden, and France were often highly educated and continued their political activism in exile. Nine months after the coup, approximately 150,000 Chileans were living in exile, about half of whom settled in Western and Eastern Europe (Wright and Oñate 1998, 123).

In the mid- to late 1980s, as signs were increasing that the regime was slowly coming to an end, hip-hop culture emerged in Chile. Young men who lived in *poblaciones*, economically disadvantaged neighborhoods located at the outskirts of cities such as Santiago, Valparaiso, Temuco, and Viña del Mar, started to imitate the moves and styles of b-boys (breakdancers) they saw in US movies such as *Breakin'* and *Beat Street* (Quitow 2001, 21; Hardy Raskovan 1989, 101–2). Yet more information on hip-hop was hard to come by as the Pinochet regime had isolated Chile. In this context, the *retornados*, that is, individuals who had not lived in Chile during the dictatorship, but started to return to the country during the 1980s and 1990s, played a crucial role. Having encountered hip-hop in countries such as Italy or France, they had gained knowledge about its development and international character that was not available to the b-boys in Chile. The *retornados'* experience of exile thus contributed to keeping the culture alive.

Ana Tijoux was among these *retornados* as her family returned to Chile in 1993. However, life was not easy for these returnees, as Chilean society

was more focused on rebuilding a democratic order than on integrating former exiles. Returning was especially difficult for the children of exiles. Many of them had been born after their parents fled the country, which meant that they had grown up outside of Chile and had a hard time adjusting to what many of them perceived as a foreign country. In a 2016 interview with the *Harvard Gazette*, Tijoux mentions how, during the early 1990s, hip-hop culture became a platform to express her feelings of »frustration and anger« (Mineo 2016). In the interview, she also describes engaging in hip-hop culture as cathartic and »cheaper than therapy« (ibid.).

Being a *retornado*, Tijoux decided to move back to France, where she had encountered hip-hop culture and music, in the early 2000s. Born in Lille, she had spent her adolescence in Paris, where her mother worked as a social worker with immigrant families from Senegal, Morocco, Algeria, and other parts of Africa. In an interview with the Italian web TV station TelevisionetMusic published in 2014, she recalls how these multicultural influences profoundly influenced her, as she became exposed to different kinds of music from different parts of the world (TelevisionetMusic 2014, 01:30). In this context, she also started listening to hip-hop. In her 2016 interview with the *Harvard Gazette*, Ana argued that, »for children of immigrants in France, hip-hop became a sort of land for those of us who felt landless [...] we felt displaced, but hip-hop made us feel restored« (Mineo 2016). However, Tijoux's description of the roots of hip-hop in multicultural France does not include any reference to the US roots of hip-hop, which are often mentioned by researchers studying hip-hop outside of the US (see, for instance, Mitchell 2001, 2); from the position she is speaking from in the 2016 interview, its roots are »elsewhere.«

As Avtar Brah points out, experiences in diasporic communities can differ depending on gender, class, and ethnicity (Brah 2002). Individual migrants can also have conflicting feelings surrounding concepts such as »home« and »belonging,« and it is possible to feel at home in one place and still have feelings of social marginalization that make it impossible to call that place home (Kumarini 2009). In other words, these experiences of social marginalization and exclusion activate questions of belonging that, in this

case, are answered by seeking refuge in a form of popular culture that provides a platform to express such experiences: global hip-hop culture. Using hip-hop culture as such a platform, Tijoux became able to express the disjunction between her experience of marginalization or »being out of place« in, and in between France and Chile. However, as I will discuss in the following, as an artist, Tijoux also sets out to answer the question of belonging in a Chilean, that is, a national context in which she was not automatically included.

Belonging to a Chilean and transnational past

Before returning to Chile in the mid-2000s, Tijoux released a cover of Chilean singer and songwriter Violetta Parra's song »Santiago Penando Estas,« which was featured on a tribute album. In 2016, she also released a remake of Chilean songwriter Victor Jara's song »Luchin.« Both Violetta Parra and Victor Jara were part of the *nueva canción* (new song) movement, a folk-inspired genre of socially conscious protest music with origins in Chile (Foxley 1988; Torres Alvarado 2004). Violetta Parra had died in 1967, and Victor Jara was killed in the immediate aftermath of the 1973 coup in a stadium in Santiago that today is named after him. As the members of the *nueva canción* movement in general were outspokenly critical of Pinochet, they were forced to flee the country together with thousands of other Chileans who had supported president Salvador Allende (Svensson 2009, 11). During the exile period, Violetta Parra and Victor Jara, whose records were seized in Chile, became symbols of resistance. At the same time, other exiled *nueva canción* groups such as Inti-Illimani and Quilapayun that were created by leftist middle-class university students introduced *nueva canción* music to international audiences (Cervantes and Saldaña 2015).

In their analysis of Ana Tijoux's work, Antonio Cervantes and Lilliana Patricia Saldaña outline parallels between her music and the music of Violetta Parra, who popularized indigenous instruments from the Andean highlands of Bolivia and Peru, and the lyrics of Victor Jara, who denounced the colonial legacies of race, class, and gender hierarchies. As Tijoux pointed out in an interview with *Tele Sur* published in 2016, Victor Jara opened

up »a box of a deep silence of injustice« that, according to her, still prevails today, which is why her aim is to »make a connection between fights for injustice in the world« (TeleSur 2016, 00:20 and 01:25). As a solo artist, Tijoux also uses Chilean musical instruments and defines herself as a musical descendant of Violetta Parra, whom she calls a rapper because »being a rapper means speaking your mind through poetry« (Cervantes and Saldaña, 2015).

Ana Tijoux thus answers the question of belonging in a Chilean context by linking her work as a hip-hop artist to the *nueva canción* movement, a connection that evokes both national and international dimensions. On a national level, such a connection refers to a specific time in Chilean history: the time before the dictatorship of general Augusto Pinochet. As *nueva canción* artists became symbols of resistance outside of Chile during the Chilean exile period, Tijoux also refers to an international level as well as her own experience of exile by mentioning them as role models for her music. Here, the question of national belonging is answered through popular music, as hip-hop culture provides Tijoux with a platform to claim belonging in Chile. She is no longer a *retornado*, that is, a potentially estranged newcomer, but a Chilean artist. Hip-hop culture enables her to claim belonging in a Chilean context by referring to a Chilean past.

Belonging to a Chilean and transnational present

In her work as a hip-hop artist, Tijoux also sets out to make current issues of marginalization and exclusion visible on a national and transnational level. Such issues become especially apparent in three of her songs released after 2010: »Shock« from the 2011 album *La Bala* and »Antipatriarca« and »Somos Sur« from the 2014 album *Vengo*. The album *La Bala* was her first solo album published after the international success of *1977*. It features the song »Shock,« which was released as a single and for which she recorded a video.⁹ According to Tijoux, the video was intended to be a »miniature documentary« of what was happening in Chile in 2011 as traditional student organizations started to protest inequalities

9 Nacional Records, »Ana Tijoux—Shock.«

in the education system (TelevisionetMusic 2014, 03:30). The students demanded the end of profit-making in higher education and a reform of the school system, which had not been reformed since 1990. The movement evolved into one of the biggest protest movements in the post-Pinochet era and set out to »challenge [...] the authoritarian character of political institutions, sharing similar goals with protests elsewhere around the world,« including radical economic and political democratization (Guzman-Concha 2012).

The video features students who had barricaded themselves inside their schools during the protests. In an interview with Televisionet Music in 2014, Tijoux calls their actions a »lesson for other Chileans in terms of how to organize« (TelevisionetMusic 2014, 03:55). The video is filmed entirely in black and white and shows barricades consisting of chairs, young people in corridors with masks over their mouths, as well as graffiti, banners, and other images used by the protesters. While her voice is audible throughout the video, the other participants perform the following lyrics:

Al son de un solo coro Marcharemos con el tono Con la convicción que basta de robo	To the sound of a single choir We will march in lockstep With the conviction that the theft has to stop
Tu estado de control Tu trono podrido de oro Tu política y tu riqueza Y tu Tesoro, no La hora sonó, la hora sonó	Your state of control Your rotten golden throne Your politics and your wealth And your treasure, no The time has come, the time has come
No permitiremos más, más tu doctrina del shock	We will not allow any more, any more of your shock doctrine

Three years later, Tijoux released the album *Vengo* that features the song »Antipatriarca,« for which she also recorded a video.¹⁰ In its lyrics she defines the concept of »Antipatriarca,« that is, anti-patriarchy, as follows:

Pero no voy a ser la que obedece porque mi cuerpo me pertenece	But I won't be the one who obeys because my body belongs to me
Yo decido de mi tiempo como quiero y donde quiero	I use my time how I want to and where I want to
Independiente yo nací, independiente decidí	I was born independent and I decided independently that
Yo no camino detrás de ti, yo camino de la par aquí	I do not walk behind you, I walk alongside you
Tu no me vas a humillar, tu no me vas a gritar	You will not humiliate me, you will not yell at me
Tu no me vas someter tu no me vas a golpear	You will not subjugate me, you will not hit me
Tu no me vas denigrar, tu no me vas obligar	You will not denigrate me, you will not force me
Tu no me vas a silenciar tu no me vas a callar	You will not silence me, you will not shut me up
No sumisa ni obediente Mujer fuerte insurgente Independiente y valiente Romper las cadenas de lo indiferente	Neither submissive nor obedient Strong, rebellious woman Independent and brave Breaking the chains of indifference
No pasiva ni oprimida Mujer linda que das vida Emancipada en autonomía Antipatriarca y alegría A liberar....	Neither passive nor oppressed Beautiful woman who gives life Emancipated in autonomy Anti-patriarchy and happiness Let's liberate...

10 Nacional Records, »Ana Tijoux—Antipatriarca.«

In this excerpt, Tijoux describes a woman who will not be silenced in her criticism of oppression and indifference. The video that accompanies the song features women in different geographical locations performing the lyrics. Once again, Tijoux does not place herself in the spotlight as an individual artist, but rather depicts herself surrounded by other like-minded individuals whose experience of marginalization she makes audible and visible through the song.

A similar approach is used in the lyrics and video of the song »Somos Sur« (We Are the South), a collaboration with UK-Palestinian hip-hop artist Shadia Mansour featured on the same album.¹¹

Tu nos dices que debemos sentarnos, Pero las ideas solo pueden levantarnos	You tell us to sit down, But the ideas can only lift us up
Caminar, recorrer, no rendirse ni retroceder,	Walking, ranging, not surrendering or retreating,
Ver, aprender como esponja absorbe	Seeing, learning by absorbing like a sponge
Nadie sobra, todos faltan, todos suman	Nobody is left, everyone is missing, everyone adds up
Todos para todos, todo para nosotros	Everyone for everyone, everything for us
Soñamos en grande que se caiga el imperio	We dream big that the empire will fall
Lo gritamos alto, no queda mas remedio	We shout it loud, there is no remedy left
Esto no es utopía, es alegre rebeldía	This is not utopia, it is a joyful rebellion
Del baile de los que sobran, de la danza tuya y mía,	Of the dance of those who are left, of a dance that is yours and mine,
Levantarnos para decir »ya basta«	Standing up to say »enough is enough«

11 Nacional Records, »Ana Tijoux—Somos Sur (feat. Shadia Mansour).«

Ni África, ni América Latina se subasta,	Neither Africa nor Latin America is auctioned,
Con barro, con casco, con lápiz, zapatear el fiasco	With mud, with a helmet, with a pencil, pounding the fiasco
Provocar un social terremoto en este charco.	Provoking a social earthquake in this pond. ¹²
Todos los callados (todos), Todos los omitidos (todos), Todos los invisibles (todos), Todos, to, to, todos,	Everyone who is quiet (everyone), Everyone who is left out (everyone), Everyone who is invisible (everyone), Everyone, everyone, everyone, everyone.
Nigeria, Bolivia, Chile, Angola, Puerto Rico y Tunisia, Algeria, Venezuela, Guatemala, Nicaragua, Mozambique, Costa Rica, Camerún, Congo, Cuba, Somalia, México, República Dominicana, Tanzania,	Nigeria, Bolivia, Chile, Angola, Puerto Rico and Tunisia, Algeria, Venezuela, Guatemala, Nicaragua, Mozambique, Costa Rica, Cameroon, Congo, Cuba, Somalia, Mexico, Dominican Republic, Tanzania,
Fuera yanquis de América latina, franceses, ingleses y holandeses, yo te quiero libre Palestina.	Out with the Yankees from Latin America, French, English and Dutch, I want you freed, Palestine.

This excerpt voices the historical experience of marginalized and colonized individuals in the Global South. There are numerous historical references to European colonialism (by France, England and Holland), the exploitation of the Global South, as well as the political and economic interference of the United States in Latin America during the twentieth century. These latter issues are famously addressed in Eduardo Galeano's book »The Open Veins of Latin America,« which Tijoux mentions as an inspiration for the album *Vengo* in an interview with Democracy Now in 2014 (04:50).

In a national context, Tijoux thus also answers the question of belonging by using hip-hop culture as a platform to make the experience of

12 »Pond« is here probably referring to the Atlantic Ocean.

marginalized groups and individuals in general and the gendered body in particular audible and visible. Thereby she once again creates a connection to the work of *nueva canción* artists who also set out to critique marginalization and oppression on a global scale. The *nueva canción* movement itself has been studied as a platform used by different artists to unite the peoples of South and Central America in an anti-capitalist critique (Tomas Serna 1992; McFarland 2017). In Tijoux's case, this unity is based on a narrative that includes remembering the *nueva canción* movement of the 1960s and, at the same time, the shared experience of being colonized and marginalized.

However, it must be said that Tijoux releases these songs and stresses such connections at a specific historical moment, a moment that is more vulnerable to such critique. In the immediate aftermath of the 1990 elections, as Patricio Aylwin Azócar became the first democratically elected president since 1970, it was almost impossible to criticize the Pinochet regime as the elections did not bring an end to military influence on Chilean politics (Sjöqvist and Palmgren 1990, 20). Different generals kept threatening to take over the government throughout the 1990s, and Pinochet remained in his position as commander-in-chief of the military until 1998 (Sorensen 2011, 3). In such a political climate, media outlets did not dare to be openly critical of the regime, especially since Pinochet had been granted immunity for all crimes committed between 1973 and 1978. As a result, the media rarely mentioned the regime or provided a platform for artists who criticized the government, and if they did, they only discussed it in hushed tones. However, since Pinochet's death in 2006 and the communications revolution of the Internet, it has become easier to criticize both the regime and the Chilean government.

Gender and hip-hop culture

Ana Tijoux became an internationally known artist in the wake of the release of her 2009 album and eponymous single *1977*. The song was featured in the popular US television series *Breaking Bad* and instantly became a huge success, thereby introducing her to an international audience. As the media attempted to describe her music to this international

audience, she was often compared to other female artists who had given their work a socio-critical tone, such as US rapper Lauryn Hill or Spanish rapper Mala Rodriguez. In 2014, an article in the *New York Times* called her »South America's answer to Lauryn Hill.«¹³ Ana received invitations to perform at music festivals in the United States and other countries and was interviewed by media outlets such as Democracy Now (2014). In all of these publications and interviews, Tijoux both identified herself and was identified as an outspoken and »political« Chilean artist who was initially very reluctant to travel to the United States due to the country's political and economic interference in Latin America in general, and its involvement in the coup d'état in Chile in 1973 in particular (Blastro2 2012, 01:40).

In these interviews, Tijoux does not specifically define herself as a hip-hop artist nor discuss why she, as a non-US artist has a place in hip-hop culture, nor even mention that the culture originated in the United States. Instead, she is outspokenly critical of US policy. Tijoux also resists being compared to other female artists such as Lauryn Hill or Mala Rodriguez, adding that hip-hop is not a form of youth culture, but »music of life« (Enlamakinita 2014, 03:40 and 04:28). Describing her individual style as a musician, she points to her own individual experience and claims that making an album is an assembly of conversations, experiences, and impressions (TelevisionetMusic 2014, 05:05). Her resistance against being compared to other artists can be seen as an attempt to create an individual, marketable artist identity that sets her apart from other internationally known artists. Her remarks on age and hip-hop can also be seen as a means to justify that she, as someone who was born as early as 1977, is working as a hip-hop artist (Fogarty 2012, 53).

In his 2001 study on Chilean hip-hop, Rainer Quitzow claimed that Tijoux lacked a specific connection to the hip-hop community, which he saw as

13 Jon Pareles, »A Beating Heart, a Social Conscience and a Deluge of Ideas,« *New York Times*, Mar. 16, 2014, <https://www.nytimes.com/2014/03/16/arts/music/new-music-by-ana-tijoux-tunde-olaniran-and-the-bad-plus.html>.

evidence of »how, in a world influenced by global communication and travel, the identification with specific cultural practices loses its importance« (Quitow 2001, 74). Studying Tijoux's work and her artist identity in terms of issues of belonging from the vantage point of 2018 however, allows for a different reading. Although, as discussed above, hip-hop culture provides a platform to voice her own and others' experience of marginalization, the male-dominated networks of mainstream hip-hop culture nevertheless evoke questions of belonging for female hip-hop artists (Rose 2014). Tijoux's answer to this question is to create a space that is located both within (making marginalization visible and defining herself as Chilean) and outside hip-hop culture.

Conclusion

Studying the artist identity and work of Ana Tijoux in terms of questions of belonging makes the continuing importance of both the nation and transnational connections visible as frames of reference. As exclusion and marginalization are experienced on a national level, questions of belonging are also evoked within national contexts. In both interviews and her lyrics, Tijoux claims that her experience of exclusion and marginalization in France and Chile prompted her to become a hip-hop artist. Her subsequent attempts to claim belonging in a Chilean context by creating a connection to a specific time in Chilean history, the time before the Pinochet regime, and referring to *nueva canción* artists such as Violetta Parra and Victor Jara, also attests to the importance of a national framework. Claiming continuity with the socio-critical tone of the *nueva canción* movement, Tijoux also sets out to criticize contemporary Chilean politics through her work. Such attempts must be understood within a specific historical context, since outspoken criticism of the Chilean government could not be voiced in mainstream media following the 1989 elections. This historical context also includes the fact that Tijoux's work is published on the Internet, a platform unavailable to artists who attempted to criticize the government in the 1990s. Tijoux also negotiates belonging through her work by voicing a collective experience of marginalization and exclusion in her lyrics. Here, hip-hop culture becomes a platform on which artists »speak for« or represent the voiceless and marginalized (in

the Global South) through popular culture, and thus give voice to what Marco Antonio Cervantes and Liljana Saldaña call »a political and aesthetic expression against empire« (Cervantes and Saldaña 2015, 86; see also McFarland 2017)

Transnational connections, networks, and movements also play a pivotal role for the negotiation of belonging through popular culture. However, it is also important to take into account the types of transnational networks and positionalities from which questions of belonging are answered, as the term »transnational« is often used for people »who have the freedom, legally and economically, to move across borders and between cultures, doing business on their way« (Westwood and Phizacklea 2000, 2). Tijoux has a middle class background and a successful career as a musician that enables her to travel outside Chile on a regular basis, an opportunity that remains unattainable for a large number of Chileans. It can thus be argued that she speaks from a privileged position that, among other things, allows her to create and sustain connections outside of the male-dominated networks of hip-hop culture. Although male artists dominate hip-hop culture in Chile, Tijoux is one of the internationally most visible contemporary artists from Chile, which in turn provides her with a privileged position within the country's music scene.

Tijoux's artist identity also draws on several established images and definitions, such as the common assumption that hip-hop culture represents the experiences of marginalized individuals or groups, or the notion of representation and consciousness-raising, which has been used as a tool in various feminist movements (Phillips et al. 2005). On an international level, those aspects of Tijoux's work that are based on a socio-political critique of global capitalism and sexism also fit well into the description of an intellectual, often expressive Chilean or Latin-American political activist and revolutionary created in the aftermath of the 1973 coup d'état. The coup had a profound impact on the international community, as the human rights violations during the Pinochet regime led to the development of an international language of human rights and the creation of new rules and strategies at the level of the United Nations (Christiaens et al. 2014, 10).

Studying popular music in connection to identity and belonging thus entails focusing on the way in which artists create their work with respect to and within different transnational and national frameworks, as well as their multiple situated and contextualized positions and belongings. As sociologist Floya Anthias points out, it is important to relate the notion of belonging to the different locations and contexts »from which belongings are imagined and narrated« (Anthias 2008, 6). However, research on popular culture in general, and hip-hop culture in particular, should also take into account the highly gendered and commercial nature of popular culture that makes certain identities and belongings possible while excluding others. These aspects can ultimately be used to shed light on the connection between belonging and representation in popular culture.

References

- Amelina, Anna, Devrimsel D. Nergiz, Thomas Faist, and Nina Glick Schiller. 2012. *Beyond Methodological Nationalism: Research Methodologies for Cross-Border Studies*. New York: Routledge.
- Anthias, Floya. 2008. »Thinking Through the Lens of Translocational Positionality: An Intersectionality Frame for Understanding Identity and Belonging.« *Translocations: Migration and Social Change* 4 (1): 5–20.
- Beale Spencer, Margaret, Suzanne Fegley, Vinay Harpalani, and Gregory Seaton. 2004. »Understanding Hypermasculinity in Context: A Theory-Driven Analysis of Urban Adolescent Males' Coping Responses.« *Research in Human Development* 1 (4): 229–57.
- Berggren, Kalle. 2014. »Hip Hop Feminism in Sweden: Intersectionality, Feminist Critique and Female Masculinity.« *European Journal of Women's Studies* 21 (3): 233–50.
- Brah, Avtar. 2002. *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*. London: Routledge.
- Cervantes, Marco and Lilliana Saldaña. 2015. »Hip-hop and Nueva Canción as Decolonial Pedagogies of Epistemic Justice.« *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society* 4 (1): 84–108.
- Chang, Jeff. 2007. *Can't Stop Won't Stop: A History of the Hip-hop Generation*. London: Ebury.
- Christiaens, Kim, Magaly Rodriguez Garcia, and Idesbald Goddeeris. 2014. »A Global Perspective on the European Mobilization for Chile (1970s–1980s).« In *European Solidarity with Chile 1970s–1980s*, edited by Kim Christiaens, Magaly Rodriguez Garcia, and Idesbald Goddeeris, 7–46. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
- Constable, Pamela, and Arturo Valenzuelo. 1993. *A Nation of Enemies: Chile under Pinochet*. 2nd ed. New York: Norton.
- Cooper, Brittney C., Susana M. Morris, and Robin M. Boylorn, eds. 2017. *The Crunk Feminist Collection: Essays on Hip-hop Feminism*. New York: Feminist Press at the City University of New York.
- Durham, Aisha, Brittney C. Cooper, and Susana M. Morris. 2013. »The Stage Hip-Hop Feminism Built: A New Directions Essay.« *Signs* 38 (3): 721–37.

- Fogarty, Mary. 2012. »Each One Teach One: B-Boying and Ageing.« In *Ageing and Youth Cultures: Music, Style and Identity*, edited by Paul Hodgkinson and Andy Bennett, 53–65. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Foxley, Ana Maria. 1988. »Quilapayún, Inti Illimani, Illapu.« *Mensaje* 374:505-7.
- Guzman-Concha, Cesar. 2012. »The Students' Rebellion in Chile: Occupy Protest or Classic Social Movement?« *Social Movement Studies* 11 (3/4): 408–15.
- Hardy Raskovan, Clarisa. 1989. *La Ciudad Escindida—Los Problemas Nacionales y la Region Metropolitana*. Santiago: Sociedad Editora e Impresora Alborada S. A.
- hooks, bell. 2004. *We Real Cool—Black Men and Masculinity*. New York: Routledge.
- Johannsen, Igor. 2017. »Keepin' It Real: Arabic Rap and the Re-Creation of Hip Hop's Founding Myth.« *Middle East: Topics & Arguments* 7: 85–93.
- Kaya, Ayhan. 1997. »Constructing Diasporas: Turkish Hip-hop Youth in Berlin.« PhD thesis, University of Warwick. <http://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/36252/>.
- Kumpf, Terence. 2013. »Beyond Multiculturalism: The Transculturating Potential of Hip-hop in Germany.« In *Hip-hop in Europe, Cultural Identities and Transnational Flows*, edited by Sina A. Nitzsche and Walter Grünzweig, 207–26. Berlin: Lit.
- Kumarini, Silva. 2009. »Oh Give Me a Home: Diasporic Longings of Home and Belonging.« *Social Identities—Journal for the Study of Race, Nation and Culture* 15 (5): 693–706.
- Maxwell, Ian. 2001. »Sydney Style: Hip-Hop Down Under Comin' Up.« In *Global Noise: Rap and Hip-hop outside the USA*, edited by Tony Mitchell, 259–75. Middletown: Wesleyan University.
- McFarland, Pancho. 2008. *Chicano Rap: Gender and Violence in the Postindustrial Barrio*. Austin: University of Texas.
- . 2017. *Toward a Chican@ Hip Hop Anti-Colonialism*. London: Taylor and Francis.
- Minestrelli, Chiara. 2016. *Australian Indigenous Hip Hop the Politics of Culture, Identity, and Spirituality*. New York: Routledge.
- Mitchell, Tony. 2001. »Introduction—Another Root—Hip-Hop Outside the USA.« In *Global Noise: Rap and Hip-hop Outside the USA*, edited by Tony Mitchell, 1–38. Middletown: Wesleyan University.

- Nowicka, Magdalena, and Anna Cieslik. 2014. »Beyond Methodological Nationalism in Insider Research with Migrants.« *Migration Studies* 1 (1): 1–15.
- Ohadike, Don C. 2007. *Sacred Drums of Liberation: Religions and Music of Resistance in Africa and the Diaspora*. Trenton: Africa World.
- Osumare, Halifu. 2007. *The Africanist Aesthetic in Global Hip Hop: Power Moves*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Perry, Marc D. 2008. »Global Black Self-Fashionings: Hip-hop as Diasporic Space.« *Identities* 15 (6): 635–64.
- Phillips, Layli, Kerri Reddick-Morgan, and Dionne Patricia Stephens. 2005. »Oppositional Consciousness within an Oppositional Realm: The Case of Feminism and Womanism in Rap and Hip Hop, 1976–2004.« *The Journal of African American History* 90 (3): 253–77.
- Pough, Gwendolyn. 2007. »What It Do, Shorty? Women, Hip-Hop, and a Feminist Agenda.« *Black Women, Gender and Families* 1 (2): 78–79.
- Pough, Gwendolyn, Mark Anthony Neal, and Joan Morgan, eds. 2007. *Home Girls, Make Some Noise: Hip-hop Feminism Anthology*. Mira Loma: Parker.
- Quitow, Rainer. 2001. »Hip Hop in Chile: Far from NYC or Lejos del Centro.« BA honors thesis, Center for Metropolitan Studies, New York University.
- Rose, Tricia. 2008. *The Hip Hop Wars: What We Talk about When We Talk about Hip Hop and Why It Matters*. New York: Basic Civitas.
- . 2014. Keynote held at the Critical Hip-hop Studies Symposium, University of Turku, Finland, October 17.
- Salvatierra Diéz, Carmen. 2016. »Feminismos Activistas en el Rap Latinoamericano: Mare (Advertencia Lírica) y Caye Cayejera.« *Ambigua, Revista de Investigaciones Sobre Género y Estudios Culturales* 3:39–57.
- Sernhede, Ove, and Johan Söderman. 2010. *Planet Hiphop: Om Hiphop Som Folkbildning och Social Mobilisering*. Malmö: Liber.
- Sjöqvist, Börje, and Lars Palmgren. 1990. *Att fly från Chile—och att återvändra: Två rapporter*. Santiago: IPREHUD (International Projects for Research on Human Development).

- Spady, James. 2013. »Mapping and Re-Membering Hip Hop History, Hiphopography and African Diasporic History.« *Western Journal of Black Studies* 37 (2): 126–57.
- Speers, Laura. 2017. *Hip-Hop Authenticity and the London Scene: Living Out Authenticity in Popular Music*. London: Routledge.
- Svensson, Anna. 2009. »El Exilio Latinoamericano en Suecia: Literatura y Estudios.« In *Migrations and Connections: Latin America and Europe in the Modern World: Papers of the Fifty-fourth Annual Meeting of the Seminar on the Acquisition of Latin American Library Materials; Berlin, Germany, July 3–8, 2009*, edited by Pamela M. Graham, pages 11–125. New Orleans: SALALM.
- Sorensen, Kristin. 2011. »Chilean Historical Memory, Media, and Discourses of Human Rights.« In *Global Memoryscapes, Contesting Remembrance in a Transnational Age*, edited by Kendall R. Phillips and Mitchell G. Reyes, 159–72. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama.
- Torres Alvarado, Rodrigo. 2004. »Cantar la Diferencia: Violeta Parra y la Canción Chilena.« *Revista Musical Chilena* (201): 53–73.
- Tumas Serna, Jane. 1992. »The Nueva Canción Movement and Its Mass-Mediated Performance Context.« *Latin American Music Review/Revista de Música Latinoamericana* 2:139–57.
- Vasiley, George. 2018. »Methodological Nationalism and the Politics of History Writing: How Imaginary Scholarship Perpetuates the Nation.« *Nations and Nationalism* (early view). First published online June 5, 2018. <https://doi.org/10.1111/nana.12432>.
- Westwood, Sallie, and Annie Phizacklea. 2000. *Trans-nationalism and the Politics of Belonging*. London: Routledge.
- Wright, Thomas C., and Rody Oñate. 1998. *Flight From Chile: Voices of Exile*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico.

Dr. Susan Lindholm, Global Political Studies, Faculty of Culture and Society,
Malmö University: susan.lindholm@mau.se.

From a body to a story

Transformative narratives in Swedish football

Katarzyna Herd

Introduction

The pitch. This is the core of the process, 90 minutes of a game, creating history ad hoc, constantly, quickly, and sometimes painfully. 22 players run and fight over the ball, for their careers, respect, and fame. Supporters often see themselves as the most important participants in the football experience, but one needs players. The emphasis in the media has often been on the football superstars, described as modern heroes with a cult surrounding them (see, e.g., Digance and Toohey 2011). At the same time, critical voices have pointed out how football is increasingly detached from its fans and focused on financial advantages and imported stars. Yet football fans demonstrate different techniques of reclaiming the power over football and players. The focus of this article is the appropriation of the physicality of players. Their bodies are not only physical. If spectators are to make a meaningful emotional connection with players, a kind of transformation needs to happen that makes flesh and blood into a mythical object that can be used later. Such processes are most visible when a healthy organism undergoes a change and is not able to perform as required.

There are many different angles of investigation when it comes to physicality and athletic performance in sports with numerous publications in the fields of medicine and sport science.¹ The perspectives chosen here focus on the body as an object of cultural meaning and a tool for creating

1 A journal entitled *Science and Medicine in Football* (Taylor & Francis Online) is dedicated exclusively to these issues: <http://www.tandfonline.com/toc/rsmf20/current>.

narratives. The questions, then, are: how are bodies used? What kinds of transformation take place? What kinds of narrative are created there?

Methods and material

The core of this article is based on three stories where players' bodies failed and they were not able to perform physically, yet they were useful for supporters in terms of producing narratives that would strengthen their positions. The cases come from the highest Swedish football league called Allsvenskan and are based on players called Guillermo Molins, Erik Israelsson, and Ivan Turina. The three cases presented here oscillate around the issues of cultural meanings attached to bodily abilities. In all these examples, physicality, stamina, and fragility of bodies are crucial elements of specific narratives. All three players were active in and employed by two clubs from Stockholm—AIK and Hammarby IF—and one club from southern Sweden—Malmö FF (MFF).

The material includes interviews, observations, newspaper articles, and internet ethnography (netnography). The material from interviews and observations was transcribed, translated to English, and coded through searches on themes and connections. Ethnographic interviews constitute one of the most popular and established methods in quantitative studies, including ethnology (Davies 2008, 107). The same can be said about participant observations, the »archetypal form of research employed by ethnographers« (Davies 2008, 77). Those two methods tend to be intertwined, especially in the ethnologic research concerning regular participants within the cultural sphere close to the researcher. Interviews were contextualized as they were also instances of observations, and the knowledge was produced in a specific time and space within the realm of conversation between an interviewer and an interviewee (Malinowski 1935, 37–52; Geertz 1983, 58; Davies 2008, 108).

The data was collected by the researcher between 2012 and 2018. The interviews were semi-structured and conducted in person except for one internet chat with an informant referred to as Oskar, who spontaneously

volunteered to share his thoughts about one player.² The plethora of sources contribute to the methodological bricolage, which is a strong tradition in conducting ethnographic research and characteristic of ethnology as an academic discipline (Ehn and Löfgren 2001, 147).

Norwegian sociologist Axel Tjora pointed out that methodological and analytical approaches in ethnography-driven disciplines are connected throughout research projects and could be presented as a »gradual-deductive inductive method« (2017, 18–19). The model explains that going from material toward a theory (inductive) and from a theoretical standpoint to approaching the material (deductive) push the analysis simultaneously as the researcher reevaluates the theoretical approach with the growing material while at the same time, a new theoretical take pushes for new approaches to obtaining the material (Tjora 2017, 18). Swedish ethnologists Billy Ehn and Orvar Löfgren stressed the importance of surprises in the field and unexpected encounters that drive the analysis forward (1996, 134).

Theoretical perspectives

The main theoretical perspectives that help to unpack how physicality is transformed into narratives include sense-making and textuality/intertextuality. Intertextuality is a term used in linguistic studies and folkloristics. It refers to fluidity and influences that the different sources have on each other. Instead of texts being closed and self-sufficient wholes, they emerge as an assemblage of previous texts, creating a mosaic of meanings (Asplund Ingemark 2004, 32; Worton and Still 1990, 1–2). Understanding a text means awareness of different influences on it, different texts merging into one. This means that symbols and elements from various sources create a bricolage of meanings. The transformation from physicality to narratives could be viewed through a concept of posthumanist performativity as discussed by feminist and theoretical physicist Karen Barad (2003). It

2 The names of the informants were changed for ethical reasons. Numerous issues with respect to ethics, access, gender, or class relations could be discussed from a methodological perspective. Charlotte Aull Davies (2008) provides a comprehensive discussion of ethnographic methods in her book *Reflexive Ethnography*.

does not give all the power to words and instead stresses the importance of materiality and physical bodies. Bodies are active through discourses (Barad 2003).

Football is a game, and it does represent a different set of logic. It is heterotopic, which means that one must understand and accept its specific rules (Herd 2017). The French anthropologist and ethnologist Christian Bromberger, while conducting fieldwork among French clubs and groups of supporters, analyzed his material in terms of rituals and pointed out the ritualistic character a football match had without being a kind of religion (1995). He further pointed out that one element is missing that would classify matches as religious rituals, »namely the belief in the active presence of supernatural creatures or forces, which constitute the backbone of religious rituals« (1995, 309). I would further suggest that the utilitarian character, belief in one's abilities, established rites and rituals, and a specific set of rules that governs football would allow one to classify it as an example of a magical context (see Mauss 1972; Herd 2017). This claim, based on my previous work on football, serves as a background for approaching the position players have.

There is specific sense-making in football as participants must be able to understand its textualities and engage in the play. Producing sense is an analytical approach anchored in Susan Stewart's book *Nonsense*. Stewart states that social events can be »textual« because they depend on recognition and interpretation, and because they have a content that needs to be situated in a specific social context (Stewart 1989, 13). In other words, events can be read. Some socially constructed spaces such as football depend heavily on the interpretation and acceptance of sense and nonsense that appears there. Stewart's analysis of nonsense points to the complex ways of agreeing what makes sense. Some behavior during matches seems strange to onlookers not familiar with the context, yet once the participants agree on the rules and understand the context, the behavior starts to make sense.

Narratives help to understand the world and to construct it. Running players are not just agile bodies. Their abilities help to construct meaningful emotional connections that result in producing a social context with a

specific logic. And in turn, their stories become immortal narratives connected to clubs and supporters.³

War heroes, gods, mortals—Shape-shifting on the pitch

For more than 100 years men (and women)⁴ have run on green pitches all over the world. Because of the complicated labor market, selling and buying footballers contributed to attitudes toward them. One of my interviewees said that players are »only tools« used to bring titles to their employers (interview with Jan, Malmö, September 2012).⁵ Such evaluations are common, with supporters repetitively saying that one cannot trust players. Yet the meaning of this exercise in skill, stamina, and teamwork has gone beyond the physical abilities of human bodies. Players mean more than their muscles that work for the glory of the clubs. It is possible for fans to establish emotional connections with players who stay in clubs for just half a year, or those who would hardly be described as major stars.

Supporters express a very pragmatic approach toward players. They consider them ready-to-use footballers in all possible ways, including transforming them into stories and symbols. Goals and victory celebrations provide desirable material, but so do dramatic instances of pain and suffering. Footballers take risks with their bodies, and they are often

3 It should be noted that narratives are gendered and that a certain idea of masculinity is transmitted through them (see, for example, Hourihan 1997, 15). This perspective is explored in my ongoing PhD project.

4 The focus of my research is on men's football and men's clubs, and although the discussion of both masculinity and femininity in this context is valid, the broader gender perspective is not examined here as the main point of the article is story-making as a process. Academic publications about women's football in Sweden include Mattias Melkersson's PhD thesis (2017) about organizational aspects of women's football clubs and a study of migration patterns of female players moving to Scandinavia conducted by Botelho and Agergaard (2011).

5 The exact date of the interview was unfortunately not recorded. The names of informants were changed for ethical reasons.

injured and thus not able to participate in games per se. Yet narratives arise from this fact that transform wounded bodies into meaningful stories. As Donna Haraway put it, one could see bodies »as maps of power and identity« (Haraway 1990, 222). Physicality goes beyond its organic functions and marks not only people, but also spaces occupied by bodies. And when a body stops functioning, when it becomes useless in one way, it offers itself as a different sort of platform. A wounded body lends itself to interpretations, as its owner cannot use it to perform.

A footballer is located in a specific sociocultural space that interacts with him. Several scholars have called for more grounded research on sports that would include the geographical, political, and historical context as well (Bale and Philo 1998; Eichberg 1998; Brabazon 2006). Players' agility and stamina translate not only into goals and match statistics, but also into emotional involvement between different actors.

Modern football is a result of industrialization (Eichberg 1998, 48) and commodification (Giulianotti 2002, 2005; Tapp and Clowes 2002). Special places were produced in order to exercise bodies. Stadia and arenas facilitate their own social microclimates. Because these places are separated by design from everyday life, they become heterotopic and allow their participants to engage in behavior that could not be exercised anywhere else. This applies to players who are paid heavily for being good at materializing the physical ideal. Bodies of players became exercised, disciplined, and separated from the rest of the society as amateur activity attracted more money and became more serious, paving the way for professionalization (Eichberg 1998, 13). As the game became more professionalized, it also became more clinical, based on stamina only, and cleansed of social relevance that would go beyond individual physical capacities. Before professionalization,⁶ players were more visible in their communities; they worked, studied, had contact with different strata of

6 Professionalization of football took place later than in other European leagues. The rule that football was an amateur sport was abolished in Sweden in 1967, and Swedish players had gone abroad to play professionally decades before that (Sund 2008, 52–61).

society. Former players mourn the development that has placed modern footballers, in their opinion, outside of so-called normal working life (interviews with Sune, Malmö, November 12, 2014, and Jesper, Malmö, November 25, 2014).

The commodification of football could characterize the very businesslike relationship between clubs and supporters and turn them into passive consumers. However, it has been pointed out that »football is »more than a business,« and this implies that the usual rules of producer-consumer relations do not apply so strictly« (Kennedy and Kennedy 2010, 186). One of the key reasons why the normal business pattern does not work is the realization that »supporters continue to »consume« football even when the »commodity« proves to be an »unsatisfactory« or unsuccessful one« (Kennedy and Kennedy 2010, 186). Further, supporters engage in producing the experience they consume simultaneously. What one gets for money might be a victory or a trophy, but it can also be, for instance, emotional engagement and different cultural capitals (Skeggs 2004). Bodies carry a certain sort of capital as well, and they can be used to construct a cultural framework or lend themselves to exemplify ideas (Bourdieu 1984; Skeggs 2004, 16). Bodies can acquire that function, especially when clubs strip supporters of influence, limiting the possibilities of their involvement.

Jean Baudrillard painted a bleak picture of the development of modern sports, isolated and clinical, without spectators, with television providing such detailed viewing that it could be described as pornographic (Baudrillard 1990). As a result, sports would become an exercise based on power, without any real social meaning. German sports historian Henning Eichberg argued that the kind of physical control and »the subjecting of the body to rigid temporal and spatial disciplines« would result in stripping away »ambiguity, play, willfulness, humor from the sporting body culture« (Eichberg 1998, 13). Fans are creative in finding ways to connect to seasonal players and fuel social processes that allow supporters to create meaningful narratives. The following stories include three footballers who actively played in the highest Swedish league—Allsvenskan—in different clubs, with various degrees of success. Because

of singular events connected to their physicality, these three players became more visible, remembered, and talked about. The materiality of their bodies was non-discursive, but activated discourses visible in narratives (Barad 2003, 809).

Guillermo Molins—»I was a hero. Now I am nothing.«

Guillermo Molins is a player from southern Sweden with Uruguayan roots. After playing for some years for Malmö FF,⁷ he moved to Belgium. He injured his knee when he was playing there, and spent a long time recovering. Then he moved back to Malmö. He was welcomed as a returning hero, and was doing very well in the season of 2014, when he injured his other knee. During an interview, he said:

Molins: And when I was 16, Malmö called me and said »we would like to bring you here for a trial.« And I came and I was very nervous, you know all the stars that I saw on TV and they were standing one meter from me. And yeah, they liked me and I came here. Since then I've played here except for two years when I played in Belgium.

Interviewer: How was it in Belgium?

Molins: Very bad. The first game I broke my knee, and now I broke my other knee. So it's something you feel. Now if I go back in time, if I can jump a little bit, three months ago, I was the biggest hero in Malmö, now I feel like a nobody, because I cannot perform, you understand? It's six to nine months. Next season April I will be good again (Malmö, October 30, 2014).

The interview was recorded in late October 2014. In late April 2015, I witnessed Molins enter the pitch for the first time after the accident. Fans were cheering; he was their captain, coming back for glory.⁸ He

7 Malmö FF (MFF) is the most successful Swedish club; it secured its 20th national league title in 2017: <https://www.allsvenskan.se/tabell/>.

8 Match observations, MFF-Djurgårdens IF, Malmö, June 7, 2015.

was referred to as »king« or »captain.«⁹ A group of supporters made special t-shirts with his name on and he received one, too. When Molins came back from Belgium, it was the story of a returning hero, and such narratives are abundant throughout the history of Western Europe (Berger 2013). This would have been a simple enough story of a returning son who would bring hail and glory to his mother club and to the fans.

Captain Molins never really recovered, and in 2016, when his contract expired, MFF decided to let him go. Some fans hoped he would be offered a new contract, but he was just not considered to be in sufficiently good shape, and there was not enough empathy capital. Malmö FF became a club for tough winners, with two runs in the Champions League. They had enough financial resources to buy good quality, scoring players. They did not need an injured, struggling star. However, supporters were attracted to the symbolic value that he represented. In 2017 I encountered an individual in a pub wearing a shirt featuring Molins. When I asked if I could take a photo, we had a brief chat. The person wearing the shirt mentioned that the former captain was still important for the club.

9 During the match I refer to a group of supporters had a banner saying »Now Allsvenskan [the highest Swedish league, KH] begins to shake/Captain Molins is coming back«. There was a small sign saying »Kung Molins«—King Molins, which was visible during several matches. The shirts were designed by a group of supporters and resembled the design of Captain America's shield with text »Guillermo Molins—Captain Malmö.« I witnessed them being distributed during a match between MFF and Helsingborgs IF Malmö on Sep. 21, 2014.



Fig. 1: Photo taken by Katarzyna Herd in a pub in Malmö in July 2017.

Molins had a special connection with the fans. In the interview he told this story:

But in the beginning I didn't like them (fans) because they did not like me. Because after one game, when I was young, we went to the fans, and they started booing us, and as I said I'm a bit of South American, so I reacted by doing this (shows his middle finger). It became a very big thing for 2 years, every time I got the ball there

was (whistles) and then it changed, and now I can say, without being cocky, that I'm the favorite player for most fans. So the fans are incredible and I'm enjoying playing for them. (Malmö, October 30, 2014)

The MFF striker was aware of the connection he had forged, and the difficulties in the beginning contributed into forging an emotional link that then developed. Molins was strong and responsive, and allowed the fans to come close, both with negative and positive feelings, as he recounted in the interview. When his knee was injured, his supporters stayed true and hopeful.¹⁰ But his contract was not extended and the injured hero left the club. Molins left behind a rich story and a great deal of affection that contributed to retaining his image. His journey and pain fit into a mold of a heroic myth. A hero, broadly speaking, encounters difficulties on his path and overcomes his weaknesses when becoming a hero, as the protagonists in folktales teach us (Hourihan 1997). Fans used Molins's story to compose a narrative that connected him to them through continuing to wear the shirts and sing the chants. At the same time, Molins's body was constructed *through the discourse* applied, making a relational connection between a material body and a narrative (Barad 2003, 814).

The story is about physical suffering and noble defeat. Molins is now gone, but supporters still consider his image important. His story is based on his bodily abilities that are applied in a broader discourse; hence, it is a material-discursive practice that is used in producing power, in this case granting power to fans using it (Barad 2003, 810). When Molins returned to MFF, he was a warrior hungry for success, and a figure of a prodigal son returning to his home club.¹¹ When he was recovering, fans stayed true to him, pronouncing him their captain although other players

10 The chant about him was sung on numerous occasions.

11 Two articles in a local newspaper *Sydsvenskan* discussed his return and his difficult time in the Belgian club Anderlecht: Niklas Wihlborg, »Molins tillbaka i MFF,« Aug. 11, 2013, <https://www.sydsvenskan.se/2013-08-11/molins-tillbaka-i-mff>; Marie Carlsson, »Molins tillbaka i MFF,« Aug. 14, 2013, <https://www.sydsvenskan.se/2013-08-14/molins-tillbaka-i-mff>.

took the role. When he returned to the pitch, he was declared a returning hero who battled his weaknesses, and a strong message about his return was written on a banner by fans.¹² This is a mark of a hero who needs to go through a *rite of passage* to be named one (van Gennep 1960 (1909)). Heroes need to have a journey (Hourihan 1997). When he was in danger of not getting a new contract, some repeatedly called for keeping him in the club. When he left, supporters continued to stress how important he was for the club.¹³

Yet something has been lost. The group of supporters that in 2017 called for his importance was not big, the voices demanding a new contract for him were not convincing to the club's management. He went through hell (a severe knee injury) and survived. Should one be tempted to draw a parallel, it would be the figure of a mythical hero journeying to hell and back that bears some resemblance.¹⁴ Molins's accident caused him months of painful waiting and rehabilitation. He became a motif of a hurt, suffering captain. Yet, somehow unfortunately, he got better. He could not be fixed in time and space. Molins left the club, although unwillingly. His grand return almost happened. Just not quite. His recovery disturbed the narrative and forced fans to establish him as an important figure, albeit gone and slipping from the popular imagination, fading slowly, banners and shirts being less and less visible.¹⁵

12 Match observations, MFF-Djurgårdens IF, June 7, 2015.

13 The person whose shirt I photographed in a pub in Malmö engaged in a brief discussion about Molins. He said that explicitly that Molins »is still very important for the club« although he no longer played there.

14 This is a well-documented motif in different world mythologies, appearing for example in Greek, Nordic, and Japanese mythologies.

15 After Molins left Malmö, he started playing in China. He was contacted by a Swedish newspaper *Expressen* and in an emotional interview spoke about his respect for Malmö FF and the strong feelings that surrounded his transfer: Martin Hardenberger, »Molins talar ut: »Hade sålt bilen för att stanna i MFF,« Dec. 29, 2016, <https://www.expressen.se/kvallsposten/sport/molins-talar-ut-hade-salt-bilen-for-att-stanna-i-mff/>. Another newspaper, *Aftonbladet*, presented a rather emotional review of Molins's

Physical suffering contributed to transforming and making sense of Molins's story. As Stewart puts it, »manufacture of common sense and the transformations by which nonsense is made out of common sense belong to the same social universe« (1989, 7). People recognize a myth pattern when they see it happening; that is why we understand a fairy tale when we see one (Hourihan 1997, Berger 2013). Since fans take a pragmatic approach, they made Molins into a reusable figure. And although gone, he is still featured as a marker for connection between the fans and the club. Molins is still active and is in July 2018, after two years of playing in Greece, he came back to MFF, but he has not appeared in the main squad as yet (October 2018). His body though became a narrative that exists for MFF fans.

Erik Israelsson—»Let him die!!!«¹⁶

Another story connected to the performance of material bodies comes from Stockholm. During the 2015 season, there was a tense derby in the Swedish capital. Two clubs from Stockholm, *Almänna Idrottsklubben* (AIK) and *Hammarby IF*,¹⁷ played a derby match. A Hammarby player, Erik Israelsson, scored a leading goal for his team, and shortly afterward collided with an AIK player. The encounter left him unconscious, lying

negotiations for renewing the contract with Malmö FF, calling him »the supporters' darling«: Johan Flinck, »Molins på väg att lämna MFF,« June 3, 2016, <https://www.aftonbladet.se/sportbladet/fotboll/a/22939576@abse/molins-pa-vag-att-lamna-mff>.

- 16 The chant was reported by several newspapers, also online: Simon Bank, »Bank: Tusentals skrek: »Låt han dö; Fy fan,« *Aftonbladet*, Sep. 27 2015, <https://www.aftonbladet.se/sportbladet/kronikorer/bank/article21484102.ab>; Martin Petersson, »AIK fördömer ramsorna mot Israelsson: »Hål i huvudet,« *Fotbollskanalen*, Sep. 29, 2015, <https://www.fotbollskanalen.se/allsvenskan/aik-fordomer-ramsorna-mot-israelsson-hal-i-huvudet/>.
- 17 Both clubs are currently in the highest league, both have long histories (AIK was established in 1891, Hammarby in 1915) and a long history of rivalry on many levels, including the popularity and class factor. Hammarby won the league only once in 2001; AIK has won several titles, most recently in 2009.

on the pitch. The match was halted, and an ambulance was called. Amid general fear for the player's health and even life, a chant came, clearly audible, from AIK fans: »Låt han dö!«—Let him die! As Israelsson was taken away from the pitch, still unconscious, anger grew among Hammarby fans, and from the media, other clubs, and AIK's management as well.¹⁸

Such behavior—angry chants with violent or racist content—does occur in the football world. What some sport journalists considered outrageous in this case was not a small group of individuals that would scream such words, a wish of death, but thousands that joined in and appeared blind and deaf to the generally established social rhetoric of compassion, sportsmanship and fair play.¹⁹ What happened here?

Football allows for creating a heterotopia, a contemporary reality with its own logic and set of rules (Foucault 1967). A heterotopia means constructing a specific space that allows for reinterpretations of the acknowledged social structures that exist in the broader context. This contributes to behavior that would be highly questionable outside a stadium, yet is accepted during a match (Bromberger 1995). It can be offensive chants, but even showing emotions like grief openly. Some pointed out the general image of Stockholm clubs. AIK and Hammarby have a long history of contests and conflicts, with hooligan firms involved. On top of that, AIK as a club is sometimes referred to as anarchistic, outrageous, and provocative.²⁰ And with the clock ticking, fans did not want the game to be stopped. One can often see players falling and »filming,« simulating an injury to win some time.

18 Various Swedish newspapers picked up the story, including *Aftonbladet* (»Bank: Tusentals skrek«). The same newspaper published an official response from AIK's chairman Johan Segui, who condemned the chant: Andreas Käck, Per Bohman, and Kristoffer Bergström, »Det handlar om medmänsklighet,« Sep. 27, 2015, <https://www.aftonbladet.se/sportbladet/fotboll/sverige/allsvenskan/aik/article21484032.ab>.

19 Simon Bank, in a column published Sunday, Sep. 27, 2015 (»Bank: Tusentals skrek«).

20 Ibid.

The collapse of the wounded player somehow damaged the boundary between the acceptable and the taboo. Abusive chants are nothing new. In the stands, fans can scream that they hate players, referees, coaches, the police, other teams, the other team's supporters, other cities etc.²¹ It is unusual to wish death to the wounded opponent. Swedish football has had painful encounters with players passing away because of diseases, and two supporters were killed in football-related accidents.²² Even the highly emotional state of watching a team lose would not easily justify such behavior.

Israelsson's injury, his collapsing body, interacted with established discourses and triggered an action. The closed, heterotopic reality of a football match can accommodate various sets of logic and common sense. Susan Stewart writes about rules of a game:

Once the boundary of the game is established, it is kept intact until closure. Breaking the boundary of the game by running off, by throwing down one's bat or racket, or by not paying attention, is poor sportsmanship, just as any return to the »madness« of the real world was a traitorous gesture among the dadaists. (Stewart 1989, 91–92)

Being on the stands means participating in a game. That game has its specific rules and boundaries. By testing, contesting, and repeating certain behavior patterns, fans establish their own special logic, but it needs to be read, understood, and accepted by all parties. The chant »Let him die!« is known among Swedish supporters of different clubs and employed

21 Such incidents were observed during every match attended and cited in this article.

22 One was a supporter of IFK Göteborg who died in 2002 after a hooligan-related fight in Stockholm; Susanna Vidlund and Marcus Noterius, »Misshandlade fotbolls-supportern avled,« *Aftonbladet*, Aug. 2, 2002, <https://www.aftonbladet.se/nyheter/a/EoaeVa/misshandlade-fotbolls-supportern-avled>. The other supporter died (in what has been seen as an accident) in 2014 in Helsingborg; Marie Larsson, »Supporter död efter bråk i Helsingborg,« *Dagens Nyheter*, Mar. 30, 2014, <https://www.dn.se/nyheter/sverige/supporter-dod-efter-brak-i-helsingborg/>.

sporadically. Serious injuries do not happen often and the chant appears to mock simulating players rather than actually wish them death.

In the case of Israelsson, one could point out two ways in which the boundary was trespassed. First, the fans delivered a harsher statement than anticipated. They did not go with the flow of the match. A serious physical accident brought reality back to the stadium, a reality filled with institutionalized society in need of common empathy. AIK fans did not agree with that, they stayed on the other platform of sense-making, the heterotopic football reality. One can say that the rest of the stadium, and the media, failed to play along with the chanting fans, as they demanded a return to the world of the common sense while the game was still on, which manifested itself in the wide condemnation in the public sphere and in various media.²³ A material body activated a discourse of power (as fans clashed using symbolic violence) and Israelsson's immobile body became a discursive marker branding AIK supporters (Barad 2003).

The sense of common empathy in our society is in sharp contrast with a chant that would proclaim no value to Israelsson's life. His accident stopped the game and potentially hindered AIK from scoring. The hierarchy of values, of importance, became reversed. The effect could be described as irony, because it emphasizes the *common sense* present in everyday life. As Stewarts puts it:

Irony emphasizes the textual, the interpreted, and the cultural, rather than the natural, status of social interaction. Thus it may be seen as linked to other parodies, satires, and burlesques of the everyday world; the specific taking in and taking over of one text by another. [...] Realism and myth stand in a contiguous relation to everyday life. With irony that contiguity is split, made reflexive. (Stewart 1989, 20)

Such behavior as presented during a match in Stockholm provides a strong insight into both the common sense inside and outside the stadium,

23 See, for example, »Bank: Tusentals skrek,« *Aftonbladet*; »AIK fördömer ramsorna mot Israelsson,« *Fotbollskanalen*.

and the stark contrast that can exist between them. The same people can participate in both; most can read, interpret, and play by the rules. A very material, visible, serious physical injury brought the *real world* into the restricted, special football reality. Israelsson's story became an example of the interaction of the two, immortalized by the media and social media that provide a footprint for collective memory. It fixed Israelsson in the situation and in the collective memory (Assmann 1988; Halbwachs 1992).

Ivan Turina—»Ivaaaaan!!! Turinaaaa!!!«²⁴

Erik Israelsson's accident was serious, and many fans held their breath waiting for news about his health. He was able to continue his sports career and moved to a club in Holland in 2017.²⁵ His dramatic story became a freeze frame, lasting for a moment. Another player, Ivan Turina, suffered from heart failure and died in May 2013 while he employed by a team from Stockholm—AIK. Turina, a goalkeeper from Croatia, played in various clubs before coming to Sweden in 2010. After three years in AIK, he suddenly died in his sleep. The shock touched fans in many Swedish clubs.

There were spontaneous commemorations, flowers, and condolences. Supporters from other Stockholm clubs came to pay their respects. He enjoyed a modest international career, and he was moving toward the end of his time as a footballer, as he was already over 30. He was a popular figure, and supporters liked him and could relate to him, a theme that came up in many interviews (interview with Maria, Stockholm, March 5, 2015; telephone interview with Kristian, April 28, 2016). He was a foreign player who did not play for the club for a long time. He managed to show character and some heart. He seemed not only to understand supporters; he seemed to understand the character of the

24 This is the chant that supporters perform every match during the 27th minute.

25 Erik Karlsson, »Erik Israelsson klar för Zwolle,« *Aftonbladet*, Jan. 14, 2017, <https://www.aftonbladet.se/sportbladet/fotboll/a/kg6AX/erik-israelsson-klar-for-zwolle>.

club, which one supporter mentioned in a Facebook conversation (chat with Oskar, June 21, 2017). Exaggerated commemorations in the football context occurred in other countries, for example in a case of »usable soccer martyrs« in Egypt. Football-related riots that occurred there were connected to the Islamic view of martyrdom (Mielczarek 2016, 95–110). In that instance, religion played a strong role in producing an identity within a sport. In the Swedish case, the commemorative rituals were devoid of religious connotations as such, although performed within an established cultural frame of grieving. Moore and Myerhoff (1977, 24) demonstrated that »secular rituals« are used as »unquestionable« means of communication.

After Turina died, rites of different sorts appeared. Up to 2018, supporters have stopped their chants in the 27th minute of a match and shouted Turina's name together.²⁶ There have been banners and flags with his pictures, and t-shirts as well.²⁷ A small group of AIK fans go to his grave in Croatia every year.²⁸ The late goalkeeper disappeared physically from the club, but he has been reworked into a symbol that seems to be attaining a strong position among supporters. One of them, Oskar, gave this answer to a question about the importance of chanting Turina's name:

It is the supporters' way of showing that a hero is not forgotten. The chant contributes to the community, everyone was affected [by his death; KH] and still wants to show this. (Facebook chat with Oskar, June 21, 2017)

Oskar's words reflect that fans are aware of their own, somehow egoistic reasons for continuing to commemorate Turina. One could reflect here

26 Match observations AIK-MFF, Stockholm, May 29, 2017; match observations MFF-AIK, Malmö, Apr. 9, 2018.

27 Match observations AIK-MFF, Stockholm, May 29, 2017; match observations AIK-MFF, Malmö, Apr. 9, 2015; match observations AIK-Djurgårdens IF, Stockholm, Aug. 10, 2015

28 I explore the theme of the transnational character of his death in a different article which is currently under consideration for an anthology about transnational death.

on the process of grieving after a death in the community. Ethnographer and folklorist Arnold van Gennep stated that although at first glance, mourners would be preoccupied with rites of separation, it was the rites of transition that were particularly elaborated (van Gennep [1909] 1960, 146). Van Gennep concluded that the importance lay in reshaping the dead and his or her connection to the group, as well as the group itself. A transformation needed to happen. Arnold van Gennep wrote about the mourning group:

During mourning, the living mourners and the deceased constitute a special group, situated between the world of the living and the world of the dead, and how soon living individuals leave that group depends on the closeness of their relationship with the dead person. (van Gennep [1909] 1960, 147)

How would such a statement compare to the devotion fans show to Ivan Turina? Arnold van Gennep's quote was written in the early twentieth century, and his work considered what he himself called *semicivilized* societies. Fans have spent a lot of time and energy transforming Turina into a useful narrative. They are reluctant to end the mourning period. Their persistence in keeping the memory of Turina alive is striking. In the reality of the high speed of change, of players coming and going, it would be natural to let his memory fade. Being in charge of commemorating the late goalkeeper puts supporters closer to him as well.

The death occurred in a certain temporal context. Just a year before, AIK had lost its old stadium, which was hard for supporters to swallow.²⁹ This Stockholm club has not been successful either, finishing seasons without winning them. It is not unusual for clubs to be in trouble or to see footballers come and go. Then they play for other clubs, in different

29 Jens Lindqvist, »Här rivs Råsunda av en grävmaskin,« Nyheter24, Feb. 8, 2013, <https://nyheter24.se/sport/fotboll/allsvenskan/738327-har-rivs-rasunda-av-en-gravmaskin>. In one interview with two people working for AIK they were very bitter about the decision to close the arena (interview with Carl and David, Stockholm, Mar. 5, 2015). All the AIK supporters interviewed complained about it.

countries, say to the cameras that it is an honor and joy, and that the new club is the best thing that has happened to him. As one of my informants said, echoing several others, »You cannot trust players, they will disappoint you« (interview with Björn, Malmö, September 2012).³⁰ For devoted fans, players bought on a free market are not easy to relate to. One needs to remember that they are often loyal only to their careers. The death of a popular character, in a context of a club, does not happen often. Turina passed away as the goalkeeper, the spirit of AIK, the strong man protecting it, the favorite of the crowd. Had he moved to another club, he might have been respected but simply put aside in importance for his previous club.

Four years after the event, AIK supporters still shout Turina's name and still go to Croatia to pay their respects.³¹ They do not wish to let go. The narrative is kept alive from match to match, and a big Turina banner still travels with fans to away matches.³² He needed to disappear physically, his body needed to literally stop functioning, to make his position in the club permanent. And with staggering speed, Turina seems to be undergoing the process of transformation from communicative to cultural memory (Jan Assmann 1988; Aleida Assmann 2011), meaning that it is no longer about personal contact and communication, but involves official, institutionalized means to keep the memory alive. Although it has not been a long time since his death, he has already been raised to the ranks of a legend (match observations, 2015–16). Supporters, and the club, continue the commemoration.

His definitive and complete absence made it possible for him to fill the void with the much sought-after symbol of a dead hero. The failure of the body opened doors to creating narratives, and in the end immortality. The phenomenon described here was produced through various human and non-human elements that take effect together and trigger action

30 The exact date of the interview is unfortunately not recorded.

31 Pictures from pilgrimages to Turina's grave in Croatia appear on AIK's Facebook page.

32 Match observations MFF-AIK, Malmö, Oct. 23, 2017.

(Barad 2003, 817). This is, in the end, a story from long ago. A dead hero would be worshipped as a demigod after his departure from the mortal world (see Hourihan 1997; Berger 2013). Once dead, the absence would feed the myth, without the need to fear that the hero in question would do something stupid or inappropriate. Turina became the most productive symbol for AIK when he was no longer there.

Concluding remarks

In this context of football games, participants are granted agency to influence history writing of clubs and individual stories through matches. It is based on the common, contextual understanding of what is allowed and what is not, what makes sense and what does not, and potential meanings take form (Seitel 2012, 77). It depends on the audience's *reading skills* to comprehend events and processes, which then undergo an interpretation and transformation, resulting in various cultural exchanges. Christian Bromberger (1995, 295) remarked on a football crowd as being pragmatic in its approach, and not a seemingly irrational crowd:

Football fans are no different from anyone else, in that they are not ignorant fools, nor are they deluded by their passions to the point of being incapable of maintaining a critical distance vis-à-vis the world around them.

I interpret Bromberger's commentary as another emphasis of the specific logical arrangement that is possible in football. As a space somewhat outside of the everyday, football can facilitate behavior that might appear strange or erratic, yet does follow the rules that are acceptable within that context. As already mentioned, Bromberger noticed a difference between football rituals and religious rituals, but he did not classify football as an example of magic, which I claim is the case (see Herd 2017). The pragmatic use of players, as exemplified in this article, is one of the elements that point toward a magical interpretation of this context.

Many players are considered divas today, overpaid but not exactly overworked. Former players seem critical of professionalism; they question the approach as players have difficulties in connecting with broader

society.³³ All one needs from them, at first glance, is run, pass well, and score. The examples presented in this article show that a physical inability becomes rich cultural material within seconds, bringing forth both positive and negative connotations. The dynamics in football provide an account of how narratives constitute/contrast/contradict the common sense that structures society through active bodies that act even though immobile (Barad 2003). The reading skills of the participants are connected both to the contextuality of heterotopia of football, and to an intertextual meaning of different kinds of narratives and myth. The use of bodies in narration makes sense if both intertextuality and contextuality are in place.

In an essay about the functions of ritual killings, Walter Burkert ([1983] 1996, 67) made a comment about the function war could have:

It almost seems as though the aim of war is to gather dead warriors, just as the Aztecs waged war in order to take prisoners to use as sacrificial victims.

The analysis of the three examples presented suggests that Burkert's statement applies to the symbolic conflicts in the context of sports. Players are important when running on the pitch, but they can be even more important when unable to perform. Their physical actions are halted, but they lend their abilities to narratives that continue to linger around stadiums. The mechanism of creating connection is traced from bodily abilities, and more importantly disabilities, to story-building. Because supporters look for different ways to engage with their beloved clubs, they are quick to use any references available. Still, there is a power structure (Skeggs 2004, 2) that is maintained by the use of narratives and allows supporters to build a strong position that can influence the character of a club.

One does not have to be a star, one has to become meaningful and that is not just up to a player. That is why it is such a difficult thing to achieve. The negotiations, probing, and different applicability result in stories and narratives that are woven by all the parties involved. In football, a spectator

33 Interviews with Sune, Malmö, Nov. 12, 2014, and Jesper, Malmö, Nov. 25, 2014.

can become an actor, and fans claim emotional ownership of their clubs and consider themselves as important as the players. But they project their own passions onto the bodies of footballers. Jean Baudrillard remarked that the »naked body is an expressionless mask hiding each of the true natures. [...] the body only has meaning when it is marked, covered in inscriptions« (Baudrillard 1993, 105). Although the marking of players' bodies is only symbolic in the cases described, they do serve as blank canvases that can be used for different kinds of stories. Footballers are paid to play for a limited period of time. Supporters can play with the traces they leave behind for as long as they please. Once transformed into narratives, players can become immortal.

References

- Assmann, Aleida. 2011. *Cultural Memory and Western Civilization. Functions, Media, Archives*. Cambridge: Cambridge University.
- Assmann, Jan. 1988. »Collective Memory and Cultural Identity.« In *Kultur und Gedächtnis*, edited by Jan Assmann and Tonio Hölscher, 9–19. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Asplund Ingemark, Camilla. 2004. *The Genre of Trolls*. Åbo: Åbo Akademi University.
- Bale, John, and Philo, Chris. 1998. »Introduction: Henning Eichberg, Space, Identity and Body Culture.« In *Henning Eichberg: Body Cultures; Essays on Sport, Space and Identity*, edited by John Bale and Chris Philo, 3–21. London: Routledge.
- Baudrillard, Jean. 1990. *The Transparency of Evil: Essays on Extreme Phenomena*. Bath: Bath.
- . 1993. »The Body, or the Mass Grave of Signs.« In *Symbolic Exchange and Death*, 101–24. London: SAGE.
- Barad, Karen. 2003. »Posthumanist Performativity: Towards an Understanding of How Matter Comes to Matter.« *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 28 (3): 801–31. <https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/10.1086/3451>.
- Berger, Arthur Asa. 2013. *Media, Myth, and Society*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Botelho, Vera L., and Stine Agergaard. 2011. »Moving for the Love of the Game? International Migration of Female Footballers into Scandinavian Countries.« *Soccer & Society* 12 (6): 806–19. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/14660970.2011.609681>.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1984. *Distinction*. London: Routledge Classics.
- Brabazon, Tara. 2006. *Playing on the Periphery: Sport, Identity and Memory*. London: Routledge.
- Bromberger, Christian. 1995. »Football as World-View and as Ritual.« *French Cultural Studies* 6 (18), 293–311. <https://doi.org/10.1177/095715589500601803>.

- Burkert, Walter. (1983) 1996. »The Function and Transformation of Ritual Killing.« In *Readings in Ritual Studies*, edited by Roland L. Grimes, 62–71. Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall.
- Davies, Charlotte A. 2008. *Reflexive Ethnography*. New York: Routledge.
- Digance, Justine, and Kristine Toohey. 2011. »Pilgrimage to Fallen Gods from Olympia: The Cult of Sport Celebrities.« In »Religion and Celebrity,« edited by Carele M. Cusak. Special Issue, *Australian Religious Studies Review* 24 (3), 342–60. <https://openjournals.library.sydney.edu.au/index.php/ARSR>.
- Ehn, Billy, and Orvar Löfgren. 1996. *Vardagslivets etnologi: Reflektioner kring en kulturvetenskap*. Stockholm: Natur och Kultur.
- . 2001. *Kulturanalyser*. Malmö: Gleerups Utbildning AB.
- Eichberg, Henning. 1998. »The Enclosure of the Body: The Historical Relativity of »Health,« »Nature« and the Environment of Sport.« In Henning Eichberg, *Body Cultures: Essays on Sport, Space and Identity*, edited by John Bale and Chris Philo, 47–67. London: Routledge.
- Foucault, Michel. 1967. »Of Other Spaces: Heterotopias.« Manuscript, translated by Jay Miskowicz. <http://foucault.info/documents/heteroTopia/foucault.heteroTopia.en.html>.
- Giulianotti, Richard. 2002. »Supporters, Followers, Fans and Flaneurs: A Taxonomy of Spectator Identities in Football.« *Journal of Sport and Social Issues* 26 (1): 25–46. <http://jss.sagepub.com/content/26/1/25>.
- . 2005. »Sport Spectators and the Social Consequences of Commodification: Critical Perspectives from Scottish Football.« *Journal of Sport & Social Issues* 29 (4): 386–410. <http://jss.sagepub.com/content/29/4/386>.
- Halbwachs, Maurice. 1992. *On Collective Memory*. Chicago: The University of Chicago.
- Haraway, Donna. 1990. »A Manifesto for Cyborgs: Science, Technology, and Social Feminism in the 1980s.« In *Feminism/Postmodernism*, edited by Linda J. Nicholson, 190–233. New York: Routledge.
- Herd, Katarzyna. 2017. »Constructing Football through Magic: An Ethnographic Study of Football Supporters.« *Soccer & Society* 18 (7): 1045–57. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14660970.2015.1133415>.

- Hourihan, Margery. 1997. *Deconstructing the Hero: Literary Theory and Children's Literature*. London: Routledge.
- Kennedy, David, and Peter Kennedy. 2010. »Towards a Marxist Political Economy of Football Supporters.« *Capital & Class: SAGE Journals* 34 (2): 181–98. <http://cnc.sagepub.com/content/34/2/181>.
- Malinowski, Bronislaw. 1935. *Coral Gardens and Their Magic*. London: George Allen & Unwin United.
- Mauss, Marcel. 1972. *The General Theory of Magic*. New York: Routledge.
- Melkersson, Mattias. 2017. *Identities and Images in Football: A Case Study of Brands and the Organizational Settings in the Development of Scandinavian Women's Club Football*. Malmö: Bokförlaget idrottsforum.org.
- Mielczarek, Natalia. 2016. »A Useable Soccer Martyr: The Egyptian Ultras and Their Fight for Legitimacy.« In *Sport and Religion in the Twenty-First Century*, edited by Brad Schultz and Mary Lou Sheffer, 95–110. London: Lexington.
- Moore, Sally F., and Barbara G. Myerhoff. 1977. »Secular Ritual: Forms and Meanings.« Introduction to *Secular Ritual*, edited by Sally F. Moore and Barbara G. Myerhoff, 3–24. Assen: Van Gorcum.
- Seitel, Peter. 2012. »Three Aspects of Oral Textuality.« In *A Companion to Folklore*, edited by Regina F. Bendix and Galit Hasan-Rokem, 75–93. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Skeggs, Beverley. 2004. *Class, Self, Culture*. London: Taylor & Francis.
- Stewart, Susan. 1989. *Nonsense: Aspects of Intertextuality in Folklore and Literature*. London: John Hopkins.
- Sund, Bill. 2008. *Fotbollsindustrin*. Visby: Nomen Förlag.
- Tapp, Allan, and Jeff Clowes. 2002. »From »Carefree Casuals« to »Professional Wanderers«: Segmentation Possibilities for Football Supporters.« *European Journal of Marketing* 36 (11/12): 1248–69. <https://doi.org/10.1108/03090560210445164>.
- van Gennep, Arnold. (1909) 1960. *The Rites of Passage*. Chicago: University of Chicago.
- Worton, Michael, and Judith Still. 1990. *Intertextuality: Theories and Practices*. Manchester: Manchester University.

Herd, From a body to a story

InterDisciplines 1 (2018)

Katarzyna Herd, PhD candidate in ethnology at the Department of Art and Cultural Sciences, Lund University, Sweden: katarzyna.herd@kultur.lu.se.

»Warm heart and warm hands«

The case of Filipino migrant nurses in Germany

Cleovi C. Mosuela

Nurses are progressively on the move around the world and work in hospital systems different from those in which they have trained, shifting their working practices across contexts and cultures. As some highly industrialized countries, i.e., Germany and Japan, increasingly turn grey, creating more demands on health care provision, nursing skills are more highly sought. Given the increasing globalization of care work, varying notions of care intersect (Raghuram 2016). Although there is a wealth of literature on the migration of care givers (domestic workers, nurses, care assistants, doctors, teachers), what exactly this means as regards the different meanings of care that the caregivers bring with them has yet to be examined (ibid.). Rather, care is seen as constant and the same everywhere (ibid.). Little attention has been paid to the varied understandings of care, which shift in relation to historical and cultural contexts (Nguyen, Zavoretti, and Tronto 2017).

Nurse migration is nothing new and it has become an archetype for the global competition for skilled work, sometimes referred to as talent and human capital. Such capital refers to »the physical and intellectual capacities embodied in human bodies« (Goodin 2015, 16), or »in economic terms, educational attainment, work experience, language proficiency, and individual talents« (van Tubergen 2006, 85). This positive attribution, however, seems incompatible with nurses' daily task of facing the »negativities of the body—dirt, decay, decline, death,« which care work deals with (Twigg 2000a, 393). At the same time, the care sector, with occupations avoided by natives—for example, dirty and difficult jobs—depends heavily on the supply of immigrant labor (ILO 2010). In the absence of migrant

workers, the sector would possibly have to deal with severe shortages of labor or sharp increases in labor costs (ibid.).

The article, therefore, is concerned with how migrant nurses are situated in the increasing globalization of care work and how they embody both the positive and negative aspects involved in this profession across borders. Empirically, the paper illustrates the experiences of Philippine-trained nurses in hospital environments in Germany in terms of their understanding and delivery of care and interaction with their patients and colleagues. How do those knowledges of giving and receiving care in the Philippines influence how nurses care in a migratory context? How are »pre-migration configurations of care« given meaning, and to what extent do they shape Filipino migrant nurses' understanding and delivery of care in German hospital facilities (Raghuram 2012, 160)?

The data is analyzed through the concept of »body work.« My usage comes closest to Julia Twigg and colleagues (2011a), who characterize body work with direct work on the bodies of others: evaluating, analyzing, touching, nursing, and observing bodies. It is a fundamental component of health and social care, yet has been obscured in the narratives of the sector (ibid.). I would argue that performing the corporeal dimension of nursing care becomes a critical point of defining care work. On the one hand, demonstrating a warm heart and warm hands, nurses use their bodies to be able to make positive contributions to the patient's quality of life. On the other hand, the patient's body is the immediate site of hard physical labor that involves close, intimate, and often messy work (McDowell 2009).

Filipino migrant nurses are confronted with language constraints and differences in care work practices, for instance performing bedside care, feeding, washing, and cleaning the body of the patient, and positioning a paralyzed patient correctly in bed. Given the structural adjustments Filipino migrant nurses need to make, performing body work gives them access to their pre-migration configurations of care while contributing to their integration in the host society. »It is in the dynamics of the care encounter that the nature of what is produced is defined; production and consumption collapse into one another« (Twigg 2000b, 1). Care, therefore, is relational

and dynamic (Raghuram 2016). Hence, this article intends to examine the elements involved in care work, body work, and cross-border migration as they cohere in the embodied practices of migrant nurses trained in the Philippines, particularly those toiling in German health facilities today.

The discussion contributes to the current literature on the emigration of Philippine-trained nurses, which has been historically well analyzed by Choy (2003) and Brush (1995) and the mechanism of which has been comprehensively scrutinized by Guevarra (2003, 2010) and Rodriguez (2010). Recent literature focuses mostly on the broader contexts of the politics of care work, for instance, the embeddedness of the Philippine nursing curriculum within a global nursing care chain (Ortiga 2014) and issues of race and nationality in care work (Amrith 2017). The case of Philippine-trained migrant nurses in Germany resembles, to a certain degree, the ethnographic account of the experience of Filipino nurses in a public hospital and a nursing home in Singapore. The interactions between migrant medical workers and their multicultural patients bring to light broader social and political inequalities (ibid.).

Therefore, shifting the focus from the production of nurses and the larger constitutive structures to the Filipino migrant nurses themselves performing body work allows for a nuanced view of the labor migration process and highlights topics of importance to the people involved, particularly their agency, such as migration decisions, adjusting well to the new workplace in a different society, and »othering.« The case study also offers a glimpse of a changing transnational space. Between 1969 and 1973, West Germany received a steady supply of nurses from the Philippines, mainly through private recruitment agencies in the source country: 54 nurses in 1969, 1,090 in 1970, 980 in 1971, 901 in 1972, and 400 in the first four months of 1973 (Hong 2015, 257). However, it was earlier reported that West Germany would have favored an agreement with the Philippines as regards recruitment of nurses and a more active role of the sending state to better regulate the selection of qualified women. German officials regarded the Catholic culture in the Philippines, its understanding of the Western lifestyle and English language fluency as assets that would set their nurses apart from those from neighboring countries (ibid.). The

current bilateral agreement with the Philippines is a novel enterprise for Germany in that it is the first symbolic effort to pursue a project that not only overtly attempts to enact a triple win, but also to import nursing skills yet again. Although some nursing establishments are experiencing staff shortages, overseas recruitment does not seem to be a preferred approach because the convoluted process is too expensive to go through and involves several legal impediments. In spite of this, bigger firms have sought employees from abroad more often, mostly from other EU member states. A few have engaged in recruiting third-country nationals (Bertelsmann Stiftung 2015).

The analysis begins with a literature review of the intense production of nursing skills in the Philippines, whereby cross-border migration and global market forces have become the gauge for expanding the production of such skills. The discussion reveals the embedding of nursing skills in transnational spaces and in turn, nursing skills have become marginalized in the country, yet highly sought overseas. Most nurses trained in the Philippines have opted to take advantage of their sought-after skills. A methodology part follows. The third section examines the cultural aspects (Choy 2003) of how Filipino care work has been portrayed today as an amalgam of professional advancement (obtainable across borders) and cheap and vulnerable labor. The significance of taking into consideration the source country setting reveals how cross-border labor migration has been understood as the end goal for both personal and career growth and becoming a nurse as a means to achieving it. The paper ends with a discussion of the corporeal adjustments Filipino migrant nurses make in German hospital facilities and how such shifts distinguish their body work.

The commodification of Filipino care work

The Philippine labor export mechanism and the gendered Filipino cultural and social dynamics in relation to nursing skills are mutually constitutive (Guevarra 2010; Rodriguez 2010). The sociocultural phenomenon of out-migration of workers from the Philippines has certainly singularized the country and regulated Filipinos' conduct and ambitions (Guevarra 2010). Numerous scholars and international organizations in the cross-border

migration field, including government agencies, have expressed their sentiments on the almost 50-year governance of cross-border migration from the Philippines. Many of these actors frame the apparatus as the governance model to emulate by other Third World labor-exporting countries. Through in-depth ethnographic analyses of the phenomenon, Guevarra (2003, 2010) and Rodriguez (2010) expose a labor-brokering mechanism enabled by the Philippine state. Both acknowledge the country's colonial history, particularly as related to the United States colonial labor system, which laid out the blueprint for generating this kind of labor export economy as an expression of »neoliberal governmentality« in managing the population of the Philippines (ibid.). The authors claim that the establishment of a US-modeled educational curriculum and accessibility of educational prospects and training in US schools signify the perception of Filipinos as educated and ideal global workers. In addition, the migration of US-trained Filipino nurses to American hospitals gives a clear illustration of the historical legacy of colonialism by establishing public health nursing in the islands which enabled the formation of an expedient cheap workforce to provide the needs of an imperial power (Brush 1995).

Filipino nurses constitute a segment of the overseas Filipino workers (OFWs) whose cross-border movement has been regulated by the country's labor export policy. The cross-border migration of Filipino nurses is one expression of increased international mobility generated by the significant processes of global streamlining characterized by the amplified demands for services in high-income countries along with the transfer of production to developing countries (Choy 2003, 2). Because the Philippine state has sought to recalibrate in relation to the dynamism of global markets since the mid-1990s, it has shifted its focus to higher skill- and knowledge-based categories of jobs from the usual market for domestic helpers, entertainers, and seafarers (Guevarra 2010). The state has adopted a deliberative calculation as to demarcating which populations are beneficial to attract global markets. This strategy of governing is applied to a particular type of worker, i.e., nurses, a group within a nation that is subjected to, and subjects of, the free play of market forces or global

capital. The approach has been highly responsive to the challenges of transnationality, thereby positioning the state as an exporter of its citizens, particularly nurses, as preferred labor to the global market (Rodriguez 2010). This move to the production of educated subjects is not only an enduring national program to professionalize the image of the labor export strategy embraced by the Philippines (Guevarra 2003), it also corresponds to the goal of encouraging self-actualizing subjects who can compete in global knowledge markets. In comparison to other source countries in which individual factors prevail in the outflow of skilled workers and/or nurses, the Philippine state's proactive labor export policy drives elevated levels of recruitment from industrialized destination countries (Buchan 2003). In 2002, former Labor Secretary of the Philippines Patricia Santo Tomas was once quoted as saying that Filipino nurses are »the new growth area for overseas employment.« She boldly said, »we won't lose nurses. The older ones, those in their mid-40s, are not likely to leave. Besides, the student population reacts to markets quickly. Enrollment is high. We won't lack nurses.« (Migration News 2002)

Consequently, there has been a proliferation of colleges offering nursing courses; from only 40 in the 1970s to 170 in the 1990s to 491 in 2012 (Rep. Samaco-Paquiz interview, January 26, 2015; Recto 2011; Cheng 2009). The nursing curriculum has been geared toward the preferences for clinical and specialized skills of destination countries (Dimaya et al. 2012, 3; Ortega 2014). At the turn of the twenty-first century, nursing has become one of the top career choices for students in the Philippines as demonstrated by a fifteen-fold increase in enrollment from only 30,000 to 450,000 in a span of seven years (Commission on Higher Education 2007 in Recto 2011). Nursing education in the country is financed privately, which clearly shows that parents or individuals rather than the state invest in education for foreign labor markets (Pring and Roco 2012). However, the global demand for Philippine-trained health workers has generated a »serious burden« for nurse educators to cater to irregular labor demand overseas (Ortega 2014, 69). This process has eventually become a factor in the deterioration of professional values and standards that characterize the nursing profession in the islands (ibid.).

Private recruitment agencies, whether registered or not, have also sprung to benefit from the growing demand for nurses trained in the country. In 2014–15 Philippine Overseas Employment Administration (POEA) statistics, nursing professionals were the third-largest land-based occupational group to be deployed, numbering 18,799 in 2014 and 22,175 in 2015.¹ The Philippine state has become the leading exporter of nurses, with 85% of Filipino nurses working in 50 countries (Lorenzo et al. 2007). According to a 2010 Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) report, nurses born in the Philippines represent 15% of all immigrant nurses in the OECD countries. Approximately 16,000 physicians and 110,000 nurses born in the Philippines are employed in Europe and North America (OECD Observer 2010). Since the 1960s, the Philippines has steadily supplied nurses to the United States (Brush and Sochalski 2007). For several decades, Saudi Arabia has recruited Filipino nurses while the United Kingdom, the Netherlands, and Ireland have been involved in this more recently (Lorenzo et al. 2007). In recent years, 75% of Philippine-trained nurses have left the country each year to the Gulf States to undertake short-term contractual employment and return or relocate to another country after the termination of their contracts. There are no statistics on the return of nurses to the Philippines (Abella 2012, 9).

The Philippine state has been proactive in its approach of forging bilateral agreements as regards placing Filipino nurses in health care facilities overseas (ILO Policy Brief 3). As the POEA declares, »we are marketing capabilities and merits [of Filipino nurses], that’s why [Germany] was able to reach the Philippines [in its search for labor/human capital/talent]« (interview October 13, 2014). Such bilateral labor agreements or Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs) serve as an important »policy tool to manage migration« (Makulec 2014, 3) to harness the development potential of migration, thus of Filipino migrants. Bilateral agreements are intended to serve three purposes: regulating the recruitment process,

1 POEA, »POEA Overseas Employment Statistics, Deployed Overseas Filipino Workers 2014–2015,« accessed Oct. 7, 2017, <http://www.poea.gov.ph/ofwstat/compendium/2015.pdf>.

stipulating the mechanism for the protection of migrants' rights, and counteracting the negative consequences that an outflow of nurses would create (ibid., 33). However, many of these agreements remain on paper and lack proper implementation due to changes in policy priorities or political contexts in the destination countries, for instance Bahrain, Spain, and Norway (ibid.). Negotiations and implementation of bilateral agreements are within the realm of the POEA, a major governing body in the Philippine labor export mechanism.

The role of the state has become that of a manager of overseas employment. As the report from the Department of Labor and Employment (DOLE) stated:

Many people see opportunities abroad and want to benefit from them. And there are labor-market gaps in the global economy that are best filled by labor migration. The challenge to Philippine policy-making today is not one of exporting the country's labor surplus; it is *managing effectively the natural process of labor migration*—which will continue even if we ban the outflow of our workers. (DOLE 1995 in Guevarra 2003, 5; emphasis added)

The state oddly maintains that opportunities abroad are inherent processes of globalization and that the yearnings and ambitions of Filipinos to work overseas are instinctive responses (Guevarra 2003). As an art of government, the Philippine state has made cross-border labor migration a means which the country would gain from, thereby turning the migrant labor population of an average of 10 million across the globe into a vehicle of economic growth (Camroux 2008). The enactment of Republic Act 8042 or the Migrant Workers and Overseas Filipinos Act of 1995²

2 A significant event prompted its passage. In 1995, Flor Contemplacion, a Singapore-based domestic worker, was executed by the Singaporean administration for allegedly killing another Filipina domestic worker and the child in her custody. Contemplacion's hanging infuriated Filipinos everywhere, who believed that the Philippine government could have intervened on behalf of Contemplacion because she was a Filipino citizen and a migrant worker who is one of the country's so-called »new national heroes.« Following some mass protests, Philippine lawmakers were impelled

(later amended by Republic Act No. 10022, which took effect in 2010)³ has legitimately transformed cross-border labor migration from a transient to a permanent phenomenon in the country. It is an »act to institute the policies of overseas employment and establish a higher standard of protection and promotion of the welfare of migrant workers, their families and overseas Filipinos in distress, and for other purposes« (ibid.). This Act has been recorded in the Global Forum on Migration and Development Platform for Partnerships (PfP) as one among 869 migration and development policies and practices collected from around the globe.⁴ As stipulated in the Act, policies of overseas employment include »pre-employment orientation that permits five accredited NGOs to offer courses on entrepreneurship, business, and financial management. The NGOs are supposed to promote and protect migrant workers' rights (GFMD website).« The Act has significantly delineated the relationship between the state and its citizens overseas (Rodriguez 2002). Former Labor Secretary Patricia Santo Tomas once said, »overseas employment is a choice made by individuals. We don't push them. But once they leave for overseas, the government is duty bound to assure that their contracts have ample provisions for their protection« (Pring and Roco 2012). One of those provisions is the creation of a central governing body called the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration (POEA).

Interestingly, the same Republic Act claims that overseas labor deployment is not »an official development strategy« although the Philippine state has launched several programs to maximize the gains of overseas employment. By instituting legislation aimed at enabling OFWs and their families to direct the recipients of their remittances to enter into entrepreneurship

to critically address the forms of rights and protections the state should extend to its citizens overseas (Rodriguez 2002).

3 Department of Labor and Employment Labor Communications Office, memorandum, Aug. 4, 2010, <http://hrlibrary.umn.edu/research/Philippines/Omnibus%20Rules%20and%20Regulations%20on%20Migrant%20Workers%20Law.pdf>.

4 GFMD, »Migrant Workers and Overseas Filipinos Act of 1995,« accessed July 20, 2017, <https://gfmd.org/pfp/ppd/67>.

or invest in small and medium-scale businesses (Villegas 2012; Tabuga 2007), the state has extended its role to tapping personal/household remittances, in the name of economic development. The 2001–04 Medium Term Philippine Development Plan regards overseas employment as a vital source of economic growth (Aiken et al. 2004). OFWs thus have been constituted by the Philippine state as significant economic development agents. It is in the hands of OFWs—or so to speak, in the proper management of remittances—that the social costs of migration can be addressed or mitigated. The state disciplines OFWs as certain kinds of citizens—who are flexible workers for the global economy, who pay taxes to the homeland, and religiously send remittances to their families in the Philippines (Rodriguez 2002), thereby creating and perpetuating various transnational spaces.

Methodology and positionality

This paper partly draws on the data gathered (2014–16) for a long-term ethnographic study of the case of contemporary recruitment of Filipino nurses to Germany within the framework of a bilateral agreement also known as the Triple Win Project. The agreement, originally signed on March 19, 2013 and expected to last until December 2014,⁵ claims to produce three-fold benefits: the nursing shortage in Germany is offset; the unemployment rate of nurses in the Philippines is trimmed down; and the remittances to be sent by »Triple Win migrant nurses«⁶ and their transfer of knowledge contribute to the development in the Philippines.⁷ The agreement is the first of its kind to bring the current (normative) debates on nurse migration and the renewed enthusiasm for the dynamics

5 The initial agreement of 2013–14 has been extended until 2018, as announced on the program website.

6 »Triple Win nurse migrants« is the term I use to refer to those Filipino nurses who have been placed with German employers through the Triple Win Project.

7 GIZ, »Sustainable Recruitment of Nurses (Triple Win),« Triple Win program website, accessed Aug. 22, 2017, <https://www.giz.de/en/worldwide/41533.html>.

between migration and development into a single framework of migration management. Achieving the ambitious claims of the Triple Win approach goes hand in hand with a highly restrictive and lengthy procedure, from screening applicants to integrating Triple Win migrant nurses. Nurse candidates must undergo German language training (from A1 to B1) in Manila, overseen by the Triple Win Project coordinators, for at least six months. Other procedures such as screening, selection, matching with an employer, and visa issuance, take another six months at least, according to some applicants who have expressed their dismay at the long duration of the process. Throughout the placement procedure, the nurses' application process was managed by Triple Win Project coordinators, namely the *Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit* (GIZ or the German Association for International Cooperation) and the *Zentrale Auslands- und Fachvermittlung* (ZAV or International Placement Services) representing the German state and the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration (POEA) acting for the Philippine state (Triple Win *Bewerberinformation* [applicant information] 2013, 1).⁸ Filipino nurses' cross-border movement is envisaged by the Triple Win Project coordinators working on the assumption that cross-border skilled migration can ultimately lead to development. Underlying this assumption, however, are different ideas as to what is involved in the process of development (which is discussed in detail in my PhD manuscript).

At the time of writing, the latest report⁹ says a total of 584 nurses were selected for the project (222 in the first round and 362 in the second round, the dates of which are not disclosed). Among these screened applicants, a total of 66 Filipino nurses (40 female, 26 male)¹⁰ out of the

8 GIZ and Bundesagentur für Arbeit, »Triple Win Bewerberinformation [applicant information],« accessed Sep. 10, 2013, <http://www.poea.gov.ph/twp/files/Triple%20Win%20Philippinen.pdf>.

9 POEA, »Triple Win Project Update,« report as of Sep. 4, 2016, <http://www.poea.gov.ph/twp/TWP.html>.

10 The main web page of the project reports 55 who have passed the recognition exam, however, careful review of the list of names shows the total at 66; POEA, »Triple Win Project: List of Nurses Who Passed the

170 who have been deployed to 25 hospitals/facilities passed the recognition exam in Germany. 18 were assigned in Hesse, 31 in Baden-Württemberg, 15 in Bavaria, one in Lower Saxony, and one in Berlin; 307 are still in the Philippines taking German language classes and undergoing an employer selection process. There are 16 more employer hospitals participating in the project.¹¹ The process of recognition means their university degrees have been recognized by the authorities, they speak German fluently, and they have earned the title *Gesundheits- und Krankenpfleger/in* (nurse). With this title comes an increase in monthly salary from EUR 1,900 gross to EUR 2,300. The recognition process takes one year upon the arrival of Filipino nurses. Within that year, they work with a trainee buddy who helps them familiarize themselves in their new work environment.

I have drawn on an eclectic mix of sources from multiple sites because analyzing a cross-border recruitment process necessitates a methodological investigation of transnational connections. Multisitedness concerns itself with the study of social phenomena that can only be unraveled by following people, associations, constellations, and relationships through time and space (Marcus 1995; Falzon 2009, 1–2). However, as will be explained toward the end of this section, »following the same nurses« proved to be difficult given the unanticipated slow pace of recruitment. Multisite research analyzes multiple kinds of empirical data (Clarke 2005, 146) from fieldwork in ethnographic mode and from policy documents, organization reports, and research produced by local and international experts and Triple Win Project coordinators.

Particularly relevant for the analysis in this paper are the semi-structured interviews with 29 nurse candidates (in different stages of the selection and hiring process), ten Triple Win nurses (those who have been placed

Recognition Exam,« accessed Sep. 13, 2018, http://www.poea.gov.ph/twp/files/twp_rec_exam_passers.pdf.

11 The number stands in contrast to the 130 participating health care facilities, according to the ZAV, some of which have nurse positions yet to be filled (interview October 8, 2015).

in German health care facilities), eight stakeholders (representatives of professional organizations and trade unions also involved in monitoring processes of the Triple Win Project, as well as language schools), and ten local and international experts or who have done particular research or advocacy, or have business endeavors in the entangled areas of health, labor, and migration. Unfortunately, hospital managers declined requests for interviews. To fill this gap, I turn to experts who conducted a survey among care institutions around Germany. They provided some of their materials (i.e., publications and power point presentations) useful for this research. In other words, I pursued a methodological investigation of transnational connections brought about by cross-border recruitment.

Initial contacts were established through online communication (including social media) or face-to-face interaction at language training courses and orientation programs. I followed an ethical protocol upon entering the fields through seeking permission for interview, informing key informants of the purpose of the research, and providing them with the interview guide when necessary. The anonymity of respondents is guaranteed; names of interviewees have been changed.

Being a Filipino living in Germany greatly facilitated my interactions with the Triple Win nurse candidates. Some of the nurse candidates were quite pleased that the current dire situation of their profession was given some research attention, although some nurses were a bit wary that our conversation could potentially affect their applications. To my surprise, a few even felt the need to consult the recruitment agency about having a chat with me. Those who kept an open mind to research talked about their motivations for applying to the project and/or working overseas, their experience of and preparation for the recruitment process, and what they considered for an overseas application. Because of the nurse candidates' intention to move to Germany, my knowledge of Germany and the nurses' expectations created some »conversational space« (Pezalla, Pettigrew, and Miller-Day 2012, 166). Nevertheless, in my interaction with them, I retained my position as a learner making an effort to perceive their experiences and understandings from their own point of view (Pezalla, Pettigrew, and Miller-Day 2012). Interviews with Triple Win

nurses revolved around general personal information, migration background, host country and workplace context, transnational activities, personal adaptation to host and transnational contexts, reflections about career and moving overseas, and career plans. At the time of the interviews, most of the nurses had just passed their recognition exam and subsequently been granted a three-year residence permit. Some had already moved from one department to another within the same health care facility. Although I intended to follow the nurse candidates from their application to employment, time did not permit this, mainly due to the slow progress of their applications. Some of the nurses described it as a journey testing their patience and grit.

All in all, ethnographic and secondary data obtained through a multi-sited transnational methodology are used to capture the existing intersecting discourses and realities underpinning the social, political, and to some extent historical contexts, in both emigration and immigration, of the case under consideration.

Pre-migration configurations of care

For me, as a professional nurse, your career will not be complete unless you work abroad. On my own experience, I've been in Saudi Arabia for 2001 up to 2002, wherein I worked as a Critical Care Unit nurse. So there is a satisfaction and fulfilment on your part as a nurse if you will be working outside of the Philippines. But the real essence of nursing is not really going abroad because for some, nursing is not just a profession but a vocation, so meaning this is a calling [...] the cap is placed on their head, meaning your duties and responsibilities should be above your personal things. Because there will be time you have to work 24/7, so meaning, we don't have the usual weekdays off and holidays. So even though there's holidays, typhoon and calamities, but we need to work, still to report to our work. But for some nurses who really want to look for a greener pasture, they're really looking for a place where they can practice and where they can excel and render their tender, loving care because we all know that Filipino nurses are known for

their tender, loving care. And based on the PNA [Philippine Nurses Association] road map, nursing is the best for Filipino and the choice for the world. Meaning there are really nurses who are taking up nursing as a profession because they really love to go to abroad because they want to earn greener pasture. [So there's a mixture of professionalism and personal choice. So for others, that is a fulfillment of their profession once they practice abroad and earn more than they should earn in the Philippines. (Philippine Nurses Association interview, October 28, 2014)

The Philippine Nurses Association (PNA) in the quote above unambiguously encapsulates what needs to be unpacked in the seemingly commonsensical beliefs being perpetuated in the islands and across borders: nursing skills being equated with Filipinos; nursing as a fusion between profession and vocation; and that any Filipino who chooses to take up nursing as a profession can succeed anywhere around the globe because of their innate abilities in caregiving, which are sought after. Understanding the context such discourses emerge from and how they are instrumentalized not only opens up, but also fuels the underlying fabrics which are often taken for granted: cross-border skilled migration has become a necessity and acquiring nursing skills is one of the means to achieve it; nursing skills serve as a passport and tangible hope to moving overseas and up the social ladder; and paradoxically, the same skills are regarded as expendable and exploited within the health care system in the country.

Many of the Filipino nurses I interviewed, especially those who are now in their 40s and 50s, recalled that the concept of »calling« formed their decision to pursue becoming a nurse. The purity of the white uniform a nurse wears on duty carries a highly symbolic presence. What is more, these nurses make it their vocation to care for the sick. Calling refers to »a deep desire to choose a task which a person experiences as valuable and considers her own« (Raatikainen 1997, 1112). The caring ingredient embedded in nursing, symbolized in the concept of calling, intensifies the understanding of nursing as a profession equipped with skills transferable across borders, regardless of the degree, and contributes to a moral impetus to the practice of nursing (McNeil-Walsch 2010, 190).

Caring in the context of nursing in the Philippines has been essentialized, even institutionalized, through the image of a professional nurse being promoted overseas. »Filipino care« has been implicitly equated with innately possessing a comparative advantage because of their caregiving skills and (English) communication skills. An additional component to these celebrated *natural* abilities is being flexible because

definitely, Filipino nurses can easily adjust to different situations. So that's the good thing about us Filipinos is our adaptability because since in the Philippines there are mixed cultures, regionalism. So if you will be working, you can easily adjust to every situation. It will not be difficult. (PNA interview, October 28, 2014)

The PNA claims that a Filipino nurse is »*the best and the choice for the world* because since time immemorial if there are countries needing nurses, they really want to get Filipinos because Filipino nurses are *very much patient* when it comes to taking care, they are *very much hard working and dedicated*« (ibid.; my emphasis). These discursive representations, referred to as »added export value« (Guevarra 2010, 11), give Filipinos an edge over other »Third World« subjects in the global market. In general, Filipino workers' value of labor power is an explicitly racialized form of flexibility (ibid.). Filipino workers become subjects who emerge »precisely as someone manageable [...] [as] someone who is eminently governable« (Foucault 2008, 270), and, as migrants themselves claim, profitable.

In addition, gender has been an invaluable resource for global capital. The phenomenon of Filipino nurses' emigration in the postwar era (1965) instigated the feminization of the contemporary overseas Filipino workforce, the majority of whom are domestic workers while some are entertainers or sex workers (Choy 2003, 188), whereby female workers exceed the emigration of male workers (Guevarra 2010). The cross-border migration of Filipino nurses also signifies the creation of a gendered workforce in the global system (Choy 2003).

In reference to the quote at the beginning of this section, the positive image of being a Filipino nurse has been reinforced by the PNA by preparing nursing students to become globally competent, competitive,

and instilled with the values of being a Filipino (PNA interview October 28, 2014). The association expects every Filipino nurse knows and practices »the caring rule: tender, loving care,« which makes them unique and sought after all over the world. For the PNA, the prominence of Filipino nurses contributes to and impacts global health care outcomes by raising the standards and performance benchmarks (ibid.).

For some nurses, particularly those born in the 1980s, the decision to take up nursing as a profession was driven by a collective decision with the family. Some have asked for advice from relatives who are trained nurses themselves and have worked overseas. Closely related to this idea is a pragmatic reason—nursing provides an opportunity to both train and earn a decent wage overseas, which presents another opportunity for upward social mobility and for feeding one’s family. Practicing nurses are vulnerable to receiving inadequate wages, and some hospitals do not implement the starting salary grade 15 of PHP 24,887 (approx. EUR 400) in all public and private health institutions as stated in the Philippine Nursing Act of 2002 and as prescribed under Republic Act No. 6758 or the Compensation and Classification Act of 1989.

Nurses capitalize on their globally in-demand skills, depending on the country open for recruitment, thus their decision to migrate is driven not only by familial influence, but also by global market approaches. For example, Nurse Rose called herself quite »special« and »lucky« because she was able to secure a full-time and permanent position in a Philippine public hospital for more than twenty years and also had about two years of experience in a private hospital. She received huge benefits including a zero-interest loan for her children’s tuition fees. The overall salary package was so rewarding that she did not consider moving overseas. »Why would you leave your family behind? Who would want to leave your own country if your status in life is fine?« (interview, October 23, 2014). However, she is currently unemployed and in her late 50s, which is considered a disadvantage when applying within the country and overseas.

In moving across borders, besides the possibility of a higher wage, nurses consider gaining specialized training. Nurse Jackie, for instance, who is in her late thirties, practiced in Bahrain for four years and Australia for

three years and is a licensed nurse in the United States, which means she passed the National Council Licensure Examination (NCLEX) and her credentials are recognized by the Commission on Graduates of Foreign Nursing Schools (CGFNS), the two governing bodies for nurses who want to practice their profession in the United States. Due to her mother's ailing health, she had to go back to the Philippines. After taking care of her parent, she then pursued several applications within and outside the country but was turned down. Although her US licensure is an advantage, the recruitment of Philippine-trained nurses for the United States is currently halted and so she has turned to other doors which are open. However, not all doors are created equal. Given Nurses Rose's and Jackie's age, the Triple Win Project is a perfect opportunity for them because, first of all, there is no age requirement of 30–35 years of age, unlike those of other countries (i.e., Japan, Saudi Arabia, and Canada, as mentioned by the interviewees). Even in public hospitals in the Philippines, the age requirement prevails over experience.

So, it got me thinking, you have extensive experience but because you are over-aged you do not have the hope to continue your profession here. It is ironic. Those who have the position in the hospitals are young without any experience. That's why I am a private nurse now [...] It is bad for our country because the knowledge you gained overseas cannot be utilized here [in the Philippines]. Even though you choose to stay here with a low salary, you are still denied. It is really ironic. (Nurse Jackie interview, October 23, 2014)

Secondly and contrary to the norm, there is no need to pay large sums of money to private recruitment agencies as nurses go through the Triple Win recruitment process. It is one of the main reasons that more than 5,000 Philippine-registered nurses submitted their application through the Triple Win Project. The subject of placement fees in the Philippines has raised concerns among trade unions and would-be migrants themselves. Section 51 of the Revised POEA Rules and Regulations Governing the Recruitment and Employment of Land-based Overseas Filipino Workers

of 2016¹² states that a placement fee can be collected from migrating Filipino laborers corresponding to one month's basic salary, except in countries where laws prohibit collection of fees from workers. PSLink (a trade union in the Philippines concerned with migrant workers' rights, among others) reports that a number of would-be overseas workers who make use of private recruitment agencies pay up to six months of their salary (*Tale of a Journey* 2014, 22:10);¹³ which is a clear violation of Section 51. Some of the workers have already mortgaged their houses, their piece of land, or farm animals in order to raise funds to pay the exorbitant fees demanded by private recruitment agencies. In some cases, when overseas workers reach the countries of destination, they are not paid according to what they are promised in the original contract they signed. Contract substitution is prevalent (*ibid.*).

Nursing, compared to other health professions, has become a ticket to go abroad and such discourse corresponds to the statistics of the outflow of nurses, as the Philippine Department of Health (DoH) reveals. However, no research has been conducted on certain particularities such as comparing the economic and social gains and the losses of those individuals and families who have invested in nursing. In DoH's back-of-the-envelope calculation, seven out of eight nurses aspire to work overseas but only one makes it; one is successful in finding a nursing position in the Philippines; five work in a different profession; and one is unemployed. One out of eight aspiring nurses actually working overseas does not seem promising. Nevertheless, individuals and families still take the risk and make such an investment, which the DoH considers a very

12 Homepage of the POEA, accessed Feb. 22, 2016, <http://www.poea.gov.ph/laws&rules/files/Revised%20POEA%20Rules%20And%20Regulations.pdf>.

13 A 41-minute documentary *Tale of a Journey: Migrant Health Workers' Voice through Images*, produced by ILO together with the Asia Pacific Film Institute, funded by the European Union, and publicly screened in Manila on Nov. 16, 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mYXQKawIII0>.

expensive venture and assumes was taken out of desperation (DoH interview February 18, 2015).

The discourse of »nursing as a passport« connotes the perceived cross-border transferability of nursing skills in a transnational or global context. This perception goes with the understanding that »the Philippines is one big training ground for novice nurses and we're really producing for the global market« (DoH interview February 18, 2015). Filipino nurses learn to navigate along the processes of capital accumulation and transnationalism through the practices of mobility and flexibility. The global demand for nurses in the past decade has resulted in an increased acceptance by nurses that nursing is a mobile or transferrable skill (Kingma 2006) or an »exportable asset« (Scott et al. 2004, 174) or even »dispensable,« and that their profession is situated firmly in the global labor market (McNeil-Walsch 2010, 190). The Philippine state's regulation of cross-border migration has proved to be a long-standing phenomenon embedded in the culture and society and constituted to achieve economic development.

Defining »Filipino care work« through body work

Qualified nurses in Germany are trained in a three-year vocational course (not at a university level in comparison to that of the curriculum in the Philippines) consisting of approximately 3,300 hours of theoretical training and 2,500 hours of practical training in various hospital sites (IEGUS 2013). Nursing students can choose among three basic specifications: general nurse, elderly care nurse, or child care nurse. Auxiliary nurses are typically trained for one or two years. Nursing education at universities has recently started but is still in the pilot phase. Currently, the system of nurse education is being reformed to a general three-year nursing program and an option to specialize through further education upon completion (ibid.). This form of vocational training provides a challenge to migrants integrating to their workplace as regards access to and contentment with the job, in international comparison (Kovacheva and Grewe 2015).

Migrant bodies are frequently »somatically marked,« racialized, or othered in a discernible manner (Raghuram, Bornat, and Henry 2011, 326). Filipino migrant nurses find themselves grappling with the position of being

foreigners or outsiders due to the language and cultural differences they experience in Germany. This is also the case when they start their new employment as they feel underestimated by their locally hired colleagues. »Because they [the colleagues] are thinking that Philippines is a poor country, they are thinking we have limited knowledge. But as the days passed, they have seen Filipino nurses have a lot of skills and we can do certain procedures which they normally don't,« as Nurse Juan (interview, May 12, 2015; my translation from Filipino) recalls. For instance, »our colleagues do not know how to insert a nasogastric tube,¹⁴ and so they appreciate my skills when I do that.« according to Nurse Leticia.

When there was an emergency, somebody suffered a heart attack, of course I rushed to the patient. The others were amazed, even the doctor, as if they couldn't believe that a nurse could possibly do that. Because in the Philippines, it is a normal procedure for the nurses to rush to the patient. If there's no pulse, do a cardiopulmonary resuscitation¹⁵ immediately. The doctor was surprised when he saw I did the CPR instantly. He was really happy when he saw I took the initiative. We can do that in our job description but perhaps that doctor had not seen any nurse here do that because his reaction was different, as if he was in awe and was very delighted when he witnessed that. My colleagues who saw it were surprised too. So, I am quite pleased because my colleagues saw that nurses from the Philippines have the skills. (Nurse Leticia interview, May 12, 2015; my translation from Filipino)

Filipino migrant nurses carry with them some ideas about how to provide care and a sense of pride due to their level of education. They are selected or hired particularly because of the supposed high level of training they have acquired in the Philippines and they are expected to bring their experience with them to the German health care system.

14 A nasogastric tube (NG tube) is a special tube that carries food and medicine to the stomach through the nose.

15 It is an emergency lifesaving procedure that is done when a person's breathing or heartbeat has stopped.

However, they do not merely transfer what they know, but they learn to adjust to a very systematic procedure, as they start working as nurse assistants while preparing for the state examination that they must take within their first year. They are also expected to be studying for a B2 level German language exam. As nurse assistants, their responsibilities in the hospitals are limited in comparison to what they are used to in Philippine hospital settings. The candidates were warned against doing anything that is not part of their job description even if they know the process of blood transfusion, for example.

Adjusting to the new work conditions and to a »physically, emotionally, and intellectually demanding« job depends primarily on the wards Filipino migrant nurses are assigned to and whether they have the necessary experience required there (Nurse Juan interview May 12, 2015). Nurse Eden reveals how being assigned to a particular ward helped her not only improve her German language speaking skills but also practice the way of caring she knows through communicating with the patients.

I had to adjust myself because I was immediately assigned to an *Intensivstation* [intensive care unit], which I didn't have any experience, plus the *sprache* or language, so I had a difficult time adjusting. After two months, I asked for permission if I could be moved to work in a lower level because my forte is intensive middle but more on *unterhalten* [chatting] because I'm used to speaking with patients. Because in the intensive [unit], patients are sedated so it is difficult to practice, including the *sprache*. And their tools are very much advanced and so I had to adjust big time. But after I had the shift of station, it was better. I can adjust better in this new station I am in now. People are better. I can work alone. (interview, May 13, 2015)

Despite having a similar experience in an intensive care unit, Nurse Rox found the »German way« of caring and treating patients unfamiliar and quite difficult to adjust to at the beginning, precisely because of the difference in the relationship between doctors and nurses.

Because here [in Germany] you think, you decide. In the Philippines, the doctor will order this that, then you do it. Here, you think, for example, the patient is this that, I think what to do, this that, then I will tell the doctor. Here the relationship between doctor and nurse is like partners. In the Philippines, the doctor is like a boss, right? Here, partner. Sometimes, I would suggest, »do you like to give this that?« »Ok, go, you give.« Here, you need to be brainy, you need to think. That's where some people find it difficult because in the Philippines we are used to spoon-feeding. The doctors say, you do. (Nurse Rox interview, May 13, 2015)

Nurses in Germany have the space to decide on how to treat the patients. Doctors rely on nurses' understanding of the situation of the patients because of the nurses' proximity to the corporeal dimension of the patients.

Filipino migrant nurses' daily praxis in German health care facilities then is mostly consumed by adjusting with respect to the direct management of the body of the patient, such as feeding and bathing patients. Nurses trained in the Philippines are not necessarily instructed to perform such basic work; bedside care is typically done by kin of patients, as reflected upon by my interviewees. Although a fundamental part, the corporeal dimension of nursing care, such as washing and cleaning the body of the patient, or offering assistance to basic daily needs, like feeding or positioning a paralyzed patient correctly in bed, becomes a critical point for Filipino migrant nurses to demonstrate their manner of caring. Smiling, communicating well with the patients, and touching their bodies in a therapeutic way help define and differentiate Filipino care work from that of their colleagues. Nurses' proximity to the corporeal dimension of the patient's body contributes not only to their full integration at the workplace but also to the humanization of the patient.

Our head nurse in the station I am working in really appreciates my skills because I am light-hearted in the midst of my serious colleagues. I always smile, that's why the patients I care for are also very happy and they also give some positive feedback of me to our head nurse. So our head nurse told me not to leave the station; I should *bleiben*

(stay) there because I make the patients happy. And she said my aura is different when it comes to care and patients. So I said ok, *zufrieden* (I am satisfied). (Nurse Eden interview, May 13, 2015)

Defining and differentiating Filipino care work means treating the patients as if they are members of a family, especially when patients are terminally ill or facing death. Filipino nurses assess if patients need time or someone to talk to and so they make sure they are well supervised and taken care of. Filipino care work practiced in Germany is ascribed to the relationship nurses build with the corporeality of the patients. To some extent, the idealization of Filipino care work is necessitated precisely because Philippine-trained nurses »are not identified as an individual, but as a Filipino nurse, as a group,« Nurse Leticia explains.

The personality of a Filipino is what they appreciate, what is emphasized. When a Filipino handles a German patient, it is being marked. No one among the patients we worked with said they are not satisfied or they do not like us. You will see that our way of caring is different. As you enter the patient's room, they feel it's like sunshine. Because you know us Filipinos, even though we have problems, we smile. We radiate a positive aura. The patients I work with are dying, normally depressed, and always in bed. So even if you know their days are numbered, you somehow make them feel you are part of their lives. That's why they are happy. When you are not around, they will look for you. (Nurse Agnes interview, May 12, 2015; my translation from Filipino)

Filipino migrant nurses articulate that they feel like »European nurses« not only because of the paper recognition but also of their skills and knowledge being appreciated and validated through their interaction with local patients and their relationships with colleagues. »You really have to prove yourself to the Germans, to other foreigners, »yes, Filipinos, [we are] very good in caring, competitive at work,« as Nurse Eden (interview, May 13, 2015) expresses. Opportunities for career growth, such as training or seminars offered, suggest equal treatment between Triple Win nurses and their local colleagues.

Concluding thoughts

This article sits at the nexus between two bodies of work, health and care work and migration research, which both acknowledge the intensifying globalization of care work. The commodification of Filipino care work has essentialized nurses to embody an invaluable capital of combined body work and transferable skills. By looking at the emigration context, we have seen how such capital is, first of all, imagined and second, perceived to be transferable across borders. The patient's body is the object and the heart of nursing work. This article therefore has focused on the juncture where care is essentially supplied, given meaning, and even differentiated. The case of Filipino nurses employed overseas offers an interesting view of how care and body work have been utilized to express their own understanding of care provision. The contribution of this paper has been to delve into the nexus of migration, body, and care in which Filipino migrant nurses in German health facilities articulate their body and care work and what it means to be a Filipino nurse through their interaction with local patients.

References

- Amrith, Megha. 2017. *Caring for Strangers: Filipino Medical Workers in Asia*. Copenhagen: NIAS.
- Bertelsmann Stiftung. 2015. »The Nursing-Care Industry in Germany is Struggling with International Recruitment Efforts.« Accessed June 3, 2015. <https://www.bertelsmann-stiftung.de/en/topics/aktuelle-meldungen/2015/juni/the-nursing-care-industry-in-germany-is-struggling-with-international-recruitment-efforts/>.
- Brush, Barbara L., and Julie Sochalski. 2007. »International Nurse Migration: Lessons from the Philippines.« *Policy, Politics, & Nursing Practice* 8 (1): 37–46.
- Buchan, James, Tina Parkin, and Julie Sochalski. 2003. »International Nurse Mobility: Trends and Policy Implications.« Accessed April 22, 2014. <http://www.who.int/workforcealliance/knowledge/resources/nursesmobility/en/>.
- Camroux, David. 2008. *Nationalizing Transnationalism? The Philippine State and the Filipino Diaspora*. Paris: Centre d'études et de recherches internationales.
- Cheng, Margaret Harris. 2009. »The Philippines' Health Worker Exodus.« *The Lancet* 373:111–12.
- Choy, Catherine Ceniza. 2003. *Empire of Care: Nursing and Migration in Filipino American History*. Durham: Duke University.
- de Haas, Hein. 2012. »The Migration and Development Pendulum: A Critical View on Research and Policy.« *International Migration* 50 (3): 8–25.
- Department of Labor and Employment Labor Communications Office. Memorandum, August 4, 2010. <http://hrlibrary.umn.edu/research/Philippines/Omnibus%20Rules%20and%20Regulations%20on%20Migrant%20Workers%20Law.pdf>.
- Foucault, Michel. 2008. *The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1978–1979*. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.
- GFMD (Global Forum on Migration and Development). »Migrant Workers and Overseas Filipinos Act of 1995.« Shared December 27, 2013. <https://gfmd.org/pfp/ppd/67>.

- GIZ (Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit). »Sustainable Recruitment of Nurses (Triple Win).« Accessed August 22, 2017. <https://www.giz.de/en/worldwide/41533.html>.
- GIZ and Bundesagentur für Arbeit. »Triple Win Bewerberinformation [applicant information].« Accessed September 10, 2013. <http://www.poea.gov.ph/twp/files/Triple%20Win%20Philippinen.pdf>.
- Goodin, Robert E. 2015. »If People Were Money...« In *Free Movement*, edited by Brian Barry and Robert E. Goodin, 6–22. London: Routledge.
- Guevarra, Anna Romina. 2003. »Governing Migrant Workers through Empowerment and Sustaining a Culture of Labor Migration: The Case of the Philippines.« Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Sociological Association, Atlanta Hilton Hotel, August 16, 2003. http://www.allacademic.com/meta/p107225_index.html.
- . 2010. *Marketing Dreams, Manufacturing Heroes: The Transnational Labor Brokering of Filipino Workers*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University.
- Dimaya, Roland M., Mary K. McEwen, Leslie A. Curry, and Elizabeth H. Bradley. 2012. »Managing Health Worker Migration: A Qualitative Study of the Philippine Response to Nurse Brain Drain.« *Human Resources for Health* 10 (1): 1–8.
- Harris, Anna. 2011. »In a Moment of Mismatch: Overseas Doctors' Adjustments in New Hospital Environments.« *Sociology of Health & Illness* 33 (2): 308–20.
- Hong, Young-Sun. 2015. *Cold War Germany, the Third World, and the Global Humanitarian Regime*. New York: Cambridge University.
- International Labour Organization. 2010. *International Labour Migration: A Rights-Based Approach*. Geneva: International Labour Office. https://hrbportal.org/wp-content/files/wcms_208594.pdf.
- Tale of a Journey: Migrant Health Workers' Voice*. Produced by the International Labour Organization (ILO) and the Asia Pacific Film Institute. Funded by the European Union. Premiered in Manila, November 16, 2014. YouTube, 41:44. Published January 27, 2015. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mYXQKawIII0>.
- Kingma, Mireille. 2006. *Nurses on the Move: Migration and the Global Health Care Economy*. Ithaca: Cornell University.

- Lorenzo, Fely Marilyn E., Jaime Galvez-Tan, Kriselle Icamina, and Lara Javier. 2007. »Nurse Migration from a Source Country Perspective: Philippine Country Case Study.« *Health Services Research* 42 (3): 1406–18.
- Makulec, Agnieszka. 2014. »Philippine’s Bilateral Labour Arrangements on Health-Care Professional Migration: In Search of Meaning.« Asia Pacific Working Paper Series. Accessed June 24, 2015. http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-manila/documents/publication/wcms_320609.pdf.
- McDowell, Linda. 2009. *Working Bodies: Interactive Service Employment and Workplace Identities*. Hoboken: Wiley-Blackwell.
- McNeil-Walsch, Colleen. 2010. »Nurse Migration from South Africa and the Ethics Discourse.« In *The International Migration of Health Workers*, edited by Rebecca Shah, 189–202. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Nguyen, Minh T. N., Roberta Zavoretti, and Joan Tronto. 2017. »Beyond the Global Care Chain: Boundaries, Institutions and Ethics of Care.« *Ethics and Social Welfare* 11 (3): 199–212.
- OECD Observer. 2010. *International Migration of Health Workers: Improving International Cooperation to Address Global Health Workforce Crisis*. Policy Brief, February 2010.
- Ortiga, Yasmin Y. 2014. »Professional Problems: The Burden of Producing the »Globak Filipino Nurse.« *Social Science & Medicine* 115:64–71.
- Pezalla, Anne E., Jonathan Pettigrew, and Michelle Miller-Day. 2012. »Researching the Researcher-as-Instrument: An Exercise in Interviewer Self-Reflexivity.« *Qualitative Research* 12 (2): 165–85.
- POEA (Philippine Overseas Employment Administration). »POEA Overseas Employment Statistics, Deployed Overseas Filipino Workers 2014–2015.« Accessed October 7, 2017. <http://www.poea.gov.ph/ofwstat/compendium/2015.pdf>.
- »Revised POEA Rules and Regulations Governing the Recruitment and Employment of Land-based Overseas Filipino Workers of 2016.« Accessed February 22, 2016. <http://www.poea.gov.ph/laws&rules/files/Revised%20POEA%20Rules%20And%20Regulations.pdf>.

- »Triple Win Project Update.« Accessed September 16, 2017. <http://www.poea.gov.ph/twp/TWP.html>.
- Pring, Cecilia, and Irene Roco. 2012. »The Volunteer Phenomenon of Nurses in the Philippines.« *Asian Journal of Health* 2 (1): 95–110.
- Raatikainen, Ritva. 1997. »Nursing Care as a Calling.« *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 25 (6): 1111–15.
- Raghuram, Parvati. 2012. »Global Care, Local Configurations—Challenges to Conceptualizations of Care.« *Global Networks* 12 (2): 155–74.
- 2016. »Locating Care Ethics Beyond the Global North.« *ACME: An International Journal for Critical Geographies* 15 (3): 511–33.
- Raghuram, Parvati, Joanna Bornat, and Leroi Henry. 2011. »The Co-marking of Aged Bodies and Migrant Bodies: Migrant Workers' Contribution to Geriatric Medicine in the UK.« *Sociology of Health & Illness* 33 (2): 321–35.
- Recto, Ralph G. 2011. »Senate Bill No. 2988.« Introduced by Senator Ralph G. Recto. 15th Congress, Second Regular Session, October 10, 2011. Homepage of the Senate of the Philippines. <http://www.senate.gov.ph/lisdata/1225510339!.pdf>.
- Rodriguez, Robyn. 2002. »Migrant Heroes: Nationalism, Citizenship and the Politics of Filipino Migrant Labor.« *Citizenship Studies* 6 (3): 341–56.
- 2010. *Migrants for Export: How the Philippine State Brokers Labor to the World*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota.
- Scott, Mark L., Anna Whelan, John Dewdney, and Anthony B. Zwi. 2004. »Brain Drain or Ethical Recruitment?« *Medical Journal of Australia* 180 (4): 174–76.
- »Southeast Asia.« 2002. *Migration News* 9 (6). Accessed November 11, 2016. https://migration.ucdavis.edu/mn/more.php?id=2650_0_3_0.
- Tabuga, Aubrey D. 2007. »How Do Filipino Families Use the OFW Remittances?« Philippine Institute for Development Studies. Policy Notes 12. Accessed March 5, 2013. <http://dirp4.pids.gov.ph/ris/pn/pidspn0712.pdf>.
- Twigg, Julia, Carol Workowitz, Rachel Lara Cohen, and Sarah Nettleton. 2011a. »Conceptualising Body Work in Health and Social Care.« *Sociology of Health and Illness* 33 (2): 171–88.

Mosuela, »Warm heart and warm hands«

InterDisciplines 1 (2018)

—— eds. 2011b. *Body Work in Health and Social Care: Critical Themes, New Agendas*. Hoboken: Wiley-Blackwell.

Twigg, Julia. 2000a. »Carework as a Form of Bodywork.« *Ageing & Society* 20 (4): 389–411.

—— 2000b. *Bathing—the Body and Community Care*. London: Routledge.

van Tubergen, Frank. 2006. *Immigrant Integration: A Cross-national Study*. El Paso: LFB Scholarly.

Villegas, Bernardo. 2012. »Thanking OFWs.« Last updated April 10, 2012. <http://www.bernardovillegas.org/index.php?go=/Articles/158/>.

Williams, Allan M., and Vladimir Baláž. 2008. »International Return Mobility, Learning and Knowledge Transfer: A Case Study of Slovak Doctors.« *Social Science & Medicine* 67 (11): 1924–33.

Dr. des. Cleovi C. Mosuela, Bielefeld Graduate School in History and Sociology and Faculty of Sociology, Bielefeld University: cleovi.mosuela@uni-bielefeld.de.